



**THE REPUBLIC OF TURKIYE
NECMETTİN ERBAKAN UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF EDUCATIONAL SCIENCES**



The Department of Foreign Language Education
English Language Teaching Program

Master Thesis

**AN INVESTIGATION INTO POSTGRADUATE THESES ON ENGLISH
LANGUAGE TEACHERS' PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN TÜRKİYE
BETWEEN 2003 AND 2022: A QUALITATIVE STUDY**

Büşra TAN YİĞİT
ORCID: 0000-0002-3705-5975

Supervisor
Assoc. Prof. Cemile DOĞAN
ORCID: 0000-0002-5246-6692

Konya – 2024

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, I would like to express my deep gratitude to my supervisor Assoc. Prof. Cemile DOĞAN for her valuable suggestions, constructive guidance, and enthusiastic encouragement during the planning and development of this research. Her dedication and willingness to support and improve my study have been very much appreciated. Besides my supervisor, I would like to thank my thesis committee: Assist. Prof. Emine Eda ERCAN DEMİREL, Assist. Prof. Mustafa Serkan ÖZTÜRK, and Assist. Prof. Hüseyin ALTINDIŞ for the useful critique of the research.

Additionally, I owe special thanks to my dearest, precious, joyful, patient, supportive, exceptional, self-motivated, hardworking, fair, optimistic, kind, enthusiastic, curious, creative, trustworthy, resilient, courageous, admirable daughter Zeynep, my mother Remziye who taught me how to be a human, my dear husband Ramazan who provided valuable support during the process, my beloved friend Dr. Hayriye ULAŞ TARAF who will always remind me that Vefa is not only a neighborhood in Istanbul and made me feel considerable success with her presence in my life for more than 20 years with her exceptional inspiration, admirable personality and incomparable comfort and relief that she provides for everyone she values. I would like to thank my genuine friends Burcu and İsmigül with whom we turn minutes into hours, hours into minutes, share our bites, our common and unique strengths and weaknesses every day we see each other. Also, my special thanks go to my dear friends Hüma, Nazlı, Cem, Zeynep, Neslihan, Meryem, Sedef, Nadiye, Nihan, and Suna for having touched my life with their special souls. Thanks to my dear friend, colleague, and now director Ferda Yeşim KUTAY AKAALP for her distinctive supportiveness and to Aslı DERİN ANAÇ, not only as a director but also as a role model, who contributed to my development a lot both personally and professionally.

I need to thank myself, too. Thank you for never considering giving up, for sticking with it day after day regardless of the challenges, for the coffees and cheesecakes you treated yourself to and the breaks you allowed yourself, for trying to be "good enough" rather than perfect, (Hi, Alev Hocam!) for keeping your belief alive in creating a better version of yourself although you sometimes fail, for achieving and striving despite difficulties, for dreaming and taking steps to make those dreams come true.

Büşra TAN YİĞİT

Mayıs 2024

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iii
TEZ ÇALIŞMASI ORJİNALLİK RAPORU	vi
BİLİMSEL ETİK BEYANNAMESİ	vii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	viii
LIST OF TABLES	ix
ÖZET	xi
ABSTRACT	xii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. Statement of the Problem	1
1.2. Purpose of the Study.....	4
1.3. Significance of the Study	5
1.4. Assumptions	6
1.5. Limitations.....	6
1.6. Definitions of Terms	6
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.1. Why Teachers Need Professional Development	8
2.1.1. Professional Development Defined in the Context of Education.....	10
2.1.2. Comparisons Drawn between Teacher Training and Teacher Development....	12
2.2. An Evolutionary Overview of the Concept PD in ELT in Türkiye.....	15
2.3. Professional Development of Contemporary English Language Teachers.....	21
2.3.1. Features of Effective Professional Development	22
2.3.2. Challenges in teachers' effective professional development	27
2.4. Common Professional Development Activities in the field of English Language Teaching	29
2.5. Previous Studies	32
2.5.1. International studies	32
2.5.2. National studies	34
3. METHODOLOGY	44
3.1. Research Design	44
3.2. Sample of the Research	45
3.3. Data Collection Tools and Techniques	46
3.4. Data Collection Procedures	46

3.5. Data Analysis	47
4. FINDINGS	49
4.1. Distribution of Theses in terms of Degree	49
4.2. Distribution of Theses in terms of Universities.....	49
4.2.1. Distribution of master’s theses in terms of universities	49
4.2.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of universities	50
4.3. Distribution of Theses in terms of Institutes	51
4.3.1. Distribution of masters’ theses in terms of institutes	51
4.3.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of institutes	51
4.4. Distribution of Theses in terms of Years.....	52
4.4.1. Distribution of masters’ theses in terms of years	52
4.4.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of years	52
4.5. Distribution of Theses in terms of Language	53
4.5.1. Distribution of masters’ theses in terms of language	53
4.5.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of language	53
4.6. Distribution of Theses in terms of the Title of the Supervisors	54
4.6.1. Distribution of masters’ theses in terms of the title of the supervisors	54
4.6.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of the title of the supervisors	54
4.7. Distribution of Methodology in the Theses.....	55
4.7.1. Distribution of methodology in masters’ theses.....	55
4.7.2. Distribution of methodology in PhD dissertations.....	55
4.8. Distribution of Sampling Methods in the Theses.....	56
4.8.1. Distribution of sampling methods in masters’ theses.....	56
4.8.2. Distribution of sampling methods in PhD dissertations.....	57
4.9. Distribution of Sample Groups in the Theses	57
4.9.1. Distribution of sample groups in masters’ theses.....	57
4.9.2. Distribution of sample groups in PhD dissertations.....	58
4.10. Distribution of Sample Size in the Theses	59
4.10.1. Distribution of sample size in masters’ theses	59
4.10.2. Distribution of sample size in PhD dissertations.....	59
4.11. Distribution of Number of Data Sources in the Theses.....	60
4.11.1. Distribution of number of data sources in masters’ theses.....	60
4.11.2. Distribution of number of data sources in PhD dissertations.....	60
4.12. Distribution of Data Collection Tools	61
4.12.1. Distribution of data collection tools in masters’ theses.....	61
4.12.2. Distribution of data collection tools in PhD dissertations.....	61
4.13. Distribution of Data Analysis.....	62
4.13.1. Distribution of data analysis in masters’ theses	62
4.13.2. Distribution of data analysis in PhD dissertations.....	63
4.14. Distribution of Research Settings in the Theses.....	63
4.14.1. Distribution of research settings in masters’ theses	63

4.14.2. Distribution of research settings in PhD dissertations.....	64
4.15. Distribution of Research Setting Status in the Theses	65
4.15.1. Distribution of research setting status in masters' theses	65
4.15.2. Distribution of research setting status in PhD dissertations	65
4.16. Distribution of Subjects in the Theses.....	66
4.16.1. Distribution of subjects in masters' theses	66
4.16.2. Distribution of subjects in PhD dissertations	68
4.17. Distribution of Results in the Theses	69
4.17.1. Distribution of results in master's theses	69
4.17.2. Distribution of results in PhD dissertations.....	71
4.18. Distribution of Suggestions in the Theses	73
4.18.1. Distribution of suggestions in master's theses	73
4.18.2. Distribution of suggestions in PhD dissertations	75
5. DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS.....	78
5.1. Discussion	78
5.2. Conclusion.....	96
5.3. Suggestions and Further Implications	98
GENİŞLETİLMİŞ TÜRKÇE ÖZET	102
REFERENCES.....	112
APPENDIX	124

TEZ ÇALIŞMASI ORJİNALLİK RAPORU

AN INVESTIGATION INTO POSTGRADUATE THESES ON ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHERS' PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN TÜRKİYE BETWEEN 2003 AND 2022: A QUALITATIVE STUDY başlıklı tez çalışmamın toplam **115** sayfalık kısmına ilişkin, 13/06/2024 tarihinde tez danışmanım tarafından **Turnitin** adlı intihal tespit programından aşağıda belirtilen filtrelemeler uygulanarak alınmış olan orijinallik raporuna göre, tezimin benzerlik oranı **%10** olarak belirlenmiştir.

Uygulanan filtrelemeler:

1. Tez çalışması orijinallik raporu sayfası hariç
2. Bilimsel etik beyannamesi sayfası hariç
3. Önsöz hariç
4. İçindekiler hariç
5. Simgeler ve kısaltmalar hariç
6. Kaynaklar hariç
7. Alıntılar dahil
8. 7 kelimedenden daha az örtüşme içeren metin kısımları hariç

Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Tez Çalışması Orijinallik Raporu Uygulama Esaslarını inceledim ve tez çalışmamın, bu uygulama esaslarında belirtilen azami benzerlik oranının (%30) altında olduğunu ve intihal içermediğini; aksinin tespit edileceği muhtemel durumda doğabilecek her türlü hukuki sorumluluğu kabul ettiğimi ve yukarıda vermiş olduğum bilgilerin doğru olduğunu beyan ederim.

13/06/2024

Büşra TAN YİĞİT

Doç. Dr. Cemile DOĞAN

BİLİMSEL ETİK BEYANNAMESİ

Bu tezin tamamının kendi çalışmam olduğunu, planlanmasından yazımına kadar tüm aşamalarında bilimsel etiğe ve akademik kurallara özenle riayet edildiğini, tez içindeki bütün bilgilerin etik davranış ve akademik kurallar çerçevesinde elde edilerek sunulduğunu, ayrıca tez hazırlama kurallarına uygun olarak hazırlanan bu çalışmada başkalarının eserlerinden yararlanılması durumunda bilimsel kurallara uygun olarak atıf yapıldığını ve bu kaynakların kaynaklar listesine eklendiğini beyan ederim.

13/06/2024

Büşra TAN YİĞİT

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

EFL	: English as a Foreign Language
MoNE	: Ministry of National Education
PD:	: Professional Development
ELT	: English Language Teaching
CPD	: Continuing Professional Development
INSET	: In-Service Education and Training
PDU	: Professional Development Unit
NLP	: Neuro Linguistic Programming

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Distribution of Theses in terms of Degree.....	49
Table 2.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of Universities.....	49
Table 2.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Universities.....	50
Table 3.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of Institutes.....	51
Table 3.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Institutes.....	51
Table 4.1. Distribution of Master’s heses in terms of Years	52
Table 4.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Years	52
Table 5.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of Language	53
Table 5.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Language.....	53
Table 6.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of the Title of the Supervisors...	54
Table 6.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Title of the Supervisors.....	54
Table 7.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of Research Types.....	55
Table 7.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Research Types.....	55
Table 8.1. Distribution of Sampling Methods in Master’s Theses	56
Table 8.2. Distribution of Sampling Methods in PhD Dissertations	57
Table 9.1. Distribution of Sample Groups in Master’s Theses.....	57
Table 9.2. Distribution of Sample Groups in PhD Dissertations.....	58
Table 10.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of Sample Size	59
Table 10.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Sample Size	59
Table 11.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of the Number of Data Sources	60
Table 11.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of the Number of Data Sources	60
Table 12.1. Distribution of Data Collection Tools in Master’s Theses	61
Table 12.2. Distribution of Data Collection Tools in PhD dissertations	61
Table 13.1. Distribution of Data Analysis in Master’s Theses	62
Table 13.2. Distribution of Data Analysis in PhD Dissertations	63
Table 14.1. Distribution of Research Settings in Master’s Theses.....	63
Table 14.2. Distribution of Research Settings in PhD Dissertations	64
Table 15.1. Distribution of Research Setting Status in Master’s Theses.....	65
Table 15.2. Distribution of Research Setting Status in PhD Dissertations.....	65
Table 16.1. Distribution of Subjects in Master’s Theses.....	66

Table 16.2. Distribution of Subjects in PhD Dissertations	68
Table 17.1. Distribution of Results in Master’s Theses.....	69
Table 17.2. Distribution of Results in PhD Dissertations.....	71
Table 18.1. Distribution of Suggestions in Master’s Theses	73
Table 18.2. Distribution of Suggestions in PhD Dissertations	75



ÖZET

Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü
Yabancı Diller Eğitimi Anabilim Dalı
İngiliz Dili Eğitimi Bilim Dalı
Yüksek Lisans Tezi

2003-2022 YILLARI ARASINDA TÜRKİYE'DE İNGİLİZ DİLİ ÖĞRETMENLERİNİN MESLEKİ GELİŞİMİ ÜZERİNE YAZILMIŞ LİSANSÜSTÜ TEZLERİN İNCELENMESİ: NİTEL BİR ÇALIŞMA

Büşra TAN YİĞİT

Bu çalışmada Türkiye’de İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi üzerine yapılmış lisansüstü tezler incelenmiştir. Bu çalışmayla, konuyla ilgili yapılan tezlerdeki eğilimlerin durumunu ortaya koymak amaçlanmıştır. Ayrıca çalışmanın araştırmacılara, literatüre ve eğitimcilere katkı sağlayacağı düşünülmüştür. Araştırma kapsamına alınan tezler lisansüstü düzeyleri, üniversite, enstitü, yıl, dil, danışman unvanı, araştırma türü, örneklem metodu, örneklem grubu, örneklem büyüklüğü, kullandıkları veri kaynağı sayısı, veri toplama araçları, veri analizi, araştırma evreni, araştırma evreninin durumu, konu, sonuç ve öneri açılarından incelenmiştir. Araştırmada nitel araştırma modellerinden olan doküman incelemesi modeli kullanılmıştır. Araştırma için kullanılacak tezler YÖKTEZ üzerinden tarama yapılarak elde edilmiştir. Yapılan tarama sonucunda 103 adet lisansüstü teze ulaşılmıştır. Bu tezlerden 11 tanesi erişime açık olmadığı için araştırmaya dâhil edilmemiştir. İncelenen 92 tezden 56 tanesinin yüksek lisans, 36 tanesinin doktora tezi olduğu görülmüştür. Elde edilen veriler betimsel analiz ve içerik analizine tabi tutularak tema ve kategorilerine ayrılıp, frekans ve yüzde hesaplamaları yapılarak tablolara aktarılmıştır. Araştırma sonuçlarına göre tezlerin en çok 2019 yılında yapıldığı, doktora tez sayısının daha az olduğu, çalışmalarda kullanılan dilin çoğunlukla İngilizce olduğu gözlemlenmiştir. Tezlerin en çok Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi’nde yapıldığı, enstitü olarak Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü’nün öne çıktığı sonucuna ulaşılmıştır. Bunun dışında araştırmaların en çok doktor öğretim üyeleri tarafından yürütüldüğü, araştırma modeli olarak en çok nitel yöntemin tercih edildiği, örneklem metodu olarak amaçlı ve kolay ulaşılabılır örneklem yönteminin kullanıldığı, örneklem grubu olarak çoğunlukla İngilizce öğretmenlerinin seçildiği, yönetici, eğitmen ve öğrencilerin geri planda kaldığı, örneklem grubu büyüklüğünün çoğunlukla 101-300 arasında olduğu, araştırmacıların genellikle üç veya daha fazla veri kaynağı kullanmayı tercih ettiği, görüşme ve anketin en çok faydalanılan veri toplama araçları olduğu, veri analiz yöntemi olarak en çok nitel yönteminin kullanıldığı, araştırma ortamı olarak çoğunlukla üniversitelerin seçildiği ve araştırmaların yürütüldüğü okulların “devlet okulu” kategorisinde olduğu ortaya çıkmıştır. Ayrıca araştırma konusu olarak en çok çeşitli mesleki gelişim araçlarının incelendiği görülmüştür. İncelenen tezlerin sonuçlarına bakıldığında en sık karşılaşılan sonuçların araştırmada konu edilen mesleki gelişim yönteminin öğretmenlerin mesleki gelişimine olumlu etkisinin olduğu, sınıf içi uygulamalara olumlu şekilde yansıtıldığı ve başta öğretmenler olmak üzere paydaşların farkındalığını artırdığı sonuçları olduğu görülmüştür. Elde edilen diğer sonuçlar arasında ise gelişim aracının etkili bulunduğu, öğretmenler arasındaki iletişimi artırdığı, motivasyonu yükselttiği, mesleki gelişime dair olumlu tutum oluşturduğu, işbirliği içeren aktivitelerde artışı beraberinde getirdiği ve öğretmenlerin belirli ihtiyaçlarını karşıladığı yönünde çok sayıda sonuç çıkmıştır. İncelenen tezlerde en çok yapılan öneri ise “öğretmenler mesleki gelişim aktivitelerine katılmaları konusunda teşvik edilmelidir” şeklinde olmuştur. Diğer sık görülen öneriler arasında ise öğretmenlerin ihtiyaçlarına uygun mesleki gelişim aktivitelerinin planlanması, işbirlikçi ve yansıtıcı aktivitelerin artırılması, öğretmenler arası işbirliğinin desteklenmesi, konuya ilişkin daha fazla akademik araştırmanın yürütülmesi bulunmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Mesleki Gelişim, İngilizce Öğretmenleri, Hizmetiçi eğitim, Lisansüstü Tezler, Betimsel Analiz, İçerik Analizi

ABSTRACT

Necmettin Erbakan University, Graduate School of Educational Sciences
Department of Foreign Language Education
English Language Education Program
Master Thesis

AN INVESTIGATION INTO POSTGRADUATE THESES ON ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHERS' PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN TÜRKİYE BETWEEN 2003 AND 2022: A QUALITATIVE STUDY

Büşra TAN YİĞİT

This study aimed to investigate postgraduate theses conducted on the professional development of English teachers in Türkiye to reveal the tendencies in the theses related to the topic. Additionally, it was intended that the study would contribute to current researchers, literature, educational institutions, and educators. The theses included in the scope of the research were examined in terms of their postgraduate levels, university, institute, year, language, supervisor title, research type, sampling method, sample group, sample size, number of data sources used, data collection tools, data analysis, research settings, research setting status, subjects, results, and suggestions. The document analysis model, which is one of the qualitative research models, was utilized. Theses to be investigated were obtained from the Turkish Council of Higher Education National Thesis Center. As a result, 103 postgraduate theses were found. 11 of these theses were not accessible, therefore they were not included in the research. It was observed that out of the 92 theses examined, 56 of them were master's theses and 36 were doctoral dissertations. The obtained data were subjected to descriptive analysis and content analysis, divided into themes and categories, and presented in tables by calculating frequencies and percentages. According to the research results, it was observed that the theses were mostly conducted in 2019, the number of doctoral theses was lower, and English was predominantly used language in the studies. It was concluded that the theses were mostly conducted in Middle East Technical University, and the Institute of Social Sciences was in first place. In addition, it was found that the research was mostly supervised by Assistant Professors, qualitative method was mostly preferred as the research model, purposive and convenience sampling methods were used as the sampling methods, English teachers working at different levels of institutions including K-12 and higher education were mostly selected as the sample group, administrators, teacher trainers, and students were not included in the research frequently, the sample group size was mostly between 101-300, researchers generally preferred to use three or more data sources, interviews and surveys were the most utilized data collection tools, qualitative data analysis methods were predominantly used as the data analysis method, universities were mostly selected as the research environment, and the majority of schools where the research was conducted was "public" schools. Additionally, it was observed that various professional development activities were frequently examined as the research topic. When the results of the theses were analyzed, it was revealed that the most common results were that the professional development method addressed in the research had a positive effect on teachers' professional development, reflected positively on classroom practices, and increased awareness among stakeholders, especially teachers. Following these results, many results emerged indicating that the method was found to be effective, increased communication among teachers, raised motivation, fostered positive attitudes towards professional development, resulted in an increase in collaborative activities, and met specific needs of teachers. The most common recommendation made in the theses was that "teachers should be encouraged to participate in professional development activities". Among other frequent recommendations were the planning of professional development activities tailored to teachers' needs, increasing collaborative and reflective activities, supporting collaboration among teachers, and conducting more academic research on the subject.

Keywords: Professional Development, EFL Teachers, In-service Training, Postgraduate Theses, Descriptive Analysis, Content Analysis.

CHAPTER 1

1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter provides brief information about the statement of the problem, the purpose of the study, assumptions, and limitations. Finally, the definitions of some important key terms that are mentioned in the study are provided.

1.1. Statement of the Problem

Education refers to the acquisition of information and the improvement of behaviors necessary for individuals to lead their life. The primary goal of education is accomplished by means of the guidance and instruction that teachers provide (Özdemir et al., 2019). The quality of education depends on various factors both in countries and institutions. At the institutional level, a key objective of educational programs is student success, which is significantly influenced by the contributions of teachers in fostering student development. According to Day (1999) and Ozdemir (2013), teachers have a significant impact on students' academic performance. Therefore, having teachers who look for ways to develop professionally has always been an advantage to learners. For teachers, it is essential to possess both expertise in their subject area and the ability to effectively convey knowledge and values to their students. To maintain and improve teacher competency, student achievement, and school progress, teacher professional development (PD) becomes increasingly important. In order to ensure the PD of in-service teachers in terms of their background knowledge, teaching skills and educational approaches, both individual and institutional training are necessary (Yurtseven et al., 2021). Institutions or countries that do not give enough importance to their teachers' PD are likely to face some challenges throughout the way or they may not contribute to their students or to their reputation as much as they expect. Similarly, Smylie (2001) emphasizes that "the attempts to improve schools and student learning will not get very far if people do not take seriously the requirement for teacher professional development" (p.7). This indicates that student accomplishment levels are higher when teachers have more professional knowledge. According to this viewpoint, teachers must "keep up with change, examine and renew their own knowledge, skills, and visions for successful teaching" (Day, 1999, p. 2). Likewise, as teaching profession is dynamic in nature, and both the content and the way teachers may deliver it are open to change, what teachers learn in their pre-service education is not always sufficient. Instead, they often benefit from updating their teaching techniques (Richards & Farrell, 2005). According to Sadeghi and Richards (2021), the PD of language instructors is crucial for staying

up-to-date and avoiding burnout in the field. Therefore, all teachers, regardless of how long they have been in the profession or how much experience they have, should participate in PD activities to be able to teach their students more effectively.

PD is a requirement for English language teachers. In a world where almost all types of information is easily reached, internationalization cannot be avoided. With the help of the internet and social media which enable accessing information in seconds, more and more people can satisfy their needs and take part in the production of new sources of information every day. In this era of globalization and rapid changes, English is used worldwide as the common language of technology by people from different backgrounds. Hence, the term ‘English as a lingua franca’(ELF) has emerged as a way of referring to communication in English between speakers with different first languages (Seidlhofer, 2005). Recently, the linguistic and cultural domination of English as a global language has received a great deal of attention, and the process of globalization resulted in greater contacts between people of different cultures (Kumaravadivelu, 2012). As Crystal notes (2018), nearly 1,400 million people use English either their first, second or foreign language and this makes English an extensively used language as the number refers to a quarter of the world’s population. Therefore, the importance of learning English as the lingua franca in this global world is indeed increasing (Doğançay-Aktuna & Kızıltepe, 2005). This creates a need for English Language teachers to develop professionally to be able to contribute more not only to their students but also to the profession, to their institutions, and even to their job satisfaction. Proficiency in teaching is a crucial quality for language teachers, as they have a significant role in satisfying the needs of English learners. Therefore, it is essential for teachers to prioritize their professional growth and show willingness and responsibility for their development as professionals (Babanoğlu & Yardımcı, 2017).

There have been many studies on PD in English Language Teaching (ELT) all around the world including Türkiye. The focus of those studies focus vary in terms of level and institutions. Additionally, some researchers seek suggestions for specific needs and problems at different times because, like many other fields, ELT underwent an evolutionary process that required constant adaptation over the years. Technology, the shifts in generations’ needs, the integration of 21st-century skills into language education, and changes that the Covid-19 pandemic brought can be stated as some of the factors that affected English language teachers’ needs, preferences and attitudes related to PD. Therefore, the statement of the problem in this

study emerged based on the circumstances mentioned. An investigation into researchers' interest in the field, methods utilized, sampling methods, sample sizes in the studies, data collection tools, data analysis process in the studies, level of institution at which the studies were conducted, research contexts, subjects that researchers focused, results revealed and suggestions provided so far may give valuable insight to the educational institutions, authorities, policy makers, researchers, teacher educators, trainers and teachers. The year 2003 was selected as the beginning year since the first accessible postgraduate study on the thesis topic in Türkiye was conducted that year, and the year 2022 was identified as the year when the last postgraduate study on the topic was completed by the time this research was started. In this respect, the purpose of this current study is to reveal research tendencies by examining postgraduate theses published between 2003 and 2022 that are open to access on the The Council of Higher Education (CoHE) National Thesis Center in the field of PD of English language teachers in Türkiye. Therefore, the current study addresses this gap by investigating the following research questions:

1. What is the distribution of degrees in these studies?
2. What is the distribution in terms of universities?
3. What is the distribution in terms of institutes?
4. What is the distribution in terms of years?
5. What is the distribution in terms of language?
6. What is the distribution in terms of the title of the supervisor?
7. What is the distribution of methodology?
8. What is the distribution of sampling methods?
9. What is the distribution of sample groups?
10. What is the distribution of sample size?
11. What is the distribution of the number of the data sources?
12. What is the distribution of data collection tools?

13. What is the distribution of data analysis?
14. What is the distribution of research settings?
15. What is the distribution of research setting status?
16. What is the distribution of subjects?
17. What is the distribution of results?
18. What is the distribution of suggestions?

1.2. Purpose of the Study

Providing an effective language instruction depends on many factors varying from teaching methods to materials utilized. As teachers are responsible for creating a positive change in their contexts, it is significant for them to be able to be aware of their students' needs and meet them. To achieve this, it is essential that teachers are provided with opportunities by both the government and educational institutions, enabling them to engage in personal and professional development. However, although English teachers at different levels in Türkiye are provided with a variety of PD programs and training options, it is not possible to say these opportunities fully help them be more competent and effective in the profession. In other words, their needs and expectations still need to be met. Moreover, as the world is constantly changing, it can be stated that this endeavour is a never-ending process. According to Darling-Hammond et al. (2017), PD can be helpful for educators in improving their methods, which in turn allows them to better meet the constantly changing needs of their students. That is to say, coming to an end in PD can not be achieved due to the continuously evolving nature of the needs and expectations in the profession. Comprehending the factors that hold importance for teachers significantly contributes to their professional growth (Smith, 2017). For this reason, there are many studies conducted both in Türkiye and abroad addressing PD of English teachers. The main aim of this study is to investigate research tendencies in the field of PD of English teachers in Türkiye by examining relevant postgraduate theses published between 2003 and 2022 that are open to access on the CoHE National Thesis Center. It aims to shed light on the state of research conducted in the specified period in terms of their distribution of degree, universities, institutes, years, languages, supervisors, research types, sampling methods, sample groups, sample sizes, number of the sources of data, data collection tools, data analysis types, research settings, research setting status as well as their subjects, results and suggestions.

1.3. Significance of the Study

There are some postgraduate theses written in Türkiye analyzing previous research in the field. Öcel (2022) conducted a study that compares postgraduate theses in ELT between 2019 and 2021 with a methodological point of view. The study included 934 theses and the results have significant implications for further studies. Another study by Demir (2020) made a detailed analysis of postgraduate theses on foreign language teaching in Türkiye between 1987 and 2017. However, this doctoral dissertation involved studies of other languages as well as ELT. However, a similar comprehensive research regarding studies conducted in ELT specifically on PD does not exist.

On the other hand, there are some articles published by Turkish researches in Türkiye on the PD of teachers. Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) examined 60 theses about PD of teachers both from Türkiye and abroad between years 2005 and 2015. However, these theses did not specifically address English teachers. Content analysis was utilized to reveal the results. The findings of the research indicated that the number of doctoral dissertations was higher than the number of master's theses. Also, most research was conducted in 2014 and qualitative research design was the most commonly utilized method in the studies. In another study by Taşdemir and Karaman (2022), 35 articles which specifically focused on the PD of in-service English teachers between 2006 and 2020 were analyzed. They also included research conducted abroad into their study. This meta-synthesis identified several recurring themes in the articles, including shifts in beliefs and practices from a structuralist to a communicative approach, the use of online platforms for PD, collaborative PD through research, coaching, and study abroad, the connection between identity and PD, and the implications to design effective PD programs.

The need for PD may stem from the difficulties that teachers experience while during their classroom instruction together with constant technological changes. English language teachers working at various institutions may face challenges due to recent technological advancements, the incorporation of 21st-century skills in education, evolving generations and the need to adapt to their changing expectations, the shift towards remote education caused by the Covid-19 pandemic, and the emergence of new approaches to teaching. For this reason, the role of PD for the betterment of language education cannot be denied. To take further action in the field, it is necessary to determine what has been done so far, and which points need more attention. This study will provide a detailed analysis of the postgraduate research conducted previously in Türkiye between the years 2003 and 2022. The researcher set out to reveal

important details related to how the PD of English teachers has been seen and studied through these years.

Although many studies have been conducted by researchers in the field of English Language Teachers' PD, it is unlikely to see a study that reveals research tendencies on the subject. In that respect, this study is also of great importance as it provides researchers a review in terms of research trends while searching the literature. The findings of this study may yield implications for decision-makers, teacher trainers, and institutions as it may be informative about the development of PD in ELT in Türkiye across the years. Additionally, the data revealed at the end of this study may be significant as it may fill a gap giving useful details about previous studies and revealing research tendencies and focus in the field. Finally, it may also give insight to other researchers for further research.

1.4. Assumptions

It is assumed that all relevant theses on the CoHE National Thesis Center database have been accessed and the data obtained through analysis have been recorded as they are without any missing or wrong information.

1.5. Limitations

The limitations for the current study are as follows:

1. This study is limited to the theses that were catalogued in the CoHE National Thesis Center between 2003 and 2022. Theses that are open to access are included in the research.
3. Theses that have focused on pre-service teacher education are excluded from the research.
4. Keywords used to search for the theses are limited to “Professional Development”, “ELT” “EFL”, “English”, “In-service Training”, “Teacher Development”, “Inset”, “Teacher Training”, “Training Activities”, “Mentoring”, “ Observation”, “Reflection”, “Self-development”, “In-service Teacher Education”, and “Development activities”.

1.6. Definitions of Terms

Professional Development: Professional development stands for professional development. It can be defined as “natural learning experiences and those conscious and

planned activities which are intended to be of direct or indirect benefit to the individual, group or school and which contribute through these, to the quality of education in classroom'' (Day, 1999, p. 4).

Professional Development Activities: Activities such as video lessons, peer observations, mentoring, article club, workshops, training program, seminars, and conferences that aim to support the improvement of teachers professionally.

Teachers' Professional Development: The set of tools, resources, and training sessions for educators to improve their teaching quality and effectiveness. These resources allow instructors to further their knowledge in their subject area and allow for mentorship and the opportunity to learn new teaching techniques. Those who take part in workshops or leadership sessions develop and enhance specialized skills including technical, quantitative, and analytical skills.

In-service Teacher Training: Teacher training is a form of professional development for teachers. The term generally refers to the courses and practical procedures that teachers attend in the course of their employment. It is also used to describe courses that are designed for short-term or immediate purposes. Teacher training activities do not only aim at novice teachers, who are at the beginning of their careers but also experienced teachers who want to refresh their professional knowledge base and improve their teaching practices, as it is used in the current study.

English as a Foreign Language: It refers to the teaching or learning of English in a non-English-speaking country which means English is not a native or second language, but rather a foreign language.

EFL Teacher: The term relates to English language teachers who work in non-English-speaking countries where English is a foreign language, such as Türkiye.

CHAPTER 2

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter introduces relevant literature in the field to provide a comprehensive understanding of the study. To begin with, it mainly contains information about professional development in the context of teaching and English language education in Türkiye since “professional development” (PD) and “English language teaching” are two fundamental concepts that structure the basis of this research. Next, factors determining the quality and effectiveness of a PD activity are discussed. In addition, common PD activities for English language teachers are presented. Finally, as this study has a qualitative research design that employs content analysis to investigate previous research in the field, namely, articles, theses, and dissertations in the field of education, particularly, English Language Teaching will be introduced as examples.

2.1. Why Teachers Need Professional Development

Education has a dynamic nature that changes society and is in turn shaped by the requirements of that society. Teachers will always have to adapt to new situations because of their societies’ and institutions’ needs as they are among the most significant actors in the teaching process. During their careers, teachers must adapt to these changes affecting their needs related to technology, curriculum, learning a second language, practical skills, and theoretical and pedagogical knowledge. In addition, societies recognize that educators facilitate this process of change; nevertheless, they are also required to develop to develop themselves continuously. In other words, teachers are expected to improve professionally as a result of their roles as change agents and variables, which makes the field of teacher PD challenging and growing (Villegas-Reimers, 2003). Additionally, cultural and social changes, as well as the environment, shape the job of a teacher and affect teacher responsibilities across different cultures, communities, and geographic environments, which necessitates taking part in PD activities for teachers (Danijela, 2018). According to Borg, PD is an essential component of teacher competency and has the potential to have a variety of effects on students, organizations, and systems (2018). Similarly, Kennedy (2016) emphasizes the importance of PD stating it has strong effects on improvements in teaching. Yet, there isn't much agreement on how PD functions, including what takes place in PD, how it promotes teacher development, and how it is supposed to change the way teachers teach. There is a wide range of variation in both the form and content of PD programs.

Teacher PD includes a range of definitions and focus as described by researchers. However, it basically aims to enhance teachers' instructional skills and ultimately improve student outcomes. For this reason, teachers have a responsibility to improve themselves on the latest developments, requirements, to meet the demands of their students. In recent decades, technological advancements have been among the most significant developments. Prensky (2001) defines "digital natives" as the generation born during a time of fast technological advancement, characterized by technologies such as the Internet and computers. Children are commonly referred to be digital natives, whereas the majority of teachers are classified as digital immigrants (Prensky, 2001). The knowledge and abilities of educators in the application of technology are critical to the achievement of success in determining appropriate technologies and in effectively implementing them (Barba-Sanchez et al., 2022). Therefore, they must acquire the necessary knowledge to incorporate innovations in technology into their instructional activities. According to Spiteri and Rundgren (2018), it is essential that the advantages of digital technology in day-to-day teaching practices be realized, and educators should be skilled in the utilization of these tools in an effectively proficient manner. The idea of digital competence is an essential component of PD because it is a requirement for teachers to have in order to provide education in today's world, which is increasingly globalized. Better learning opportunities could be provided for the students if they are utilized effectively, particularly in situations where the students come from a variety of backgrounds and have a wide range of educational requirements. Understanding this concept of digital competence could provide a more holistic and humane approach to addressing the role that teachers play when teaching and learning with constantly changing technology (Spiteri and Rundgren, 2018). Furthermore, the research conducted on the use of technology has demonstrated that teachers' own values and beliefs regarding technology are at least as important to their practice as their ability to integrate technology. This might be because teachers continually encounter obstacles while integrating technology into their classrooms (Bowman et al., 2022). The new generation is able to learn more easily and more effectively through the use of technology. For teachers to be able to teach better, they need to catch up with the students' technological literacy competency. There are several PD programs that have been demonstrated to be beneficial in enhancing the manner in which instructors use technology in the classroom. According to Liu et al. (2015) and Xie et al. (2017), when teachers engage in effective PD, their skills and abilities are more likely to get better. That is, to be able to adjust their teaching to the requirements of the younger generation, teachers need to be informed of the latest trends among those who are younger. They cannot be educated using curriculums that were developed many years ago since

we, as educators, are responsible for preparing them for the future. The system has to be modified so that it better suits the demands of the students. To accomplish this, PD plays an essential role. In this respect, we need to determine what PD is according to the research that has been done.

2.1.1. Professional Development Defined in the Context of Education

PD as a term is defined by many scholars in a variety of ways. Day (1999) states that PD for educators ought to be taken into consideration within a wide variety of subject areas and forms as it consists of all natural learning experiences, which describes PD from a comprehensive perspective. PD should enhance the content knowledge of teachers on new methods and techniques. He emphasizes the importance of teaching skills including classroom management, collaboration, and communication as well as the teaching content. According to Fullan and Stiegelbauer (1991, p.326), PD can be defined as "the sum of total formal and informal learning experiences throughout one's career from pre-service education to retirement". In a definition by Villegas-Reimers (2003), it means "the development of a person in his or her professional role" (p.11). Guskey (2000, p.16) considers teacher PD as both activities and a process and states that it is "process and activities designed to enhance the professional knowledge, skills, and attitudes of educators so that they might, in return, improve the learning of students. According to Glatthorn (1995, p.41), it refers to "the professional growth a teacher achieved as a result of gaining increased experience and examining his or her teaching systematically". Similarly, Richards and Farrell (2005) indicate general growth is in the center, not specifically professional growth. This means PD of a teacher is a process that focuses on achieving long-term objectives and tries to enhance instructors' comprehension of teaching and their professional identity.

Based on the definition provided by Darling-Hammond et al. (2017), it is defined as structured professional learning that results in changes in teacher practices and improvements in student learning outcomes. According to Avalos (2011), PD entails becoming proficient in the skills necessary for learning and acquiring the competencies necessary to establish a connection between knowledge and its application in order to enhance the academic performance of students. The term PD is defined by Borg (2018) as activities that result in a positive change in an individual's performance. He also mentions that there is a wide variety of PD activities, which range from formal to informal attempts such as attending mandatory PD sessions organized by the administration or the voluntary practice of learning through reading

from a variety of publications. Another definition by Stone (2014) explains PD as attempts to be productive that are either planned or unplanned, formal or informal, and that allow for development through the efforts of the teacher themselves. Providing a similar definition, UNESCO (2016) described teacher PD as the education that teachers receive during their professional lives in order to enhance their knowledge, skills, and attitudes in a variety of fields. The so-called education covers both formal and informal professional learning activities. Richit and Tomkelski (2020) argue that PD for teachers ought to be regarded as an ongoing and constantly evolving phenomenon. This progress consists of the teacher's personal and professional growth, which extends beyond the level of the individual to the level of those around them. As it can be understood from the definitions, PD usually refers to the continuous learning process that occurs during a teacher's career. By actively taking part in relevant and meaningful PD activities, it is possible for teachers to engage in the exploration of effective and innovative approaches that can meet the changing needs of their students. Moreover, they will be able to follow new requirements in the profession, and as a result, adjust their teaching strategies in accordance with these advancements.

Additionally, PD plays a crucial role in improving the quality of educational institutions (Tamiş and Dikilitaş, 2018). It enables teachers to update their skills and broaden their knowledge and experience successfully. Hence, this can have a positive impact on their teaching practices and an improvement in the education quality. It is also underlined that for PD to be proven efficient, it is supposed to create a change in the classroom environment (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017). It could be interpreted that the activity made no contribution to institutions or teachers if it fails to produce positive effects in classrooms. Namely, teachers should be able to meet the ever-evolving needs of students in the current era (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017; DiPaola & Wagner, 2018). As a result, professional development has been regarded as critical in the educational context for over three decades.

PD is an absolute necessity, particularly in this age of rapid change when individuals constantly integrate new technologies, methods, and approaches into their personal and professional lives (Yaşar, 2019). Without taking part in developmental activities, it is difficult for teachers to keep up with these changes. Furthermore, research conducted on the teacher PD reveals that participating in development programs enhances teachers' dedication to the teaching and learning processes and serves as a source of motivation (Hunzicker, 2010; Makerevics & Ilisko, 2019). Similarly, Ilgan (2017) emphasizes the contribution of PD to

teaching and states that developed nations invest in PD to raise national standards. Teachers are obligated to follow the most recent developments in the field of education due to global transformations.

2.1.2. Comparisons Drawn between Teacher Training and Teacher Development

Although 'training' and 'development' include the concept of PD, several academics in the literature have proposed various definitions of these terms. Although both phrases have the goal of improving teaching, they possess certain differences. Freeman (1989) is among the researchers who differentiated between training and development. The distinctions identified by Freeman are evident across various components, including time, subject matter, and decision-makers. He asserts that within a specific time frame, particular objectives or methods are actively pursued. During training, decisions are made by the trainer on behalf of the teachers. Different from training, the goal of development is to assist teachers in reflecting upon their experiences, which will eventually lead to learning. Therefore, it would be true to emphasize that while training is a top-down process in which learning is expected to come from the input given, development can be described as a bottom-up process that contributes to learning from experiences.

According to Widdowson (1990), teacher training is defined as "the formal process of preparation towards the achievement of a range of outcomes which are specified in advance" (p. 62). When regarded in this perspective, the term "teacher training" can refer to either the process by which pre-service teachers acquire fundamental ideas and principles in order to begin their teaching experience or the process by which in-service teachers are prepared for new responsibilities or advancements in their profession. Training, as defined by Richards and Farrell (2005), is a term that is used to describe activities that are directly focused on the responsibilities that teachers are currently responsible for. In contrast to development, training attempts to accomplish short-term and specific objectives. An induction training for a first teaching position or preparation for taking on a new teaching responsibility are both examples of what this type of training can refer to. The term "teacher training" can also refer to the practices that teachers engage in to experiment with new teaching methods in the classroom, typically under supervision and receiving feedback. Standard training formats are typically used to deliver the content of teacher training practices, which are frequently determined by subject matter experts.

While both training and development have the goal of improving education, training is obligatory whereas development is optional and self-driven. Since the demands of the instructors are always changing, Fullan and Stiegelbauer (1991) support the same idea as Freeman (1989) that PD is a continuous process. On the other hand, trainings are usually one-time events and they are not systematic. Also, they lack a follow-up process. Due to the absence of follow-up activities and opportunities for instructors to observe and receive feedback from their peers or trainers, traditional trainings are incapable of producing long-lasting results for teachers (Bayram and Bıkmaz, 2021). Teachers are left alone without support or guidance upon the input given in sessions, and their learning and experiences are not followed effectively although they are expected to apply what they have learned in a short time. According to Richards and Farrell (2005), teacher training emphasizes immediate and particular outcomes, whereas PD attempts to foster overall and sustainable growth in teachers, enabling them to establish a strong professional identity. This refers to a process which also necessitates the integration of critical analysis, reflection, collaboration among teachers and communicative activities. In developmental aspect, teachers are encouraged to constantly assess their own learning progress through critical analysis and reflection on their own practices (Vangrieken et al., 2017; Macias, 2017). Mackenzie (2018) also highlights the significance of reflection in effective teacher PD. Similarly, Doğan's (2016) research on teachers' continuous PD revealed that active engagement in the development activity, dialogue, reflection and focusing on their specific contextual needs led to a positive change in teachers' attitude towards PD. In contrast, trainings are top-down, and a top-down approach can cause loss of motivation in teachers (Wyatt, 2016). This can be considered as a hindrance to further improvement for teachers. A bottom-up approach, which PD is characterized with, is more likely to align with teachers' needs and interests and to result in teacher empowerment (Wyatt, 2016). Also, according to Kaiser (2020) bottom-up processes are more effective than top-down processes because they allow more participation and foster teacher autonomy providing them with the right to choose. This personalization opportunity lacks in training. Therefore, teachers may not feel control over their development. Consequently, they become less reluctant to engage in further PD activities, especially when they are not guided properly. Several negative impacts can be observed due to the reluctance in continuing PD activities such as negative feelings, lack of productivity and poor performance, which are directly associated with teacher burnout (Ercan-Demirel and Cephe, 2015) To summarize, it can be stated that training and development differ from each other not only in terms of their effects, but also in terms of the way they are conducted.

One more difference that can be identified between development and training stems from the personalization factor. Teacher development focuses on the teachers themselves, as it is centered on the trainee, but not the trainer (Freeman, 1989). Unlike PD, training relies on the guidance of the trainer, and the specific requirements of the program, as determined by the curriculum and planning (Wallace, 1991). In this respect, it can be said that in training activities, the specific needs and preferences of the teachers are neglected. Furthermore, trainings were frequently perceived as a waste of time by educators due to the trainings' general lack of relevance to the specific contexts in which they implemented their teaching practices (Borg, 2015). This has a negative impact of teachers' further development. Moreover, the participants are not given decision-making authority over the course as it is conducted by the trainers. Consequently, the trainees lack control over the process. However, because trainees have autonomy in their progress, development in PD programs is less predictable and controlled compared to training. The stages of PD programs may also be revised and changed as the program continues (Ekşi, 2010). Therefore, teachers play a passive role during training, according to Ur (1997) and Ekşi (2010). However, Borg (2015) suggests that teachers cannot be regarded as only the receivers of the knowledge, but they should be involved in the process actively as knowledge generators. In other words, their needs, interests, and preferences must be consulted and taken into consideration in PD planning, they must be provided with opportunities to share their knowledge and experiences with their colleagues in a supportive and collaborative environment, and they need to be included in feedback and evaluation processes. As a result, being active in the process also enables them to prioritize their needs and their students' needs while deciding what to do, when to do, and how to do these.

Although the terms training and development are often used interchangeably, they have distinct features and may lead to different outcomes when they are actively applied in order to foster the professional growth of teachers. The shift in the PD of teachers has resulted in a transition from in-service training focused on practical skills to a focus on the broader concepts of PD and professional learning (Lieberman, 1996). Professional learning for teachers can be beneficial, but its effectiveness is determined by its intended objective, which can vary from being performative to developmental, and its alignment with the unique demands for individual teachers (Kennedy, 2015). In addition to this, assessment, duration, research scale, dissemination, comprehensiveness, support and control, context and collaboration are all essential components of effective PD for teachers as stated by Sancar, Atal and Deryakulu (2021). Moreover, it's possible that some teachers' negative perceptions of the trainers and the

environment in which the training was held prevent them from benefiting personally from in-service training (Ayvaz-Tuncel and Çobanoğlu, 2018). It should also be noted that teachers are generally considered to be passive participants in transmission-oriented PD (Widdowson, 1997). Within the framework of the collaborative perspective, educators are not only productive and active, but they also play an active role in their own learning process (Crandall, 2000). Previously, PD had been identified as activities that are short-term in nature, such as seminars and workshops, and that have the potential to provide general knowledge in the field of education (Turhan and Arıkan, 2009). Nevertheless, due to recent developments in education and technology, it has been recognized as a process that continues throughout one's entire life. This process includes constant improvement alongside the most recent opportunities and experiences, which are planned in a systematic way in order to accomplish professional objectives (Villegas- Reimers, 2003). According to Caner (2019), the new perspective involves one's active involvement and engagement in PD. In addition to this, Schleicher asserted that teachers ought to be active agents of their professional growth (2012). In other words, maintaining a continuous learning process is essential for teachers who wish to improve their teaching skills and provide better instruction to their students. It would be beneficial for them to also be learning at the same time as a great deal of knowledge can be gained by teachers from their students. In this respect, it can be stated that in-service training is a method that assumes professionals in the area possess the knowledge and skills to deliver and educate others effectively. It also implies that participants in this training should modify their own teaching practices accordingly. On the other hand, PD emphasizes critical thinking and reflection that instructors engage in based on their own experiences. Furthermore, it shifts the role of the educator from being an expert in a subject to someone who presents new opportunities (Farrell, 2015).

In conclusion, the literature shows that although training plays a significant role in teacher development, it is also necessary to provide teachers with hands-on experience, exposure to necessary expertise, and continuous PD in order to feel adequately prepared for their roles in the educational system. Closing these gaps in teacher preparation and PD is essential to raising the standard of instruction and fostering teachers' ongoing development.

2.2. An Evolutionary Overview of the Concept PD in ELT in Türkiye

The establishment of Darülmüallimin (Teacher's School) in İstanbul on March 16, 1948 marked the beginning of official teacher education in Türkiye (Aydın, 2007). Established in

1926, the Gazi Teacher School in Ankara played a crucial role in preparing future teachers to fulfill the demands of the teaching profession in Türkiye (Demirel, 1991). In 1941, despite the fact that this school used to provide only education in pedagogy, an English language department was established (Demirel, 1991). English teacher candidates at Gazi Institute of Education were first offered a three-year degree in 1967, however, in 1978, the program was extended to four years (Nergis, 2011). More English language departments were established after 1965, and in an effort to train more teachers, these institutions increased the number of students admitted after 1975. Nevertheless, because of inconsistent policies for language teacher education, the quality of instruction fell short of expectations (Demirel, 1991). The government's policies between 1940 and 1980, according to Altundiş (2006), were centered on expanding the number of departments and courses in order to train more teachers. On the other hand, the teacher candidates accepted into these programs lacked pedagogical qualifications, which led to the failure of language instruction in Türkiye. After the Higher Education Institution Law was implemented in 1982, all teacher education institutions were moved to universities as faculties of education in order to standardize their curriculum (Öztürk, 2005). All areas of teacher education programs were mandated to last for four years in 1989 (Nergis, 2011). The curriculum of these programs was revised in 1989 to incorporate more professional knowledge and practice for new teachers (Sağlam and Kürüm, 2005). Significant changes were also implemented in English language teacher education. Following the establishment of the The Council of Higher Education in 1982, higher education adopted a standardized curriculum for all Foreign Language Education departments. This was caused by the increasing demand for English language classes, which led to the increase in private schools and a parallel rise in the need for qualified English language teachers (Balbay and Doğan, 2021).

In spite of many attempts that have been made to expand opportunities for English instructors to receive training, a significant number of students in Türkiye are unable to attain the level of competence that is required for them (Doğançay-Aktuna and Kızıltepe, 2005; Kırkgöz, 2007). According to Seferoğlu (1996) and Büyükkantarcıoğlu (2004), one of the causes for this failure might be explained with the inadequate performance of language teachers. Due to this particular reason, several efforts have been made to enhance preservice education (Seferoğlu, 1996; Yavuz, 2011). Nevertheless, Özer (2005) asserts that the function of in-service teacher education should also be taken into consideration in order to enhance the quality of language teaching in Türkiye.

The Ministry of National Education (MoNE) provided training for English language instructors until 1981. Foreign language instruction became a department offered at universities following the foundation of The Council of Higher Education (CoHE) in 1981 (Güven, 2008; Çakır, 2017). Tercanlıoğlu (2004) stated that this modification was made in an effort to raise the standard of teacher preparation programmes. Pre-service EFL teachers at these ELT departments must complete four years of coursework if they are exempt from taking a one-year English preparation course. Several compulsory and elective courses from different departments are offered in ELT departments (Karakas, 2012). CoHE's reforms have primarily focused on the quantitative aspects of development, such as program duration and quota (Köksal and Ulum, 2018). It is evident that qualitative changes in ELT programs are necessary for more effective teacher education, even though the current ELT departments are more efficient than the previous ones.

From learners' perspective, foreign language learning has always been an issue for learners especially when it is a must for them without a real-life purpose or an intrinsic motivation. Individuals worldwide undergo diverse language learning processes, and only a small number of people can achieve the level of fluency and success that the program specifically targets within a constrained timeframe. Even if they score well in exams, the majority of them do not feel confident enough when they are expected to communicate or do some research using their foreign language. Sabuncuoğlu and Kurtoğlu (2021) claim that due to their limited exposure to the English language, a considerable number of language learners experience anxiety especially in countries in which English is not spoken as the native language. In addition, according to Edinne (2013), a lack of confidence on the part of a learner could be related to a deficiency in essential skills or inadequate instruction. In Turkish context, learners tend to spend a lot of time and effort to have competency in English as a learner. This is because it is considered vital to be able to keep in contact with the rest of the world. As Seidlhofer states, English is regarded as a way of communication between speakers with different first languages, which has helped the term "English as a lingua franca" emerge (2005). In other words, the world has become more globalized, and the only group affected by this is not only the students who are often in need of information but also societies and countries that do not have strict borders compared to the past. This means a lot of institutions have been turning internationalized, and it is not possible to deny the strong effects of the internet and social media on this change. That's to say, the significance of learning English in such a global world is increasing (Doğançay-Aktuna & Kızıltepe, 2005). This is mainly because English

language skills, particularly communicative skills, are crucial to building the necessary knowledge and understanding for progress (Richards, 2008). As a result, a massive amount of resources and money has been allocated to effective English language education, with a rising demand to train more qualified English language instructors capable of meeting the needs of the century.

Geopolitically and strategically, Türkiye is situated in a region that is of great importance. According to Kartal and Başol (2019), the English language policies of the country were influenced by a variety of historical events, including World War II, the Cold War, NATO membership as well as the European Union integration process. These events had an effect on the country's political, social, and economic conditions. Due to the current socio-political atmosphere, it is more essential than ever for Turkish nationals to develop English language skills, since it is now a necessity for them to succeed in meeting the higher standards that are required. In his study, Kırkgöz (2009) states that Türkiye tends to use English as a foreign language more than any other country in the expanding circle (Kachru, 1992) of the English language. The English language has been made obligatory at all levels of school as a result of the impact it has.

In Türkiye, the Ministry of National Education (MoNE) and the The Council of Higher Education (CoHE) are in charge of English language teaching (ELT) policy and English Language Teacher Education (ELTE) programs. In response to the worldwide impact of English, these two institutions started a series of developmental stages in English language education, beginning with the introduction of English-medium instruction at the higher education level. As a result, Middle East Technical University was founded in 1956, followed by an increasing number of state and foundation institutions. In 1996, CoHE announced that students whose language proficiency is below the minimum level needed to pursue their education in their fields would have to complete a year-long preparatory program for English for Academic Purposes (EAP) due to the growing demand for English-medium instruction at the university level (Kırkgöz, 2009).

More adjustments were implemented, particularly after 1997. According to Richards and Rodgers (2001), the 20th century was characterized by rapid changes and advancements in the field of education, as well as "competing language teaching ideologies" (p.1). These modifications were introduced by the collaboration of MoNE and CoHE to increase the quality of English language instruction in the country, which was previously neglected. Starting from

the fourth grade, English was integrated into the curriculum as part of "the Ministry of Education Development Project." The decision was taken considering the need to give students more language input as well as more time to learn the language than in the past (MoNE, 2001). This effort established a basis for future developments related to language education in the country.

Teacher training, which had been ignored for a long time, was given priority as part of the attempts to expand the number of methodological courses as well as the quality of those courses. Additionally, the duration of the internship course was revised, which allowed students to have a greater number of opportunities to be exposed to real-world teaching and learning experiences. This was an extremely important step that needed to be made in order to improve the quality of language teaching in addition to teacher education (Sarıçoban, 2012). Moreover, a lot of universities and other educational institutions have also started providing undergraduate, graduate, and PD programs to those who have an intention to expand their knowledge and expertise in the field.

It is important to note that although there have been attempts to improve the quality of English language education in Türkiye both at K-12 and higher education levels, as mentioned before, it is clear that there are still points to consider to reach higher standards. A research carried out by Uztosun (2017) with 2,476 teachers from different levels of education including primary, secondary, and high schools in 50 cities across Türkiye reported teachers' views about the quality of English language teaching in the country. As a result of the study, ELT in Türkiye is not effective. It was also observed that the primary reasons for inefficient English language instruction come from students' negative emotional states, high number of students in classrooms, low-quality textbooks, a lack of materials, limited class hours, instruction that is shaped by examinations, and a curriculum that is both overloaded and structure-based. In this regard, to overcome these obstacles, more attention should be given to specific areas including English language teachers' PD activities, which will finally result in a better learning environment for students by enhancing teachers' professional knowledge and improving problem-solving skills.

Similarly, another research carried out by Solak and Bayar (2015) with students from various departments of a state university in Türkiye shows that English courses should have realistic objectives and English language learning ought to be approached as a whole, from primary school to university. Therefore, teachers should focus on teaching and improving four

language skills instead of grammar. Instead of focusing on theory, English classes should be built around practice. Additionally, teachers of English should plan tasks that take into account that each student has unique qualities and differences. Moreover, the coursebooks, videos, and websites that are used should be carefully decided taking the students' level, interests, and needs into consideration. For all these reasons mentioned, in-service training is something that English language teachers ought to pursue to keep their skills up to date.

Regarding the effectiveness of training activities offered by MoNE, a study conducted by Küçüksüleymanoğlu (2006) revealed that English language teachers in Türkiye who participated in ELT INSET programs organized by MoNE believed these trainings were not sufficient either in terms of content or the amount. The findings of the study also revealed that INSET needs to be implemented on a large scale throughout the country. On a regular basis, every teacher has to take part in INSET sessions. Each school ought to do a needs assessment for its instructors, determine the necessary INSET subjects accordingly, and then report the findings to the Ministry of Education. Additionally, the classes ought to be based on practical experience.

When it comes to the training of English language instructors in the higher education context, it can be said that Turkish universities do not follow uniform standards while providing English language teachers with the necessary education and support for them to fulfill the requirements of the profession to maximize the effectiveness of the process. In order to examine the deficiencies of teacher training policies, a research was carried out by conducting interviews with teachers from twenty different universities in Türkiye (Balbay et al., 2018). As a result of the study, it was revealed that teacher training programs are not held based on specific student needs that are determined by their departments, which means teachers are not given enough support in accordance with students' departmental needs. Furthermore, analyzing the needs of teachers and taking these into consideration during training activities will allow teachers to bring innovations into their classes. However, it was also found out that teachers' opinions on their needs are usually ignored in many universities in the planning process of the trainings. Funding issues, theory-based training, a lack of variety in training methods, not being process-oriented, administrative issues, and attitudinal differences between teachers resulting from different backgrounds were listed as some of the other challenges in English language teaching in Turkish universities.

Based on the brief history of foreign language teacher education in Türkiye, it can be inferred that further consideration is necessary both in the K-12 and higher education context, and this is the case not only from students' perspective but also teachers' point of view. A contributing factor to the low effectiveness of teacher education is the lack of coordination between MoNE and CoHE. This lack of coordination leads to inconsistent and unreliable policies and practices regarding teacher education (Seferoğlu, 2004). Furthermore, decisions made by these institutions are typically influenced by the political agendas of the governments, and they are not founded on a carefully considered long-term philosophy (Nergis, 2011). More effective PD activities that are based on real needs and a bottom-up approach can be viewed as a crucial step in terms of English language teachers' PD. Since the quality of education is strongly connected to the quality of teachers, issues in the PD of English language teachers should be addressed precisely to increase the standards of language education at all levels all over the country. In this sense, also taking 21st century requirements into account, it is necessary to investigate what English language teachers need, how they approach PD and what further actions should be taken to increase the quality of English education in the country.

2.3. Professional Development of Contemporary English Language Teachers

As stated above, since the second half of the twentieth century, which was referred to as the era of communication, the globe has been making significant progress toward becoming a global village. Language instruction, particularly instruction in the languages spoken by the majority of people throughout the world, is becoming increasingly important as the need for communication grows. This is because these languages are viewed as global ways of communication (Wallace, 1991).

Given that there is such a great demand for EFL instruction, it is necessary for foreign language programs in every part of the world to have EFL instructors who are both qualified and professional so that they can respond to developments and changes that take place in the modern world. In the past, teachers were regarded as knowledge providers, however, today they are responsible for providing necessary guidance. The teacher's role has shifted to that of a facilitator rather than being the primary source of knowledge in the classroom. To achieve this, teachers were expected to possess additional qualifications for their new role (Balbay and Doğan, 2021). Learner autonomy and the role of the instructor as a facilitator during the learning process are the two concepts that have contributed to a shift in teaching and learning environments. Today's teaching and learning practices are learner-centered and adaptable,

thanks to the increasing availability of modern technology. PD for teachers is the primary instrument that may aid them in maintaining their professionalism in this new academic world, which is characterized by considerable changes in education. To teach English successfully, it is crucial for teachers of English as a foreign language to have competency in the English language as well as strong language skills. For teachers to be successful in their professional lives, it is necessary for them to update and equip themselves in accordance with the new requirements of the profession in addition to being able to experience different ways to improve constantly both as learners and teachers. There is a consensus among scholars and educators that how qualified a teacher is has a strong connection with the success level of students. Despite the fact that a great deal of the research that investigates the quality of teachers focus on the education that teachers receive in pre-service programs, some of the findings revealed that a significant number of teachers do not feel confident enough as they believe they were not adequately prepared to perform the profession when they started teaching (Palardy & Rumberger, 2008; Porter & Brophy, 1988). Similarly, Doğan (2016) reported that several instructors have stated that they acquire teaching skills mostly via practical experience in their own classes due to the majority of theoretical content in the courses of teacher candidates in their departments. This supports the idea that teachers require further PD opportunities while doing their jobs. However, PD should be given enough importance by all teachers regardless of how experienced they are due to the changing needs and developments in today's world, which was mentioned previously.

To sum up, the level of teachers' readiness and effectiveness is greatly influenced by their ongoing commitment to learning and professional growth throughout their professional journey. Teachers are seen as individuals who continuously engage in learning throughout their lives. Hence, it is essential to provide them with ongoing PD chances to enhance their professional growth and adapt to the evolving education system and the changing traits of learners. Therefore, taking part in effective PD activities is necessary for teachers as the quality of education is closely related to the presence of qualified teachers.

2.3.1. Features of Effective Professional Development

As stated by Borg (2015) in the context of education, PD refers to the accumulation of both formal and informal learning experiences that school administrators and teachers acquire. These experiences serve to enhance their professional knowledge and practice in addition to their personal knowledge, which eventually contributes to the overall success of the institutions

on the way to overcoming both existing and future challenges in the field of education. In a more general sense, "effective" PD can be described as actions or experiences that lead to improvements in either the professional knowledge or practice of teachers or in the outcomes for students.

Efforts aimed to develop teachers professionally can be pursued through institutional encouragement or individual motivation. Participating in courses and seminars, reading scholarly publications, and collaborating with peers are typical forms of professional development utilized by English teachers (Topkaya and Celik, 2016). They can be provided either by educational institutions themselves for their teachers, or teachers can direct their own PD process by deciding the most suitable and effective option for their improvement. British Council and RELO (The Regional English Language Office) by the U.S. Embassy also offer PD opportunities to English teachers all around the World to ensure effective PD. RELO collaborates with teachers, professional associations, universities, administrators, officers and other stakeholders to enhance the quality of English language teaching. It highlights the significance of collaboration, interaction and communication in effectiveness of PD. It conducts projects with institutions including conducting workshops at professional development events and consulting on materials, curriculum and assessment issues (Regional English Language Office). Also, British Council offers various options to both teachers and teacher educators depending on two unique frameworks that address the skills and knowledge English language professionals need (British Council, 2015).

The literature presents a variety of perspectives and understandings of what defines PD, and these perspectives and understandings vary from one another. Other than that, every educational setting is rather distinct from the others in terms of the values it places on education, the policies it implements, and the possibilities it offers to its instructors for professional growth. Nevertheless, the literature does provide a number of common foundations for effective PD. In this part, factors that determine whether a PD program can be effective or not will be presented based on Darling-Hammond, Hyler, and Gardner's and British Council's frameworks as they contain suitable elements to refer to the previous research in the field conducted in Turkish universities throughout this study. In order to determine the common design aspects of useful PD approaches, Darling-Hammond, Hyler, and Gardner (2017) carried out a study. In their study, seven essential characteristics of successful PD methods are identified. First of all, PD should first prioritize content. The curriculum of PD programs should be in line with

specific needs and expectations of teachers. Otherwise, it will not facilitate the motivation of instructors to engage in future PD activities. Additionally, PD programs should use active learning methods that are based on the principles of adult learning theory. To enhance the effectiveness of teachers' PD programs, teachers' individual learning styles should be taken into account since each individual possesses a unique learning style, which enables them learn more effectively (Fleming, 1995). Prior to developing PD programs, instructors need to analyze teachers' learning styles and enhance the effectiveness of the PD programs. For this reason, Darling-Hammond et al. (2017) suggest the characteristics of the target group play a crucial role in the design of PD activities.

A further criterion emphasizes that the design of PD should facilitate collaboration among teachers (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017). Teachers can acquire an extensive amount of new knowledge from one another. Experienced teachers can provide assistance to those who are new or inexperienced. On the other hand, novice teachers can assist experienced teachers in several ways, including the utilization of technology. Teachers have the opportunity to observe and provide feedback on each other's lessons. Also, collaborative and interactive PD activities play a crucial role in enhancing teachers' attitudes towards PD (Doğan and Kırkgöz, 2022). Consequently, their motivation for further developmental activities may increase. In addition to this, successful PD should employ effective models and practice. In other words, it can be inferred that teacher trainers and teacher educators should serve as role models for teachers. Teachers' comprehension of the subject matter is enhanced when they are presented with an actual example that allows them to apply their acquired knowledge more efficiently in their educational settings (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017). This demonstrates that presenting the content with practical activities can promote the effectiveness of PD programs for teachers as this provides teachers with applicable ideas that they can implement in their classrooms.

The next criterion of effective PD is providing assistance and guidance from professionals to teachers (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017). Receiving coaching from experts can provide teachers with additional opportunities to enhance their understanding. Consequently, the instructors' engagement in the PD program will be enhanced. Teachers who are actively engaged in their teaching may acquire knowledge more efficiently and retain it for a longer period. As Darling-Hammond et al. (2017) state, the trainers' support during the implementation of new methods will greatly facilitate their development. A further principle emphasizes the inclusion of feedback and reflection as fundamental elements of PD. Teachers

should be able to identify their needs and choose the areas in which they should take action for improvement. It is important for them to analyze and determine their strong sides and points to improve in their teaching. To be able to do this, they need to have enough willingness, motivation, and determination to improve throughout the way as it is not always easy to be able to reflect on one's experiences or receive feedback to be constructive for further action. Effective PD includes both feedback and reflection, which are two independent processes that complement one another. According to Schön (1987), feedback and reflection are essential components in the process of enhancing one's knowledge and understanding. Doğan and Kırkgöz (2022) also highlighted the significance of being reflective in their study. They concluded that collaboration facilitated reflection, which in turn facilitated collaboration. That is, it was revealed that there is a positive correlation between reflection and collaboration, which is one of the abovementioned characteristics of effective PD. Finally, it can be stated that to be able to select and continue with a suitable PD activity, it is important to analyze the requirements and identify the specific needs (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017). To be able to achieve this, the necessary importance needs to be given to feedback and reflection processes.

The final component emphasizes that PD should have a sustainable duration. That is to say, PD should be a continuous and ongoing activity throughout one's life. Teachers should engage in continuous learning. Due to the constant evolution of circumstances, everything is subject to change every single day. This necessitates that teachers have to stick to this process in every aspect of life (Darling-Hammond et al., 2017).

The PD programs outlined by Darling-Hammond et al., (2017) and the CPD framework for teachers by the British Council (2015) share a common perspective that PD activities should enrich teachers' understanding and knowledge across different subject areas. PD programs should enhance teachers' ability to design their lessons effectively. For this reason, It is essential to have a good understanding of the learning styles of the learners in order to make planning more effective. By having a deep understanding of their students, instructors can design more effective lessons. Moreover, PD programs should also prioritize classroom management. Educators should have enough knowledge about contemporary strategies to be able to manage their classrooms effectively.

Furthermore, teachers must possess a high level of expertise in the subject matter as well as in English in order to participate in PD activities. To achieve this purpose, PD programs should be designed to improve teachers' competency and expertise. Teachers engaging in PD

activities should acquire the knowledge and skills necessary to effectively instruct the new generation in foreign language education. Given that learners of the new generation possess distinct demands and expectations compared to previous generations, it is necessary for teachers to develop in accordance with their requirements and expectations. This will enhance the effectiveness and success of language learning.

On the other hand, short-term PD programs should inspire instructors to view PD as a continuous process of learning throughout their lives. As previously stated, the world is undergoing constant change. The British Council (2015) highlighted features of effective PD that can enhance teachers' understanding in various areas such as resource management, learning assessment, integration of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), involvement in professional growth, implementation of inclusive practices, utilization of multilingual approaches, and understanding policies and procedures related to education (British Council, 2015).

To summarize, these two frameworks show similarity in several aspects. Both frameworks prioritize the learning styles, personalities, needs, and expectations of teachers. All these should be taken into account while organizing and arranging PD programs in order to ensure their meaningfulness and effectiveness. However, there are discrepancies between the two frameworks in several aspects such as ICT and 21st century skills. The British Council (2015) emphasizes the importance of utilizing technology and effectively managing various resources. Darling-Hammond et al. (2017) examined the topics of feedback and reflection, collaboration, modeling, and mentorship. Viewing the literature, it is possible to find a great deal of research on each of these components both in Türkiye and abroad. In the 21st century, teacher PD must be adapted to local conditions and global factors, utilizing ICT to drive educational innovation and change (Albion et al., 2015). On the other hand, Sancar et al. (2021) suggest that collaboration, assessment, research scale, duration, comprehensiveness, dissemination, context, support and control, and support and control are essential components of effective teacher PD. Similarly, Khalmurzayevna et al., (2023) emphasize that English teachers in the 21st century must keep up with field knowledge, conduct research, develop curriculum based on student needs and local conditions, and promote ICT skills while also follow and implement new educational approaches. While some researchers searching for a better understanding of teachers' PD in the field focused on the needs and expectations of teachers, some investigated the effects of collaboration or reflection on teachers' professional

growth. In addition to these, there are many studies in which the effectiveness of specific PD activities has been investigated at different times. However, conducting a comprehensive search in each field is necessary in order to establish a meaningful comparison of the results over time. In short, the PD of English teachers has been a common concern for many researchers, especially for the last three decades since the effects of technology, globalization, and new generations started to influence the way we live, socialize, perceive the world, and learn new information. With this regard, investigating previous theses and dissertations, this study focuses on how these changes affected the research tendencies and results in the field of PD of English teachers in Türkiye.

2.3.2. Challenges in teachers' effective professional development

Throughout the years, researchers all around the world have been conducting studies to find new ways to increase the quality of education, student achievement, and teacher effectiveness by identifying problems and offering solutions as well as their continuous effort to understand needs and requirements from different perspectives in education. In this regard, there are a great deal of studies conducted on the effectiveness of teachers' PD. However, when the problematic areas regarding limitations and challenges in the subject are investigated, it is observed that different answers are highlighted in different contexts. Nevertheless, the relevant literature indicates that these various responses are interconnected, suggesting that there are common factors that limit or reduce the intended success of PD activities.

Firstly, it has been discovered that the absence of certain factors affects the outcomes that are expected from PD practices and procedures. The reasons that hinder professional growth might vary depending on the educational setting, and there is no one strategy that is universally considered to be the greatest method for PD. A lack of attention and priority given to the PD of teachers may be one factor that contributes to the reluctance of instructors to participate in activities related to PD. According to Johnson (2006), Earley and Bubb (2007), and Johnson and Marx (2009), the efficiency of PD activities is directly linked to the institution's initiation, continual support, and working climate. Similarly, the absence of a professional community might reduce instructors' willingness to initiate or participate in PD initiatives due to the fear that they will not receive support (Desimone, 2011).

Furthermore, a frequently noted hindrance to effective PD is the lack of connection between in-service practices and pre-service education although they are expected to be relevant and complement one another. In education faculties, theoretical knowledge and practices do not

correspond to actual school environments (Ulum, 2020). According to Ekşi (2010), it is crucial to implement effective PD activities because of the limitations caused by the prior limited experiences of teachers before they entered the teaching profession. It is the expectation of teacher education programs that the institutions where prospective teachers will be working are equipped with adequate and appropriate resources and opportunities. However, employers believe that new graduates do not have the necessary skills and attitudes that are essential for an effective learning environment (Seferoğlu, 2006; Coşkun & Daloğlu, 2010). In other words, an additional problem that can be noticed is the absence of a connection between the lessons taught in undergraduate programs and the teaching abilities and subject matter knowledge that are necessary in the workplace (Ünal, 2010).

Another issue with PD is a lack of time for participation and reflection. In order to learn new techniques, skills, and knowledge, apply them to their teaching methods, experiment with the newly acquired knowledge and skills, and reflect on their experiences, teachers should be given enough time. According to Guskey (2003), and Desimone (2011), one of the most commonly cited reasons why teachers don't take part in PD activities is their workload.

A further point is that teachers ought to possess intrinsic motivation to enhance their PD. Research has demonstrated that following compulsory PD strategies leads to less beneficial results in terms of teachers, students, trainers, and institutions. Besides this, when examining the process, professional growth should not be limited to generic or standardized techniques that are intended to suit everyone. In other words, one size may not fit all, and it can be stated that even a PD activity which is considered the most successful can be insufficient to meet the needs of all teachers (Avalos, 2011). The potential efficiency of PD activities is hindered when there is a lack of autonomy, flexibility, and variety in the way they are conducted (Johnson and Marx, 2009; Guskey, 2009; Parker et al., 2015; Ramos et al., 2016; Kennedy et al., 2016; Thurlings et al., 2017; Reeve et al., 2021).

In conclusion, adequate resources should be set up specifically for teacher training and PD, together with the tools and supplies required for this. In addition, there is insufficient funding for teachers' real teaching time when it is expected that they will be participating in PD activities. To prioritize teacher comfort, more financial support is required (Adamy and Heinecke, 2005).

2.4. Common Professional Development Activities in the field of English Language

Teaching

Through participation in many different kinds of formal and informal activities, EFL instructors have the opportunity to improve their professional learning. For example, Lieberman (1996) and Musset (2010) classified activities for PD according to the location in which they are carried out. One of the ways that EFL instructors may continue their education is by participating in formal professional events and activities, which often take place outside the classroom. These events and activities include conferences, workshops, and training courses. English teachers have the opportunity to learn from their colleagues and subject matter specialists, as well as share their own experiences in the classroom through activities of this kind. Additionally, mentoring or coaching is a further option for PD that takes place outside of the usual classroom setting. One of the most important ways to get information about teaching English is to learn from colleagues who have more expertise. School-based tasks which are conducted outside the schools are another opportunity for teachers to learn. Some examples of these activities include reading professional journals and taking part in research activities, projects, special interest groups, or trips to other schools. Teachers have the opportunity to connect with other English instructors throughout the world through these activities, which is one of the most exciting means of PD. These activities may be conducted independently or in collaboration with other colleagues. There are also a variety of ELT accounts and groups on Facebook and Twitter that teachers may join to discuss their experiences or thoughts about various teaching approaches.

According to Borg (2017), activities for PD can be divided into two categories: training-based activities and practice-based activities. Conferences, seminars, and workshops are examples of formal and structured events that make up the first type of activities. As a result, their being top-down in nature is frequently criticized. Action research, teacher support groups, and peer observation are examples of what falls under the second group. According to Özbilgin, Ekmen, and Karaman (2016), as these activities are started and executed by teachers, they are usually less formal and follow a bottom-up approach. Since the first group of activities are perceived as one-time events without following support, they have been considered insufficient. Furthermore, the focus of those exercises does not meet the actual needs of the teachers or provide solutions to the challenges they encounter in their classrooms. Consequently, these tools fail to assist teachers in improving their knowledge or fostering positive changes related to their teaching (Hişmanoğlu and Hişmanoğlu, 2010). Additionally, this kind of top-down PD

models were criticized by Borg (2017) since they focus on telling teachers what is expected rather than providing them with the opportunity to learn from their own experiences. However, it is more possible for teachers to apply positive changes in their teaching practices and enhance their teaching abilities when PD programs have a strong connection with their own experiences, expectations, and needs (Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin, 1995). Activities like lesson studies, peer observation, mentorship, self-reflection and monitoring, team teaching, teacher support groups, and reading clubs are all part of practice-based PD. An investigation of the effectiveness of these cooperative activities among teachers was carried out by Beltran and Percy (2014). They argued in favor of viewing collaboration between teachers as a chance for shared teacher learning. Moreover, collaborative action research is another type of collaborative activity that may be utilized as a means of improving professionalism. Action research was suggested by Tanış and Dikilitaş (2018) as a continuous PD activity that is seen to be beneficial in improving teachers' practical knowledge. A study was conducted by Banegas et al. (2013) in which collaborative action research was used in teaching practices. Their experience shows that it has a positive impact on the professional growth of the teachers. Moreover, how autonomous and motivated they are affects students' motivation as well as language improvement. In a study by Bayar (2014), 16 primary school teachers participated in PD events for a year, and they were asked about their experiences. To ensure that a PD activity was effective, the participants were asked to create a list of the components that they considered to be essential for the activity to be successful. Additionally, to analyze the training results reports that were provided by the MoNE, he conducted document analysis. According to the results, teachers believe that an effective PD activity should meet the needs of the teachers involved, and the school's needs, provide opportunities for long-term engagement, require high-quality teachers, and involve teachers in planning the activities.

To advance in their careers, English language teachers all over the world organize and take part in a variety of events, including seminars, trainings, conferences, workshops, symposiums, and conventions. They also have professional associations all over the world. English teachers have the opportunity to exchange ideas and experiences in professional forums such as the International Association for Teachers of English as a Foreign Language (IATEFL), the European Association for Language Testing and Assessment (EALTA), and the International Teacher Training Organization (ITTO).

Educational institutions in Türkiye also acknowledge the significance of PD activities for teachers. Many opportunities for teachers can be found at various institutions. There is a department under the Ministry of Education that is specifically devoted to the training of teachers who are working in state schools (Bayrakli, 2010). Furthermore, PD activities are provided in Türkiye by reputable organizations such as Turkish American Association and, British Council.

The English language is considered to be of great significance in the context of education in Türkiye, particularly in the context of higher education, just as it is in many other parts of the world today. Students at Turkish universities are expected to show a high level of competence and proficiency in the English language, which serves as the medium of instruction at the majority of the country's most prestigious educational institutions. For students to begin their studies in their departments, it is necessary for them to demonstrate that they are proficient in the English language. They must enroll in an English language preparation program for a full academic year in order to accomplish this. Teachers who teach English at these preparatory programs at universities are required to be trained to provide their students with effective and high quality education. To fulfill this objective, numerous educational institutions, such as Middle East Technical University, Bilkent University, Sabancı University, Atilim University, Ankara Social Sciences University, and Anadolu University have established their own teacher training units so that teachers can benefit from induction trainings along with continuous PD activities. Moreover, teachers can follow both short and long-term training opportunities provided by some private institutions such as Oxford House College and Pearson.

Furthermore, several universities and private schools arrange national and international events that are accessible to English language teachers. These events are sponsored by publishers that specialize in English language teaching, and they send invitations to English language teachers worldwide. Teachers can enhance their knowledge and skills by participating in events such as workshops, seminars, lectures, and panel discussions. These activities provide opportunities for teachers to stay updated on the latest research related to their field, acquire new techniques as well as adapting different approaches, familiarize themselves with currently published works, and interact with other experts (Ur, 2005). Additionally, in-service training courses are made available to English teachers by the Turkish MoNE.

All in all, regarding the PD of English language teachers, there is a wide range of activities and programs for English language teachers in Türkiye from K-12 to university.

Teachers can benefit from these opportunities in their institutions and out of their institutions. These aim at improving the quality of education and standards of the profession as well as the satisfaction levels of students and teachers. In Türkiye, a great deal of research has been conducted on teachers' PD and some of them focus on the field of English language teachers' PD. It has been observed that whereas some PD activities mentioned above have been at the center of the focus especially at specific levels, some are not equally paid attention. For this reason, the research tendencies in the field need to be highlighted to be able to recognize what has been neglected so far or which areas still need more attention. Therefore, this study aims to investigate and analyze graduate theses conducted in the field of English language teachers' PD in Türkiye with the purpose of contributing to the profession in several dimensions.

2.5. Previous Studies

In Türkiye, there are some researchers that have carried out their studies adapting content analysis as a research method. They have focused on several questions in their research to reveal specific points in their field. Content analysis is a qualitative research method which can also be characterized as both systematic and replicable with the purpose of reducing a huge volume of text into a smaller number of content categories (Berelson, 1952; Krippendorff, 1980; and Weber, 1999; Neuendorf, 2017). According to Yıldırım and Şimşek (2011), document analysis is the most commonly used data collection method in content analysis, however, it can also be utilized alongside other methods. Some of the researchers concentrated on postgraduate theses while some investigated journal articles or other documents as they carried out their studies. Different studies from different fields have been investigated including education, psychology, health, arts, and science. Some examples are as below:

2.5.1. International studies

Studies conducted abroad that are presented in this section are relatively limited compared to national studies due to the nature of this study as it focuses specifically on the PD of English language teachers in Turkish context. Some relevant research is introduced as follows:

Al Kathiri (2002) investigated master's theses that were submitted to the Curriculum and Instruction Department at King Saud University in Saudi Arabia for his doctoral dissertation. Curriculum and instruction theses published between 1983 and 2002 were examined for descriptive characteristics (publication year, gender, major), methodological trends (topics, study contexts, research types, sampling techniques, etc.), and references. The

researcher tried to find similarities between studies that came out during two different time periods (1983–1992 and 1993–2002) by looking at the research trends of the theses. Based on the study's findings, elementary and secondary schools were the most often chosen study locations, with the majority of the research being carried out at public schools. Data gathering methods that were employed the least frequently were observation and questionnaires, with the former being the most popular. Also, among the sample research, there was not a single study using the interview methodology for data collection. Additionally, it was inferred from the data that Instructors and general curriculum majors are more likely to be used as study sample groups by female researchers. It is suggested that male authors consider including a study on female education in their graduate theses in the major-specific recommendations.

Carter (2012) conducted a survey in Canada for his doctoral dissertation using the content analysis method to examine 52 master's degree theses that were written between the years 2008 and 2010 on second language teaching. The studies were analyzed in terms of their research methodologies, instruments, statistical analyses, and other aspects of the research. The findings indicated that the quantitative method was the most preferred research method, interviews, and surveys were the most popular data collection instrument that researchers preferred, and the average number of pages was 134.

Buendía and Macías (2019) carried out a research on PD of English language teachers in Colombia, based on a review of 25 empirical studies and highlighted key findings. It emphasizes the significance of language proficiency, research skills, and reflective practice in teacher development. The research underscores the necessity for personalized and context-specific PD programs to empower teachers in effectively tackling challenges in their educational settings. Furthermore, collaborative learning projects, communicative language teaching methods, and the integration of emerging technologies are identified as crucial for enhancing teacher professional growth. Overall, the study emphasizes the importance of active teacher participation and innovative teaching approaches in advancing language education in Colombia.

As another example from language teaching, Tafazoli (2021) conducted a comprehensive analysis of published works from 2010 to 2020 that relate to the new literacies of language teachers. The researcher examined 29 published articles referring to the new literacies and PD of language teachers from 2010 to 2020. The articles were chosen from a collection of 503 published papers in nine databases, using specified criteria to determine which

publications to include and exclude. A five-phase research synthesis technique was employed including data gathering, assessment, analysis, and interpretation. The researchers gathered data from several scholarly sources and databases using specific keywords associated with new literacies and language instruction. The research discovered a consistent increase in the quantity of published articles throughout the decade, with a particular emphasis on digital literacy and the utilization of Web 2.0 technologies. The analysis revealed that the majority of papers related to new literacies in PD mostly concentrated on the concept of digital literacy. This suggested an increasing focus on digital literacy within the framework of language teacher PD. Also, most of the articles that were published were from Asia and Europe. These publications mainly concentrated on in-service teachers and utilized qualitative research methodologies. The findings enhance comprehension of the research and methodologies relevant to new literacies among language educators, while also highlighting prospective areas for further investigation into the utilization of new literacies in language instruction.

A study conducted by Hill (2022) in Texas on K–12 Online Literacy and Reading Instruction presented a detailed content analysis from 2000–2021 thorough examination of the developments and patterns in the field of online literacy programs. Examining 59 papers from databases owned by the Teacher Resource Center (TRC) and the Education Information Resource Center (ERIC), the study focused on theoretical gaps and ignored elements in online literacy instruction. The impact of the Covid-19 epidemic on online learning was examined, and the distribution of publications meant for academics and practitioners was emphasized. The analysis showed that there was a need for a stronger theoretical framework in online literacy learning, as well as a lack of theoretical consistency. It also emphasized how crucial it is to address student autonomy and literacy education focus areas. For educators, researchers, politicians, and other stakeholders in education, the study provided insightful information. It also made recommendations for future research areas to improve online literacy instruction.

2.5.2. National studies

Kırmızı (2012) analyzed 212 master's theses in English Language Teaching from six universities (METU, Bilkent, Hacettepe, Gazi, Anadolu, Çukurova), written between 2005 and 2010. The study identified key research areas within ELT during this period, including language skills, instructional methodology, materials or curriculum design and evaluation, and linguistics. Language skills emerged as the most extensively researched topic, particularly at Gazi University, while instructional methodology and materials/curriculum design were also

prominent subjects, with varying levels of emphasis across institutions. Notably, computer-assisted language learning (CALL) received relatively limited attention, represented by a smaller number of theses compared to other areas of ELT research.

Polat (2013) examined 34 master's theses in the field of Science Education at Celal Bayar University between 2001 and 2011 using content analysis methodology. Various variables such as the distribution of theses by year, types of research, sample sizes, data collection tools, and data analysis methods were examined. Findings indicated that quantitative research methods were the most commonly used, emphasizing the need for greater inclusion of qualitative research. Furthermore, it was suggested teachers should be more involved in the research processes.

Hoş and Topal (2013) conducted a literature review focusing on the PD of English teachers, initially identifying 217 documents for review. After applying inclusion and exclusion criteria, they selected 8 journal articles and 22 MA theses and PhD dissertations for detailed analysis. The study emphasized the limited opportunities for EFL instructors to receive training and development in Türkiye, underscoring the need for increased attention and resources in this area. Furthermore, it noted a scarcity of studies investigating the effectiveness of PD programs despite numerous recommendations in this regard. The research highlighted the necessity for more comprehensive evaluation and assessment of the outcomes of PD efforts for EFL teachers in Türkiye. Overall, the study emphasized the importance of providing EFL teachers with adequate resources and opportunities to enhance their professionalism and called for more robust and targeted in-service education and training programs.

Solak (2014) investigated 189 research papers written in Turkish that were produced between 2009 and 2013. He showed that teaching and learning and concept analysis were the most popular areas of study. There were more studies released in the field of ELT than ever before in 2013. Most of these papers were written by Turkish scholars and published in English. The quantitative method was used more than the qualitative method in the research. Undergraduate students were the most common sample group, and the sample size was usually between 31 and 100 people.

Using criterion sampling, Durukan, Atalay, and Şen (2015) conducted an examination of master's theses on Early Childhood published between the years 2000 and 2014. The total number of theses analyzed was 340. A number of aspects, such as the year, the gender of the

researcher, the language, the university, the graduate school, the department, the study subject, the supervisor's academic degree, and the resources, were taken into consideration while evaluating the theses. With the Graduate School of Social Sciences being the most productive, the results revealed that the number of thesis publications reached their highest point in the year 2010. The majority of theses concentrated on subjects related to the social development of children, as well as the educational interests and perspectives of schools and parents. Quantitative approaches were the most popular, and the majority of the resources that researchers employed were national.

Related to the field of English Language Teaching, Yağız et al. (2016) performed a content analysis study to examine research papers in Türkiye related to English Language Teaching that were published from 2005 to 2015. The findings indicated that Turkish academics in English Language Teaching show a significant tendency towards learning and teaching the language. Quantitative research methods employing descriptive tools and analysis were frequently utilized. The sample groups primarily consisted of undergraduate students and teachers. The main study areas explored from 2005 to 2015 were language teaching, language learning, and teacher education, primarily employing quantitative research methodologies. It was found that surveys were developed using the Likert scale while the studies were being carried out. A sampling size of approximately 101-300 undergraduate students was preferred for the sampling process. A descriptive statistical approach was employed. The advice provided for researchers in the field and applied linguistics focused on topics such as themes, statistical methodologies, and study designs.

Another qualitative study was conducted by Yavuz (2016) to analyze master theses and doctoral dissertations on Environmental Education in Türkiye between the years 2011 and 2015. The study employed document analysis, specifically examining categories such as publication date, supervisors, research methods, and data analysis characteristics. The research aimed to identify the patterns in these scholarly works and address specific sub-research inquiries concerning the distribution of studies and important attributes. The results indicated that the research methodology that was most preferred was quantitative, specifically survey research models. The study emphasized the importance of incorporating both quantitative and qualitative methods in educational research to improve the interpretive significance of findings and guarantee the validity and dependability of studies.

Özmen et al. (2016) carried out a study on trends in doctoral research on ELT in Türkiye between 2010 and 2014 and utilized a meta-synthesis methodology to analyze 137 doctoral dissertations. The research design integrated qualitative and quantitative data to categorize dissertations into subject areas, quantify variables like research paradigms, and identify macro and micro-level problems within doctoral programs. The purpose of the study was to provide insights into the doctoral research landscape in Türkiye, addressing the social and institutional influences shaping research trends. Key findings included concerns about grant support for research studies, methodological issues related to validity and reliability in dissertations, and the need for further analysis and discussion on challenges faced by doctoral students and programs in the field of English language teaching.

Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) investigated trends in Teachers' PD by analyzing 60 studies published between 2005 and 2015, both in Türkiye and internationally. The research examined variables such as publication type, language, year of publication, research design, data collection techniques, sample size, analysis type, and research topics. Findings revealed that the majority of studies were doctoral dissertations written in English, with a predominant use of quantitative research design. The study highlighted key themes related to teachers' PD, emphasizing the need for personalized PD activities and the positive impact of PD on teacher practice. The researchers underscored the importance of further research in this area and provided recommendations for future studies, including raising administrators' awareness of teachers' PD, involving teachers in decision-making processes, expanding research scope and duration, and implementing action research and classroom observations to enhance PD practices.

Ilhan (2017) conducted a study investigating graduate theses on Early Childhood Education at Middle East Technical University, Ankara. The research utilized document analysis to examine 32 Master's theses and 6 doctoral dissertations focused on the play concept. Descriptive statistics and frequencies were employed for data analysis, and findings were presented through frequency tables, highlighting descriptive and methodological aspects of the theses. The study revealed that students were the most frequently studied subject group across all theses, indicating Early Childhood Education as an interdisciplinary field. Education emerged as the primary focus in M.S. theses, while development was predominant in Ph.D. dissertations. The earliest thesis on this topic dates back to 1989, with the highest research activity observed in 2016. Quantitative methods were predominantly used in M.S. theses, with

mixed methods being the least favored. Conversely, in Ph.D. theses, mixed methods were the second most utilized after quantitative approaches. Additionally, while teachers were the second most common subject, studies primarily focused on employed educators. The study underscored the importance of both preservice and in-service teacher training, advocating for further research on prospective teachers.

Yılmaz (2017) from Yıldız Technical University conducted a study analyzing master's theses in educational administration from 1999 to 2015 to identify general research trends in the field. The investigation involved 63 accessible theses, revealing prevalent topics such as organizational behavior, management and school psychology, learning and teaching processes, administrative structures and processes, educational leadership, human resources management and education auditing, organizational culture and climate, school improvement and development, education economics and planning, and school-environment relationships. Questionnaires were the primary method of data collection, and statistical methods including frequency analysis, percentage calculation, averages, standard deviations, and t-tests were employed to examine the data. Nevertheless, it was found that the theses were weak in terms of generating novel ideas, offering comprehensive suggestions, and establishing theoretical frameworks that may directly impact decision-making in the field of educational sociology.

Cesur et al. (2018) examined the tendencies in research on English Language Teaching through a content analysis of the abstracts of publications found in the Turkish Journal Park Academic (DergiPark Akademik) platform. A qualitative research method was employed. The abstracts of the 234 articles that resulted were evaluated using a rubric. The data analysis included examining each section of the abstract, including the presence of an abstract, absence of information in the abstract, distribution of themes, availability of samples, distribution of samples, availability of sampling, and the type of sampling distribution. The results indicated that data analysis, type of sampling and research design were frequently not included in the papers. In addition, scholars in the field of ELT primarily focused on teacher education, curriculum development, teaching materials, and language instruction. The most common sample group consisted of undergraduates. The most commonly used sample types were purposive sampling and random sampling.

Demir (2020) examined 302 postgraduate studies (58 doctoral dissertations and 244 master's theses) focusing on foreign language teaching education in Türkiye from 1987 to 2017. The research aimed to analyze these studies based on various criteria including category, issue,

setting, university and institute, language, methodology, findings, interpretation, and conclusions. Methodology sections were particularly scrutinized, focusing on study technique/design, sample characteristics, and data collection instruments. The study revealed that common research designs/methods employed across these studies included qualitative, experimental, quantitative, survey-based, and mixed-method approaches. Notably, the study samples predominantly consisted of students, teachers, and documentary sources. Data collection instruments most frequently utilized were questionnaires, tests, interviews, and scales.

Yavuz et al. (2021) conducted a research to explore the trend of distance education research during the Covid-19 period using a thorough bibliometric and content analysis of 220 studies. The research primarily involved university students, lecturers, and teachers as participants, with surveys being the most common type of data collection. The analysis also emphasized the widespread use of quantitative-descriptive analysis.

Solmaz (2021) investigated educational technology research trends in English Language Teaching in Türkiye by analyzing 146 graduate theses from 2016 to 2020. The findings revealed a predominant focus on attitudinal studies, digital literacies, and 21st century skills within the theses. Commonly featured technologies included CALL resources, video-based materials, Web 2.0 tools, and learning management systems. Researchers frequently utilized mixed-methods approaches for data collection, with survey, interview, and achievement tests being common tools, and quantitative analysis methods were often employed. This study sheds light on the prevalent themes and methodologies in educational technology research within the context of ELT in Türkiye during the specified timeframe.

Demiral (2021) investigated postgraduate theses conducted in the field of ELT in Türkiye between 2015 and 2020 in terms of basic scientific research aspects. Using a descriptive research method with qualitative characteristics, master's and doctoral theses in English education were examined. A total of 202 theses obtained from CoHE National Thesis Center were analyzed. Findings indicate that the majority of theses focused on learning and teaching approaches and methods in English education. Random sampling was the most preferred sampling technique. The mixed research model was identified as the most preferred method in the studies. Among qualitative data analysis methods, the exploratory sequential method was found to be the most commonly used, while among quantitative data analysis methods, the t-test was the most preferred.

Another study by Doruk (2021) was conducted at Gazi University, Ankara, to provide a comprehensive overview of the research in the field of Social and Historical Foundations of Education. 94 theses written between 2002 and 2019 were examined making use of the content analysis method. Between the years 2002 and 2019, it was seen that the majority of thesis studies in the Department of Social and Historical Foundations of Education were conducted in 2010 and 2019. Additionally, the most commonly used research model in the theses was the survey model and purposive sampling is predominantly used in the theses. It was also found that the most popular research topic was The Social Foundations of Education with a percentage of 47.87. The next popular one was The Historical Foundations of Education with 28.72%, and The Philosophical Foundations of Education ranked third with 23.41%.

Erkal-Aksoy and Yılmaz (2021) investigated challenges faced by midwifery department academicians during the research process amid the Covid-19 pandemic. A total of 153 academicians participated in the descriptive research, with data collected online using a survey focusing on descriptive information and research process difficulties. Key findings revealed that 89.5% of academicians encountered issues during the research process, with the most common difficulties being related to article and thesis research. Additionally, a significant difference was observed between facing challenges and engaging in collaborative projects with international academicians, research planning, and using diverse research techniques. The study underscores the importance of addressing the obstacles encountered by academicians in planning and executing research activities during the pandemic, shedding light on the need for supportive environments and innovative approaches in the academic field.

Gürsoy and Özcan (2021) examined the current research trends in English Language Teaching in Türkiye by analyzing a total of 252 doctoral dissertations that were published from 2010 to 2020. A content analysis was performed on the titles and abstracts of the dissertations. Coding was done using a set of pre-established codes recommended by the relevant literature. Research findings indicate that teacher PD is the most prominent area of study, but Culture, Social, and Gender Issues have been identified as areas that have received less attention in research. Based on the findings, it is recommended that local researchers conduct additional research in specific areas.

The study conducted by Yurtseven-Yılmaz and Sever (2021) focused on analyzing the PD experiences of Turkish language teachers. Using a phenomenological approach, the researchers collected data through interviews with 38 Turkish language teachers in Bursa. The

findings revealed that while teachers were eager to participate in PD activities organized by the Ministry of National Education in Türkiye, their past experiences were not satisfactory. Teachers highlighted various aspects of PD, leading to recommendations for improvement. Overall, the study shed light on the perceptions, opinions, and expectations of Turkish language teachers regarding PD activities.

Öcel (2022) conducted a systematic analysis of master theses in English Language Education from 2019 to 2021. The study was carried out by analyzing the content of 806 master's theses and 128 doctorate theses. The main aim of the study is to analyze the methodological patterns followed by researchers before and after the pandemic and to find important differences in these theses. The findings suggest that the pandemic has had an impact on the research trends observed in both master's and doctoral theses, including a wide range of criteria such as research method, design, data collection instrument, data analysis, sampling method, sample group, sample size, and data analysis.

Öcel and Bergil's (2022) study aimed to compare the methodological aspects of postgraduate theses and dissertations in ELT between 2019 and 2021 in Türkiye, considering the influence of the Covid-19 pandemic on research practices. Using document analysis as a qualitative research method, they focused on content analysis to evaluate the methodology sections of 934 theses and dissertations. The findings indicated a prevalence of descriptive analyses, a lack of innovative and experimental studies, and infrequent use of multivariate analyses. The study emphasized the importance of researchers adapting to unforeseen circumstances by developing alternative research plans and providing support to maintain motivation during challenging times. Furthermore, the authors suggested further exploration of topics like topic selection, research settings, and reliability issues in postgraduate theses and dissertations in ELT.

Karadeniz' (2022) study aimed to conduct a meta-analysis of English language teaching master theses between 2010-2020 in Türkiye. The methodology involved analyzing numerous theses based on sample size, research methods, data collection tools, and data analysis procedures. Data analysis was done using a paper classification form, Microsoft Excel, and descriptive analysis. Key findings revealed a focus on descriptive studies using questionnaires with a quantitative approach, a preference for mixed methods research design, and the use of tools like questionnaires and interviews. The study emphasized the importance of further

research in areas such as attitude and perception studies, content analysis, and teacher training within the Turkish context of ELT.

Taşdemir and Karaman (2022) examined studies published between 2006 and 2020, shedding light on the evolving landscape of in-service teacher development. The study focuses on enhancing English language teacher PD through tailored and collaborative approaches. It underscores the importance of recognizing and addressing language teacher identities and language security issues, emphasizing the need for investments in content knowledge and language proficiency. Effective PD programs are suggested to incorporate active learning, cooperative participation, and sustainability while considering the diverse needs and contexts of English language teachers. The study employs meta-synthesis as a method to integrate qualitative research findings, offering a comprehensive understanding of research areas and their implications. Recommendations from the study include the implementation of strategies such as form-focused instruction, corrective feedback, dynamic assessment, and language-learning techniques to facilitate continuous development among English language teachers.

Atmaca and Ekşi (2023) reviewed master theses and doctoral dissertations in English Language Teaching in Türkiye from 2001 to 2020, analyzing themes, research design, participants, and data collection tools. Teaching methodology was the most studied theme, with less focus on language testing and assessment. Master theses favored quantitative research design, while doctoral dissertations preferred mixed methods. Tertiary level students were the main participants, documents were the primary data collection tool, and observation was least used. The study emphasized the need for qualitative research, suggested comparing national and international studies for cross-cultural insights, and aimed to enhance the field of English Language Teaching research.

Behbudova (2023) analyzed postgraduate theses on smart technology in foreign language education in Türkiye from 2012 to 2022. By examining 142 studies from the National Thesis Center database using content analysis and the MAXQDA program, the research identified computer technologies, mobile applications, reality and artificial intelligence, and multimedia tools as the main trends. The aim was to investigate the scope, content, trends, objectives, and results of these studies, revealing a preference for new techniques over traditional methods and advocating for their integration into education for better outcomes. The emphasis on technology was more pronounced at the university level than in preschool settings, indicating a need for further research in early education contexts.

Cansel İskender and Atar (2023) investigates the in-service education and training needs of English teachers in Türkiye through a meta-synthesis of relevant studies carried out between 2010-2021. The study utilizes content and thematic analysis to investigate the success of in-service training for EFL teachers. It also contributes to broader discussions on teachers' learning, status and working conditions. The results emphasize the importance of creating INSET programs that target specific needs of teachers, encourage the practical use of new techniques, and encourage cooperation between the Ministry of National Education and teacher educators to ensure successful implementation.

As previous studies show, there are many researchers all around the world that focus on specific research areas to analyze what other researchers have studied earlier as they intend to see the big picture. By doing so, they aimed to reveal research tendencies in their field as well as providing suggestions for future studies. When literature is viewed both in Türkiye and abroad, this type of research is more common to see in the fields of education management, mathematics, and science education as well as psychology and sociology. On the other hand, there are some theses on the National Theses Database in which previous studies in ELT have been investigated within a specific frame. Similarly, it is also possible to benefit from some articles related to English Language Teaching that the same intention and methodology were followed. However, there is no detailed research that specifically analyzes previous studies on the PD of English language teachers in Türkiye. As we can define the last twenty years as a time of rapid changes in every sense, observing the consequences of these changes in English language education is unavoidable, too. To be able to seek some suggestions for specific needs and problems, different studies have been conducted until today. Yet, the evolutionary process that ELT went through requires a detailed investigation into the research on PD of English language teachers. In this respect, this study aims to reveal researchers' tendencies on English language teachers' PD by examining postgraduate theses published between 2003 and 2022 in Türkiye.

CHAPTER 3

In this section, the methodology and design of the research will be provided. Details about the study group of the research, data collection tools and techniques to analyze the data, and information about the validity and reliability of the data analysis are given.

3. METHODOLOGY

This study adopts a qualitative research design. Yıldırım and Şimşek (2011) defines qualitative research as a study in which the qualitative process is followed, qualitative data collection techniques (observation, interview, document review) are used, cases and events are presented in their environment with a realistic and holistic approach. Qualitative research creates reality and allows the researcher to closely monitor events and phenomena and develop an engaging attitude. It begins with assumptions, a worldview, the possible use of a theoretical lens and the study of research problems inquiring into the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social or human problem (Creswell, 2007). Qualitative research, with an inductive approach, examines events and phenomena in their natural environment. Qualitative research is to describe and interpret the data obtained from the research. Therefore, a qualitative research approach was followed in this study since the researcher aims at revealing research tendencies in the field of English language teachers' PD by analyzing postgraduate theses in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022 that are accessible to users on CoHE National Thesis Center.

3.1. Research Design

Document analysis method was employed to examine postgraduate theses written in Turkish universities on the PD of English teachers in Türkiye. In certain fields of social science research, information cannot be collected through interviews or observations, so the data can also be reached by examining documents related to the field. Yıldırım and Şimşek (2011) point out that document analysis can be employed both independently and in combination with other data collection techniques. The approach to collecting data is associated with the state of a particular phenomenon during a specific period or the evolution of the phenomenon over time (Best and Khan, 2006). Document analysis, as defined by Ekiz (2009), is a method of data collection through which data is systematically analyzed in order to facilitate evaluation, particularly for qualitative research. A wide range of materials can serve as sources of information in document analysis, including academic studies, letters, autobiographies, records, reports, diaries, compositions, books, catalogs, movies, articles, photos, and cartoons.

During this process, it is crucial for a researcher to guarantee the validity and reliability of the acquired documents (Best and Khan, 2006). The objectivity of documents is crucial in document analysis method (İslamoğlu, 2011). Document analysis involves the analysis of written materials containing data about the phenomena and events to be studied. In educational research, document analysis is frequently utilized, which the researcher attempts to obtain a comprehensive picture by interpreting the obtained documents within a specific framework and correlating them with each other (Şimşek, 2009). Therefore, in this study, postgraduate theses to be examined were subjected to document analysis.

3.2. Sample of the Research

The study aims to examine postgraduate theses on the PD of English teachers published on the CoHE National Thesis Center. Criterion sampling, a subcategory of purposive sampling, was utilized in this study. Individuals, groups, or settings that meet the criteria are chosen for criterion sampling. According to Miles et al. (2014), this sample approach is frequently used for quality assurance purposes.

The scope of the research is limited with the criteria determined beforehand:

- studies conducted between 2003 and 2022 on the PD of in-service English teachers in Türkiye
- theses that are open to access on the CoHE National Thesis Center
- theses that can be reached through keywords “Professional Development”, “ELT” “EFL”, “English”, “In-service Training”, “Teacher Development”, “Inset”, “Teacher Training”, “Training Activities”, “Mentoring”, “ Observation”, “Reflection”, “Self-development”, “In-service Teacher Education”, “Development activities”

Theses regarding pre-service English language teacher education were not included in the study since the aim of the researcher is to reveal general tendencies in the research of experienced English teachers’ PD who already work actively. For this reason, criterion sampling was thought to be most appropriate for the purpose of this study.

Finally, the study group of the research consisted of 92 postgraduate theses published on the topic of English teachers’ PD in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022, which can be accessed through CoHE National Thesis Center. Although there were 103 theses on the topic, it was

observed that 11 of them were not accessible at the time of data collection process. Therefore, the theses that were not accessible were not included in the study.

3.3. Data Collection Tools and Techniques

In this study, the document analysis method was utilized as the data collection method. Document analysis is a data collection technique that aims at reaching data from existing records and documents (Karasar, 2018). Documents are defined as one of the primary sources of data collection in qualitative research, including public records, individual writings, popular culture documents, visual documents, physical materials, and artworks (Merriam, 2018). Since the theses published in CoHE National Thesis Center are considered documents, the document analysis method was employed utilizing CoHE database and Excel to collect and classify the data.

3.4. Data Collection Procedures

In the research, the theses to be used were collected from CoHE National Thesis Center Database using the "advanced search" button which enables limiting years and selecting a specific period for the theses published. In this study, theses between the years 2003 and 2022 were reached through search. First, a search was conducted using the keyword " Professional Development" combined with "ELT", "EFL" and "English" resulting in access to 82 postgraduate theses. Then, a search adding the keywords "in-service training", "teacher development" led to access to 35 more theses. Subsequently, other related keywords such as "inset", "teacher training", "training activities" "mentoring", "observation", "reflection", "self-development", "in-service teacher education", and "development activities" were used to identify theses that investigate English teachers' PD in Türkiye, even if the term "PD" was not explicitly mentioned in the title. In total, 236 theses were found as a result of all searches. The thesis search started in September 2023 and final folders of theses that are in the scope of this study were compiled in January 2024.

After filtering out the theses related to the PD of English teachers in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022, it was observed that 103 theses were within the scope of the research. However, it was found that 11 of these theses were not accessible. Since the content of these 11 theses could not be accessed, the study proceeded with the remaining 92 theses.

3.5. Data Analysis

In the study, overall tendencies in the PD of in-service English language teachers with varying years of experience in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022 were investigated. Therefore, descriptive analysis and content analysis methods were used together in the interpretation of the obtained data. Descriptive analysis was employed in the analysis of the methodology sections of the theses, while content analysis was utilized for the sections covering topics, findings, and recommendations. The descriptive analysis method aims to describe a given situation as comprehensively and carefully as possible. Content analysis, on the other hand, is defined as a systematic, replicable technique where certain words in a text are summarized into smaller content categories based on specific rules of coding (Büyüköztürk et al., 2018).

All theses accessed were downloaded and saved as PDF files and they were thoroughly examined, and the ones that do not fit the criteria were not considered within the scope of the study. Separate folders were created for each level of degree and then an Excel table was created for data classification depending on the inquiry of this research. These categories were designed in accordance with the research questions, so they helped the researcher classify the data. The theses were examined in terms of the years they were conducted, universities, institutes, language, levels of degree, research types, title of the supervisors, topics, sample groups, sample size, sampling techniques, number of sources of data, data collection tools, data analysis methods, research context, research context status, findings, and recommendations. All data regarding the theses were coded and listed in the Excel program. Subsequently, thematic and categorical analysis was conducted using the filtering feature to access themes and categories from the coded data. The postgraduate theses examined within the scope of the research were separately analyzed as master's and doctoral theses. The data are presented in tables. To provide a clear image of the results, the frequency and percentage values of the collected data were illustrated in tables.

In qualitative research, unlike other studies, validity and reliability are not emphasized as much, yet they are crucial aspects regarding data reliability. There are various methods to enhance credibility in the study. Among these, participant validation, long-term engagement, and expert review methods can be highlighted (Başkale, 2016). It is believed that proving the credibility of data analysis by qualitative researchers would also enhance the quality of the research.

It's possible for qualitative studies to misinterpret data or address insufficient results, risking credibility. One measure to ensure credibility is to request various experts in the field of qualitative research to critically examine the research from different perspectives. This method is referred to as expert review (Creswell, 2003; Creswell & Poth, 2018). Following this review, the expert critically examines the design of the research, analysis of the collected data, and the content of the findings providing feedback to the researcher. Two independent colleague-researchers who are outsider experts from the field are contacted to receive necessary judgments about the research. Then, expert review is conducted (Houser, 2015). In this context, to enhance the credibility of the research, two expert reviews were requested during the analysis conducted in the Excel program, and the analyses of the data were validated.



CHAPTER 4

4. FINDINGS

This chapter aims to present the findings of the current study which investigates postgraduate theses on the PD of English language teachers in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022. The results of the analysis for each research question are presented in separate tables through frequency and percentage values.

4.1. Distribution of Theses in terms of Degree

Table 1. shows the distribution of studies in terms of degree.

Table 1. Distribution of Theses in terms of Degree

Degree	<i>f</i>	%
Master	56	60.87
PhD	36	39.13
Total	92	100

The number of studies included in the research is shown in Table 1. The total number of theses investigated on the topic of PD of English language teachers in Türkiye is 92. While 36 of them (39.13%) were conducted as PhD theses, 56 theses (60.87%) were written at Master's level.

4.2. Distribution of Theses in terms of Universities

4.2.1. Distribution of master's theses in terms of universities

Table 2.1. displays the distribution of Master's theses in terms of universities.

Table 2.1. Distribution of Master's Theses in terms of Universities

University	<i>f</i>	%
Middle East Technical University	8	14.3
Bahçeşehir University	7	12.5
Yeditepe University	5	8.9
Bilkent University	4	7.1
Gazi University	4	7.1
Gaziantep University	4	7.1
Ufuk University	3	5.4
Başkent University	2	3.6
Boğaziçi University	2	3.6
Hacettepe University	2	3.6
Karadeniz Technical University	2	3.6
Çanakkale University	2	3.6

University	<i>f</i>	%
Çukurova University	2	3.6
Beykent University	1	1.8
Bursa Uludağ University	1	1.8
Dicle University	1	1.8
Dokuz Eylül University	1	1.8
Kocaeli University	1	1.8
Selçuk University	1	1.8
Süleyman Demirel University	1	1.8
Trakya University	1	1.8
İstanbul Aydın University	1	1.8
Total	56	100

Upon reviewing master's theses related to the PD of English teachers in Türkiye, it was found that research was conducted across 22 universities as illustrated in Table 2.1.. The university with the highest number of studies, constituting 14.3% of the total, was Middle East Technical University (METU), followed by Bahçeşehir University with 12.5%, and then Yeditepe University with 8.9%. Specifically, there were 8 studies conducted at METU, 7 at Bahçeşehir University, and 5 at Yeditepe University. On the other hand, nine universities which had only one thesis each, represent the lowest proportion. These universities are Beykent University, Uludağ University, Dicle University, Dokuz Eylül University, Kocaeli University, Selçuk University, Süleyman Demirel University, Trakya University, and Istanbul Aydın University.

4.2.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of universities

Table 2.2. displays the distribution of doctorate theses across universities.

Table 2.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Universities

University	<i>f</i>	%
Middle East Technical University	11	30.6
Gazi University	6	16.7
Çukurova University	6	16.7
Ankara University	2	5.6
Dokuz Eylül University	2	5.6
Eskişehir Anadolu University	2	5.6
Hacettepe University	2	5.6
Çanakkale University	2	5.6
Anadolu University	1	2.8
Yıldız Technical University	1	2.8
İstanbul Aydın University	1	2.8
Total	36	100

After analyzing the table containing data from 11 universities, it is evident that Middle East Technical University (METU) had the largest number of theses, with a total of 11 (30.6%). Gazi University and Çukurova University are tied for second place, with each university having completed 6 theses (16.7%) after METU. Only one thesis related to the issue was found at Istanbul Aydın University, Yıldız Technical University, and Anadolu University.

4.3. Distribution of Theses in terms of Institutes

4.3.1. Distribution of masters' theses in terms of institutes

Table 3.1. displays the distribution of master's theses in terms of institutes, indicating studies could relate to different areas.

Table 3.1. Distribution of Master's Theses in terms of Institutes

Institute	<i>f</i>	%
Educational sciences	25	44.6
Social sciences	24	42.9
Graduate school of education	5	8.9
Graduate school	1	1.8
Graduate studies	1	1.8
Total	56	100

Educational Sciences and Social Sciences are the most prevalent, comprising 25 (44.6%) and 24 (42.9%) of the research respectively. The Graduate School of Education, Graduate School, and Graduate Studies demonstrate smaller percentages of involvement.

4.3.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of institutes

Table 3.2. presents the distribution of Phd dissertations among 4 institutes, suggesting that the research could be related to varied areas.

Table 3.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Institutes

Institute	<i>f</i>	%
Educational sciences	15	41.7
Social sciences	18	50.0
Graduate studies	2	5.6
Natural and applied sciences	1	2.8
Total	36	100

The research is mostly focused on Social Sciences and Educational Sciences, which account for 18 (50%) and 15 (41.7%) of the total. Graduate studies and natural and applied

sciences exhibit lower levels of participation. A minor discrepancy has been observed when comparing the ranking of PhD dissertations with master's theses.

4.4. Distribution of Theses in terms of Years

4.4.1. Distribution of masters' theses in terms of years

The distribution of master's theses by year is presented in Table 4.1.

Table 4.1. Distribution of Master's theses in terms of Years

Year	<i>f</i>	%
2003	1	1.79
2006	1	1.79
2007	3	5.36
2008	1	1.79
2010	4	7.14
2011	6	10.71
2013	2	3.57
2014	2	3.57
2015	3	5.36
2016	2	3.57
2017	3	5.36
2018	2	3.57
2019	9	16.07
2020	5	8.93
2021	4	7.14
2022	8	14.29
Total	56	100

Upon examining studies, it can be seen that the highest number of theses were written in 2019. Following 9 theses (16.07%) written in 2019, 2022 takes the second place with 8 theses (14.29%). 2011 ranks third with 6 theses (10.71%). The years with the least number of theses conducted are 2003, 2006, and 2008, each with one thesis.

4.4.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of years

Table 4.2. presents the distribution of PhD dissertations across the years.

Table 4.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Years

Year	<i>f</i>	%
2004	2	5.56
2006	2	5.56
2007	1	2.78
2009	1	2.78
2011	1	2.78
2012	1	2.78

Year	<i>f</i>	%
2013	1	2.78
2015	2	5.56
2016	1	2.78
2017	3	8.33
2018	4	11.11
2019	6	16.67
2020	3	8.33
2021	4	11.11
2022	4	11.11
Total	36	100

The highest number of theses were conducted in the same year as master's theses, which is 2019. 6 (16.67%) theses were written in 2019. 2018, 2021 and 2022 are the years when 4 studies each were completed. It has been observed that in 2003, which this current study covers, no research on the topic was conducted at master's level.

4.5. Distribution of Theses in terms of Language

4.5.1. Distribution of masters' theses in terms of language

Table 5.1. presents the distribution of language in the master's theses conducted on the topic of PD of English teachers in Türkiye.

Table 5.1. Distribution of Master's Theses in terms of Language

Language	<i>f</i>	%
English	53	94.6
Turkish	3	5.4
Total	56	100

When these theses were investigated, it has been observed that 53(94.6%) of the studies at master's level were written in English. There are only 3(5.4%) theses in Turkish.

4.5.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of language

Table 5.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Language

Language	<i>f</i>	%
English	31	86.1
Turkish	5	13.9
Total	36	100

Reviewing PhD theses on the subject, as it can be seen in Table 5.2. it can be concluded that language utilized in 31(86.1%) PhD dissertations was English while there are 5(13.9%) studies written in Turkish. This shows the rate of using English in PhD dissertations is slightly lower compared to master's theses.

4.6. Distribution of Theses in terms of the Title of the Supervisors

4.6.1. Distribution of masters' theses in terms of the title of the supervisors

Table 6.1. shows the distribution of master's theses in terms of the title of their supervisors. When examining master's theses on the PD of English teachers, the titles of thesis supervisors have been categorized into five main headings.

Table 6.1. Distribution of Master's Theses in terms of the Title of the Supervisors

Title of the Supervisor	<i>f</i>	%
Prof. Dr.	8	14.3
Assoc. Prof. Dr.	12	21.4
Assist. Prof. Dr.	31	55.4
Dr.	4	7.1
Lect. Dr.	1	1.8
Total	56	100

It is observed that out of the total 56 theses, 31 (55.4%) theses were supervised by academics holding the title of Assistant Professor while 12 theses (21.4%) were supervised by academics with the title of Associate Professor. Following this, the third position is held by Professors who supervised 8 theses (14.3%). There is only one thesis supervised by Lect. Dr.

4.6.2. Distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of the title of the supervisors

Table 6.2. displays the distribution of PhD dissertations in terms of the title of their supervisors.

Table 6.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Title of the Supervisors

Title of the Supervisor	<i>f</i>	%
Prof. Dr.	17	47.2
Assoc. Prof. Dr.	13	36.1
Assist. Prof. Dr.	6	16.7
Total	36	100

The PhD dissertations on the PD of English teachers have been classified into three main groups based on the titles of the thesis supervisors. Of the 36 theses examined, 17 (47.2%) were supervised by professors, while 13 theses (36.1%) were managed by associate professors.

Furthermore, Assistant Professors, who carried out a total of 6 theses, occupy the third place with a percentage of 16.7%. Upon comparing master's theses and PhD dissertations, it may be inferred that there is a greater number of theses supervised by professors at the doctoral level.

4.7. Distribution of Methodology in the Theses

4.7.1. Distribution of methodology in masters' theses

The distribution findings of master's theses on the PD of English teachers according to their research types are presented in Table 7.1.

Table 7.1. Distribution of Master's Theses in terms of Research Types

Research Type	<i>f</i>	%
Mixed	23	41.1
Qualitative	20	35.7
Quantitative	11	19.6
Not Specified	2	3.6
Total	56	100

Examining the data, research types are categorized into three main headings as mixed, qualitative and quantitative research. There are two theses where the research model is not specified. The highest number of studies were conducted using a mixed-methods research with 23 (41.1%) theses. Mixed-methods research involves the combined use of both quantitative and qualitative research methods. Theses conducted using a qualitative research model rank second with 20 (35.7%) theses. The number of quantitative research studies is approximately half of the number of qualitative research studies. It was determined that 11 (19.6%) theses utilized quantitative research.

4.7.2. Distribution of methodology in PhD dissertations

Table 7.2. shows the distribution results of PhD dissertations on the PD of English teachers by research type.

Table 7.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Research Types

Research Type	<i>f</i>	%
Mixed	15	41.7
Qualitative	20	55.6
Quantitative	1	2.8
Total	36	100

After analyzing the data, research models can be divided into three primary categories as qualitative, mixed and quantitative. With 20 (55.6%) theses, qualitative research was used in the greatest number of investigations. With 15 (41.7%) theses, mixed method design comes in second place. It was found that only one (2.8%) thesis made use of quantitative research. It is obvious that use of qualitative research is more common at doctoral level compared to master's level.

4.8. Distribution of Sampling Methods in the Theses

4.8.1. Distribution of sampling methods in masters' theses

Sampling methods of master's theses related to the PD of English teachers are presented in Table 8.1. below.

Table 8.1. Distribution of Sampling Methods in Master's Theses

Research Type	Sampling Method	<i>f</i>	%
Mixed	Purposive sampling	11	42.3
	Convenience sampling	9	34.6
	Random sampling	2	7.7
	Snowball sampling	2	7.7
	Not Specified	1	3.8
	Voluntary sampling	1	3.8
Total		26	100
Qualitative	Purposive sampling	9	40.9
	Convenience sampling	5	22.7
	Not Specified	4	18.2
	Maximum variation sampling	2	9.1
	Voluntary sampling	2	9.1
Total		22	100
Quantitative	Convenience sampling	8	72.7
	Not Specified	2	18.2
	Purposive sampling	1	9.1
Total		11	100

Upon reviewing the table, it is observed that purposive sampling and convenience sampling are predominantly preferred in the majority of the research. When examining the specified sampling methods, purposive sampling is most commonly utilized in mixed-methods research (42.3%) and qualitative research (40.9%). Additionally, upon reviewing the overall picture, it is noted that convenience sampling is frequently used in quantitative research (72.7%). It can also be inferred that researchers may lack sufficient information regarding the sample selection methods in the theses where the sampling method is not specified.

4.8.2. Distribution of sampling methods in PhD dissertations

Table 8.2. presents the sampling techniques used in PhD dissertations regarding English teachers' PD.

Table 8.2. Distribution of Sampling Methods in PhD Dissertations

Research Type	Sampling Method	<i>f</i>	%
Mixed	Purposive sampling	6	28.6
	Convenience sampling	6	28.6
	Snowball sampling	1	4.8
	Not Specified	5	23.8
	Group sampling	1	4.8
	Systematic sampling	1	4.8
	Voluntary sampling	1	4.8
Total		21	100
Qualitative	Purposive sampling	10	40.0
	Convenience sampling	7	28.0
	Not Specified	2	8.0
	Maximum variation sampling	4	16.0
	Snowball sampling	2	8.0
Total		25	100
Quantitative	Snowball sampling	1	100
Total		1	100

Examining through the table, it is clear that convenience and purposeful sampling are favored in most studies. Convenience sampling and purposive sampling approaches have the greatest rates (28.6%) among the stated sampling techniques in mixed-method research, whereas purposive sampling is the most frequently used method in qualitative studies (40.0%). One research that used quantitative methods employed snowball sampling. 7 out of 36 theses did not specify their sampling methods.

4.9. Distribution of Sample Groups in the Theses

4.9.1. Distribution of sample groups in masters' theses

Table 9.1. shows the distribution of sampling groups in master's theses.

Table 9.1. Distribution of Sample Groups in Master's Theses

Sample Group	<i>f</i>	%
EFL teachers	48	85.7
EFL teachers+PDU members	2	3.6
EFL teachers + teacher trainers	1	1.8
EFL teacher educators	1	1.8
EFL teachers+PDU members+directors	1	1.8
EFL teachers+directors	1	1.8
EFL teachers+students+directors+documents	1	1.8

Sample Group	<i>f</i>	%
Master's students	1	1.8
Total	56	100

48 theses (87.5%) were conducted with only EFL teachers according to the table, which takes almost the half of the total number of studies. There are 2 studies (3.6%) at master's level that included EFL teachers and PD unit members together. There is one thesis each that has worked with EFL teacher educators and master's students. EFL teachers, PDU members and directors were included in one study together, and another study was conducted with EFL teachers and directors. In another thesis, documents were included in the research as well as EFL teachers, students and directors.

4.9.2. Distribution of sample groups in PhD dissertations

Table 9.2. shows the distribution of sample groups in PhD dissertations.

Table 9.2. Distribution of Sample Groups in PhD Dissertations

Sample Group	<i>f</i>	%
EFL teachers	22	61.1
EFL teachers+students	2	5.6
EFL teachers+teacher trainers	2	5.6
EFL teacher educators+mentor teachers+students	1	2.8
EFL teachers+directors	1	2.8
EFL teachers+students+directors	1	2.8
EFL teachers+students+directors+faculty members+teacher trainers	1	2.8
EFL teachers+teacher trainers+directors	1	2.8
EFL teachers+teacher trainers+faculty members	1	2.8
EFL teachers+teacher trainers+students	1	2.8
Comenius assistants	1	2.8
Teacher educators+teacher educator candidates	1	2.8
Teacher trainers	1	2.8
Total	36	100

Examining Table 4.9.2. it can be concluded that 22 PhD dissertations were carried out with only EFL teachers, which corresponds to more than half of the studies (61.1%). EFL teachers and students were included together in 2 studies while the number is the same for a combination of EFL teachers and teacher trainers. There are also theses that included directors with EFL teachers, students and teacher trainers. One thesis was conducted with only Comenius assistants, and there is also one study that was carried out only with teacher trainers at doctoral level.

4.10. Distribution of Sample Size in the Theses

4.10.1. Distribution of sample size in masters' theses

Table 10.1. presents the distribution of sample size in master's theses.

Table 10.1. Distribution of Master's Theses in terms of Sample Size

Sample Size	<i>f</i>	%
Between 1-10	12	21.4
Between 11-30	12	21.4
Between 31-100	13	23.2
Between 101-300	17	30.4
Between 301-1000	1	1.8
Over 1000	1	1.8
Total	56	100

Sample size in 17 theses (30.4%) was between 101 and 300, which is the greatest category. 13 theses were conducted with participants between 31 and 100 in the second place (23.2%). There are 12 theses with sample size between 11 and 30 (21.4%). The number is the same for sample size 1 and 10, which includes the smallest number of participants. These studies were usually conducted as case studies with lower number of participants. There is only one study utilized sample size between 301 and 1000. Finally, the highest number of participants was observed in one study with a sample size of over 1000.

4.10.2. Distribution of sample size in PhD dissertations

Sample sizes in PhD dissertations were displayed in Table 10.2.

Table 10.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of Sample Size

Sample Size	<i>f</i>	%
Between 1-10	11	30.6
Between 11-30	4	11.1
Between 31-100	4	11.1
Between 101-300	9	25.0
Between 301-1000	7	19.4
Over 1000	1	2.8
Total	36	100

As it can be concluded from the data, the highest number corresponds to sample size between 1 and 10 in 11 theses (30.6%). There are 9 theses employed sample size between 101-300 in the second place(25%), and the number of theses with sample size 301-100 is 7 in the

third place. Similar to what was concluded from the data of the master’s theses, there is only one study that employed the biggest sample size, over 1000.

4.11. Distribution of Number of Data Sources in the Theses

4.11.1. Distribution of number of data sources in masters’ theses

Table 11.1 displays the distribution of master’s theses in terms of the number of data sources.

Table 11.1. Distribution of Master’s Theses in terms of the Number of Data Sources

Number of Data Sources	<i>f</i>	%
1	16	28.6
2	21	37.5
3 or more	19	33.9
Total	56	100

As it can be inferred from Table 11.1, a total number of 21 master’s theses (37.5%) utilized two sources of data in their research, which is the most common among studies investigated. There are 19 theses (33.9%) that were conducted with three or more sources of data. One source of data ranks third with 16 theses (28.6%).

4.11.2. Distribution of number of data sources in PhD dissertations

Table 11.2 indicates that 41 PhD dissertations (66.7%) used three or more sources of data while conducting their research, which constitutes the majority of the studies.

Table 11.2. Distribution of PhD Dissertations in terms of the Number of Data Sources

Number of Data Sources	<i>f</i>	%
1	3	8.3
2	9	25.0
3 or more	24	66.7
Total	36	100

Nine theses (25.0%) used two sources of data in their research. One data source comes in third place with 3 theses (8.3%). It can be concluded that there are more theses that utilized three or more sources of data at doctoral level compared to master’s level.

4.12. Distribution of Data Collection Tools

4.12.1. Distribution of data collection tools in masters' theses

The data presented in Table 12.1 of the master's theses illustrates that a total of 133 data collection tools were utilized in the investigations.

Table 12.1. Distribution of Data Collection Tools in Master's Theses

Data Collection Tool	<i>f</i>	%
Interview	48	36.1
Questionnaire	39	29.3
Observation	8	6.0
Documents	5	3.8
Field notes	5	3.8
Reflective journal	5	3.8
Scale	5	3.8
Diary	4	3.0
Meetings	4	3.0
Audio-visual materials	2	1.5
Reflection sheets	2	1.5
Reflective essays	2	1.5
Artifacts	2	1.5
Personal info form	1	0.8
Reflection forms	1	0.8
Total	133	100

Among these, the most prominently employed data collection tool was the interviews, constituting 36.1% of the total, followed by the questionnaire method at a rate of 29.3%. Upon comprehensive examination of the table, it becomes evident that several additional data collection tools such as observations, documents, field notes, reflective journals, scales, diaries, meetings, audio-visual materials, reflection sheets, reflective essays, artifacts, personal information forms, and reflection forms were also employed in the master's theses to for their research purposes.

4.12.2. Distribution of data collection tools in PhD dissertations

The data collection instruments for PhD dissertations are provided in Table 12.2.

Table 12.2. Distribution of Data Collection Tools in PhD dissertations

Data Collection Tool	<i>f</i>	%
Interview	32	29.1
Questionnaire	22	20.0
Observation	7	6.4
Documents	16	14.5
Field Notes	6	5.5

Data Collection Tool	<i>f</i>	%
Reflective journal	2	1.8
Scale	2	1.8
Diary	7	6.4
Meetings	4	3.6
Audio-visual materials	3	2.7
Reflection sheets	1	0.9
Evaluation forms	5	4.5
Repertory grid	2	1.8
Checklist	1	0.9
Total	110	100

110 data collection tools were employed in the studies in total. Upon examining the data, it is observed that interviews are ranked first (29.1%), followed by questionnaires in second place (20.0%). Documents rank third with a proportion of 14.5%. Documents have been utilized more in doctoral theses compared to master's theses. Among the other instruments used for data collection in doctoral theses are diaries, observations, field notes, evaluation forms, meetings, audio-visual materials, reflective journals, scales, repertory grids, checklists, and reflection sheets. Personal information forms and artifacts, which are utilized in master's theses, are not present in the data collection instruments for doctoral research.

4.13. Distribution of Data Analysis

4.13.1. Distribution of data analysis in masters' theses

Table 13.1 shows the distribution of data analysis types in master's theses.

Table 13.1. Distribution of Data Analysis in Master's Theses

Data Analysis	<i>f</i>	%
Qualitative	44	41.9
Descriptive	41	39.0
Predictive	20	19.0
Total	105	100

There were mainly three analysis types, and these can be listed as qualitative, descriptive and predictive analysis. They were utilized either individually or in combination with another analysis type in the investigations. The total number of analysis utilized in the studies is 105. Qualitative analysis was utilized in 41.9% of the research with the highest rate, while descriptive analysis comes in second place with a rate of 39.0%. Additionally, predictive analysis consists of 19.0% of the analysis types used in the theses.

4.13.2. Distribution of data analysis in PhD dissertations

The distribution of data analysis types in PhD dissertations is displayed in Table 13.2.

Table 13.2. Distribution of Data Analysis in PhD Dissertations

Data Analysis	<i>f</i>	%
Qualitative	38	59.4
Descriptive	18	28.1
Predictive	8	12.5
Total	64	100

Qualitative, descriptive, and predictive analysis might be considered the three main categories of analysis as it was for master's theses. In the investigations, they were used solely or in together with another form of analysis. A total of 64 analyses were used in the research. The biggest percentage of research (59.4%) instrumented qualitative analysis. Descriptive analysis ranks second with a rate of 28.1%. Finally, 12.5% of the analysis types employed in the theses fall in the category of predictive analysis type in nature.

4.14. Distribution of Research Settings in the Theses

4.14.1. Distribution of research settings in masters' theses

The distribution of research settings in master's theses is presented in Table 14.1.

Table 14.1. Distribution of Research Settings in Master's Theses

Research Setting	<i>f</i>	%
University	26	46.4
Different levels of schools	5	8.9
Primary school	5	8.9
Primary+Secondary+High school	4	7.1
Not specified	3	5.4
Primary+Secondary school	3	5.4
Different levels of K-12	1	1.8
High school	1	1.8
High school+University	1	1.8
K1-4	1	1.8
Nursery+Primary+High school+University	1	1.8
Primary+High school+University	1	1.8
Primary+Secondary school+University	1	1.8
Primary+Secondary+High school+University	1	1.8
Secondary school	1	1.8
Turkish armed forces	1	1.8
Total	56	100

When master's theses written on the topic of the PD of English teachers in Türkiye were investigated in terms of their research settings, it can be clearly observed in Table 14.1. that the majority of research was conducted at university context. There are 26 theses in first place at university context with a rate of 46.4%. On the other hand, there are 5 theses which explain their research settings as "different levels of schools". The number of related research is the same for primary schools (5), which corresponds to 8.9% of the studies. In 4 studies primary school, secondary school and high school are employed together as research setting while in 3 studies research setting is not specified. The other categories where there is only one thesis each are as follows : different levels of K-12 education, high school, a combination of high school and university, K1-4, a combination of nursery, primary, high school and university, a combination of primary school, high school and university, a combination of primary school, secondary school, high school and university, secondary school and finally Turkish armed forces. As it can be concluded from the data, English teachers in university context occupies the biggest proportion as an area of interest in research either solely or in combination with other research settings in master's theses.

4.14.2. Distribution of research settings in PhD dissertations

Table 14.2. displays the distribution of research settings in PhD dissertations.

Table 14.2. Distribution of Research Settings in PhD Dissertations

Research Setting	<i>f</i>	%
University	17	47.2
Different levels of schools	6	16.7
Primary+Secondary+High school	4	11.1
Secondary school	2	5.6
Different levels of K-12	1	2.8
High school	1	2.8
Non-formal education	1	2.8
Primary school	1	2.8
Primary+Secondary school+University	1	2.8
Primary+Secondary+High school+University	1	2.8
Secondary+High school	1	2.8
Total	36	100

Similar to the conclusion drawn in master's theses, university ranks first among research settings for PhD dissertations with 17 theses (47.2%). 6 (16.7%) researchers defined their research settings as "different levels of schools" as the number was 5 for this category for master's theses. Other research settings where the studies were carried out are primary,

secondary and high schools. Also, different from master's theses' research settings, there is one research conducted in non-formal education setting.

4.15. Distribution of Research Setting Status in the Theses

4.15.1. Distribution of research setting status in masters' theses

Table 15.1 presents the distribution of research setting status for master's theses.

Table 15.1. Distribution of Research Setting Status in Master's Theses

Research Setting Status	<i>f</i>	%
Private	21	37.5
Both	15	26.8
Public	15	26.8
Not specified	5	8.9
Total	56	100

According to the data obtained from the investigation, theses were frequently carried out in private institutions. While there are 21 studies (37.5%) conducted in private institutions, 15 studies (26.8%) utilized both private and public institutions in their research. There are 15 theses in which only public schools were investigated. Finally, information regarding research setting status is not provided in 5 of the theses (8.9%).

4.15.2. Distribution of research setting status in PhD dissertations

Table 15.2. displays the distribution of research setting status for PhD dissertations.

Table 15.2. Distribution of Research Setting Status in PhD Dissertations

Research Setting Status	<i>f</i>	%
Private	7	19.4
Both	8	22.2
Public	18	50.0
Not specified	3	8.3
Total	36	100

The data obtained from the investigation reveals that the majority of theses were conducted in public institutions, different from the findings of master's theses. Out of the total studies, 18 (50.0%) were carried out in public institutions, while 8 (22.2%) utilized both private and public institutions. There were 15 theses that solely focused on public schools. Lastly, information related to research setting status was not mentioned in three of the theses (8.3%).

4.16. Distribution of Subjects in the Theses

4.16.1. Distribution of subjects in masters' theses

After examining master's theses on the PD of English teachers in Türkiye, it is apparent that the themes can be classified into eight distinct categories in Table 16.1. as shown below.

Table 16.1. Distribution of Subjects in Master's Theses

Categories	Themes	<i>f</i>	%
PD Activities	Doing master's degree	2	9.5
	Conducting action research	2	9.5
	Teacher portfolio	2	9.5
	CELTA	1	4.8
	Critical friends group	1	4.8
	Keeping diaries	1	4.8
	Mentoring	1	4.8
	Motivation towards online PD	1	4.8
	Online PD during remote teaching	1	4.8
	Online PD options	1	4.8
	Online mentoring group	1	4.8
	Online reflective teaching	1	4.8
	Peer coaching	1	4.8
	Peer observation	1	4.8
	Reflective practice groups	1	4.8
	Teacher research	1	4.8
Team teaching	1	4.8	
Webinars	1	4.8	
Total		21	100
Teachers' Perspectives	In-service training	4	33.3
	PD	3	25.0
	Self-initiated PD	2	16.7
	PD and identity construction	1	8.3
	PD and self efficacy	1	8.3
	Effects of Covid-19 pandemic on their needs	1	8.3
Total		12	100
Needs and Preferences of Teachers	PD	2	28.6
	Effect of teachers' learning styles	1	14.3
	In-service training	1	14.3
	In-service training of EFL teachers in K1-4	1	14.3
	In-service training of primary school EFL teachers	1	14.3
	PD needs of EFL instructors in university context	1	14.3
	Total		7
Training/Devepment Programs	Universty instructors	2	40.0
	Implementation of NLP	1	20.0
	Teaching speaking skills	1	20.0
	Turish Air Force EFL teachers	1	20.0
Total		5	100

Categories	Themes	<i>f</i>	%
Participation in PD	Factors affecting teachers' PD	1	33.3
	Personal factors	1	33.3
	Teacher burnout	1	33.3
Total		3	100
Teachers' Learning Through PD	Effects of PD on teachers' classroom practices	1	33.3
	Effects of in-service education on teacher efficacy and reflective thinking	1	33.3
	Novice EFL teachers of young learners	1	33.3
Total		3	100
Technology	Teachers' ICT needs	1	33.3
	Use of ICT for high school teachers	1	33.3
	Use of ICT for self-directed PD	1	33.3
Total		3	100
Teacher Trainers/Educators	Evaluation of PD unit	1	50.0
	PD of teacher educators	1	50.0
Total		2	100

The category with the greatest number of theses, consisting of 21 studies, is PD activities. A wide range of PD activities were investigated in these studies from action research to master's degree. Additional PD activities studied in this category were teacher portfolio, CELTA, critical friends group, diaries, mentoring, online PD activities, reflective practices, peer coaching, peer observation, teacher research, team teaching and webinars. The next category, consisting of 12 theses, is teachers' perspectives, which delves into the ideas held by educators regarding different subjects. Most studied areas in this category were teachers' perspectives about in-service trainings, PD, and self initiated PD. Identity construction and PD relationship, teachers' self-efficacy beliefs and PD relationship and effects of Covid-19 pandemic were also investigated in line with teachers' perspectives. The third most studied category is teachers' needs and preferences, with 7 theses focused on this topic. Also, there are 5 theses that specifically address training and development programs, and 3 theses that particularly examine instructors' participation in PD activities. In addition, there are 3 theses that focus on the issue of teachers' learning through PD, 3 on technology-related subjects, and 2 theses that concentrate on teacher trainers/educators.

4.16.2. Distribution of subjects in PhD dissertations

Table 16.2 illustrates the distribution of subjects in PhD dissertations.

Table 16.2. Distribution of Subjects in PhD Dissertations

Categories	Themes	<i>f</i>	%
Training/Development Programs	Assessment	1	7.1
	Developing intercultural competence	1	7.1
	Developing teachers' actional competence	1	7.1
	Fostering learner autonomy	1	7.1
	Implementation of NLP	1	7.1
	Improving language learning strategies of students	1	7.1
	Improving teachers' technopedagogical skills	1	7.1
	Non-formal education	1	7.1
	Professional skills	1	7.1
	Students' affective barriers	1	7.1
	Teacher behaviors and student engagement	1	7.1
	Teaching young learners	1	7.1
	Testing speaking skills	1	7.1
Universty instructors	1	7.1	
Total		14	100
PD Activities	Lesson study	3	30.0
	Action research	2	20.0
	Comenius assistantship	1	10.0
	Critical friends group	1	10.0
	Online professional learning	1	10.0
	Self development models	1	10.0
	Team teaching	1	10.0
Total		10	100
Needs and Preferences of Teachers	In-service training	2	50.0
	PD	1	25.0
	PD needs of EFL instructors in university context	1	25.0
Total		4	100
Teacher Trainers/Educators	Characteristics of English language teacher educators	1	33.3
	PD program for prospective teacher educators	1	33.3
	Professional identities and experiences of trainers	1	33.3
Total		3	100
Teachers' Perspectives	PD	2	66.7
	PD and research attitudes	1	33.3
Total		3	100
Teachers' Learning Through PD	In-service teacher education and staff development	1	100
Total		1	100
Technology	Web-based instruction	1	100
Total		1	100

It can be seen that 36 doctoral theses are grouped under 7 main headings in terms of their subjects. The category with the highest number of studies, including 14 theses, is training/development programs. Each thesis under this heading focuses on different aspects regarding training/development programs. Some of these include evaluation of programs, developing intercultural competence, developing actional competence, fostering learner autonomy, implementation of Neuro Linguistic Programming (NLP) in training programs, and programs addressing teachers' technopedagogical skills. There are 10 theses written under the title PD activities, which is approximately half of the number of master's theses written on this topic. In this category, the most frequently studied themes are lesson study and action research. The topic of needs and preferences of teachers ranks third, with a total of 4 theses. Other categories include research on teacher trainers/educators, teachers' perspectives, teachers' learning, and technology.

4.17. Distribution of Results in the Theses

4.17.1. Distribution of results in master's theses

Table 17.1. displays the distribution of results in master' theses.

Table 17.1. Distribution of Results in Master's Theses

Categories	Details of Results	<i>f</i>	%
In terms of content	Addressing specific needs	9	3.6
	Not being motivating	7	2.8
	No allignment with teachers' needs	4	1.6
	Lack of practicality	3	1.2
In terms of execution of PD	Found effective	17	6.7
	Increase in collaborative activities	13	5.1
	Continuous PD	6	2.4
	Lack of feedback and evaluation after trainings	5	2.0
	A need for need analysis	2	0.8
	Insufficient length of the program	2	0.8
	Positive impact of evaluation and feedback after trainings	2	0.8
In terms of teachers	Positive impact on teachers' PD	22	8.7
	Increase in awareness	19	7.5
	Increase in communication among colleagues	14	5.5
	Increase in motivation	12	4.7
	Positive attitude towards PD	12	4.7
	Positive effects of reflective practices	12	4.7
	Lack of motivation	10	4.0
	A need for collaboration	6	2.4
	Factors determining needs	6	2.4
	Challenges faced by teachers	5	2.0

Categories	Details of Results	<i>f</i>	%
	Factors determining preferences	5	2.0
	Further training needs in some areas	4	1.6
	Increase in self-efficacy beliefs	4	1.6
	Common PD preferences of teachers	3	1.2
	Effective teacher learning	3	1.2
	Improved language skills	3	1.2
	Interest in self-directed PD	2	0.8
	Limited knowledge about PD opportunities.	2	0.8
	Low self-efficacy beliefs	2	0.8
	No encouragement for further PD	2	0.8
	Positive impact of continuous support and guidance	2	0.8
	No significant impact on perceptions	1	0.4
In terms of teaching	Positive impact on classroom practices	21	8.3
	Teachers' willingness in practicing new information in their context	2	0.8
	No impact on classroom practices	1	0.4
Other		8	3.2
Total		253	100

After thoroughly analyzing the results of the theses conducted on the PD of English instructors in Türkiye, the findings may be divided into four main categories in master's theses. Additionally, 8 results do not fit into any of these categories. Finally, a total of 253 results have been recorded.

The category with the greatest number of results relates to "the results in terms of teachers". The analysis of 22 theses (8.7%) in this category has indicated that PD activities positively impacted instructors. Through the examination of 19 theses, it has been found that engaging in these activities enhances teachers' awareness. Based on the findings of 14 theses (7.5%), PD programs have improved communication among teachers. In addition, there are 12 theses (5.5%), each stating that PD activities enhance teacher motivation, and promote positive attitudes towards PD among teachers. Moreover, 12 other studies (5.5%) emphasized the beneficial impact of reflective practices on teachers.

The next category with the highest number is the results "in terms of execution of PD. Depending on the data obtained, it is clear that the execution of the PD activities was found effective in 17 theses (6.7%). Also, 13 results (5.1%) emphasized that PD activities led to more collaborative activities. Additionally, 6 theses (2.4%) highlighted the importance of continuous nature of PD activities.

Some of the results can be categorized as “in terms of teaching”. 24 theses clearly emphasized outcomes of PD activities related to teaching practices of teachers in their classrooms. According to 21 results (8.3%), PD activities had positive impacts on teachers’ practices in their context. In two studies it was observed that teachers’ willingness to practice new information in their context has increased. On the other hand, in one study, PD activity did not contribute to teachers’ classroom practices.

Finally, some results address the content of PD activities. It was reported that the content of PD addresses teachers’ specific needs in 9 theses (3.6%). However, 7 results (2.8%) indicate that the content of PD activities was not found motivating. 4 results show that there was no alignment with teachers’ needs in PD content. Lastly, lack of practicality in content of PD activities was reported as a deficiency in 3 theses (1.2%).

4.17.2. Distribution of results in PhD dissertations

Table 17.2 presents the distribution of results in PhD dissertations on the topic of PD of English teachers.

Table 17.2. Distribution of Results in PhD Dissertations

Categories	Details of the Results	<i>f</i>	%
In terms of content	No alignment with teachers' needs	4	3.4
	Lack of practicality	2	1.7
	Practical and applicable content	2	1.7
	Not being motivating	1	0.9
	Not being sufficient	1	0.9
	Not being up-to date	1	0.9
	Not having variety	1	0.9
	Overloaded content	1	0.9
In terms of execution of PD	Increase in collaboration	6	5.1
	Addressing specific needs	3	2.6
	Increase in knowledge share	3	2.6
	Found effective	2	1.7
	Increase in interaction	2	1.7
	Increase in reflexivity	2	1.7
	Lack of reflection	2	1.7
	Needs met	2	1.7
	Challenges faced by teacher trainers	1	0.9
	Effective features of teacher educators	1	0.9
	Focus on continuous support or monitoring after trainings	1	0.9
	Increase in feedback	1	0.9
	Lack of evaluation	1	0.9
Lack of feedback	1	0.9	
No encouragement for further PD	1	0.9	

Categories	Details of the Results	<i>f</i>	%
	No focus on continuous support or monitoring after trainings	1	0.9
	Not being systematic	1	0.9
	Promoting critical thinking	1	0.9
	Significance of collaborative PD approaches	1	0.9
	Significance of targeted training	1	0.9
	Sufficient length of the program	1	0.9
	Positive impact on teachers' PD	10	8.5
	Increase in awareness	7	6.0
	A need for training	6	5.1
	Positive change in teachers' view	5	4.3
	Increase in motivation	4	3.4
	Limited knowledge among teachers	3	2.6
	Continuous PD	2	1.7
	Challenges faced by teachers	1	0.9
In terms of teachers	Factors affecting preferences	1	0.9
	Factors determining needs	1	0.9
	Hands-on, active engagement	1	0.9
	Improved language skills	1	0.9
	Increase in self-efficacy beliefs	1	0.9
	Lack of motivation	1	0.9
	Positive attitude towards PD	1	0.9
	Positive impact on self directed PD	1	0.9
	Promoting autonomy	1	0.9
	Significance of active, applied learning	1	0.9
	Positive impact on classroom practices	8	6.8
In terms of teaching	No impact on teaching practices	1	0.9
	Significance of Communicative Language Teaching	1	0.9
Other		11	9.4
Total		117	100

117 results in total have been reached after analyzing the studies, and these results were grouped in four categories as in terms of content, in terms of execution of PD, in terms of teachers, and in terms of teaching. There are also 11 theses that could not be mentioned under any of these headings.

The most frequently reported result, which relates to teachers, is that PD activities had a positive impact on teachers' PD according to 10 theses (8.5%). Also, in the same category, 7 results (6.0%) indicate that an increase in awareness among teachers or administrators has been observed as a consequence of PD activities. 6 studies (5.1%) revealed a need for training among teachers, and 5 studies (4.3%) resulted in a positive change in teachers' view.

In terms of execution of PD, an increase in collaboration has been observed as a result of the PD activity in 6 studies (5.1%). In 3 studies (2.6%) teachers' specific needs were addressed. Also, an increase in knowledge share among teachers during PD activities was presented as a positive result in 3 studies (2.6%). As further positive results, teachers needs were met in 2 studies (1.7%), 2 studies (1.7%) revealed PD activities were found effective, an increase in interaction was observed in 2 research (1.7%) as well as an increase in reflexivity in 2 studies (1.7). On the other hand, lack of feedback, reflection and evaluation were reported as three other deficiencies that hinder successful execution of PD activities.

When it comes to content related results of PhD dissertations, 4 (3.4%) researchers reported there was no alignment with teachers' needs. Besides, 2 theses (1.7%) revealed that the content of trainings lacked practicality, which means there was an imbalance between theory and practice. Similarly, in 2 other studies (1.7%) teachers could not find practical and applicable content to enable them to bring solutions to their problems in their context, which supports the previously mentioned results. Some other problems with content of PD activities were reported as not being motivating, not being sufficient, not being up-to-date and not having variety. Lastly, overloaded content in one study was presented as a point to consider.

10 results were categorized as related to teaching. 8 studies (6.8%) reached the conclusion that PD activities had positive impacts on classroom practices. On the other hand, one study reported that PD activity did not have a positive effect on classroom practices. Finally, one study highlighted the importance of Communicative Language Teaching in learning.

4.18. Distribution of Suggestions in the Theses

4.18.1. Distribution of suggestions in master's theses

Suggestions offered in master's theses on the topic of PD of English teachers in Türkiye were presented in Table 18.1.

Table 18.1. Distribution of Suggestions in Master's Theses

Suggestions	Details of Suggestions	<i>f</i>	%
For effective PD planning	Planning tailored activities	22	6.2
	Promoting collaborative activities	21	5.9
	Encouraging active participation and engagement	14	3.9
	Conducting a comprehensive needs analysis	12	3.4
	Considering students' needs and interests	11	3.1
	Evaluating effectiveness of PD activities	11	3.1
	Planning targeted interventions	11	3.1

Suggestions	Details of Suggestions	<i>f</i>	%
	Providing flexible PD options	9	2.5
	Raising administrators' awareness	9	2.5
	Incorporating technology tools and online platforms	4	1.1
	Reviewing and updating training programs	4	1.1
	Planning the length of the trainings well	1	0.3
For future research	Conducting more research to explore impacts	16	4.5
	Implementing the study in a different context with different participants	12	3.4
	Conducting longitudinal studies	5	1.4
	Enriching data collection types	3	0.8
	Including students in research	3	0.8
For PD content	Balancing between theory and practice	12	3.4
	Providing useful activities that are applicable in teachers' classrooms	9	2.5
For teachers' further development	Encouraging teachers to engage in PD activities	23	6.4
	Encouraging reflective activities	21	5.9
	Encouraging collaboration	17	4.8
	Encouraging systematic participation	17	4.8
	Providing continuous support and guidance	16	4.5
	Continuing life-long learning	15	4.2
	Increasing motivation	12	3.4
	Providing opportunities to implement new knowledge	7	2.0
	Encouraging self-driven PD	6	1.7
	Providing resources	5	1.4
	Improving teachers' work conditions	4	1.1
	Providing institutional support	4	1.1
	Increasing sense of belonging and personalisation opportunities	2	0.6
	Providing opportunities for emotional support	1	0.3
Other		18	5.0
Total		357	100

Suggestions made were categorized under four main headings as suggestions for effective PD planning, suggestions for future research, suggestions for PD content and suggestions for teachers' further development. 18 suggestions were grouped as other. Total number of suggestions made by 56 master's theses is 357.

The biggest number of suggestions relates to teachers' further development. The most frequent suggestion is that teachers should be encouraged to engage in PD activities for further development. This suggestion with a total number of 23 (6.4%) is followed by planning tailored PD activities, which was emphasized in 22 studies for effective PD planning. Promoting collaborative activities in PD planning, and encouraging reflective activities among teachers are two suggestions that have the same frequency number, which is 21 (5.9%), each in different

categories, but still closely related. It was also suggested in 17 theses (4.8%) that teachers should be encouraged to be more collaborative while carrying out the profession to be able to further develop professionally. For the same purpose, encouraging systematic participation is another commonly provided suggestion with the same rate. Additionally, providing continuous support and guidance was seen as crucial for teachers' further development in 16 studies (4.5%). Another suggestion with the same rate was made for future research highlighting a requirement to conduct more research to explore the impacts of related PD activities. Encouraging active participation and engagement in PD activities (3.9%), conducting a comprehensive needs analysis (3.4%), increasing motivation (3.4%), implementing the study in a different context with different participants (3.4%), balancing between theory and practice (3.4%), considering students' needs and interests as well as teachers' (3.1%), planning targeted interventions (3.1%), evaluating effectiveness of PD activities (3.1%), providing flexible PD options (2.5%), raising administrators' awareness (2.5%), providing useful activities that are applicable in teachers' context (2.5%), and providing opportunities to implement new knowledge (2.0%) are most frequently given suggestions in master's theses.

4.18.2. Distribution of suggestions in PhD dissertations

The suggestions that were provided in PhD dissertations about the PD of English teachers in Türkiye are displayed in Table 18.2.

Table 18.2. Distribution of Suggestions in PhD Dissertations

Suggestions	Details of the suggestions	<i>f</i>	%
For effective PD planning	Planning tailored activities	11	7.0
	Considering teachers' needs	7	4.5
	Promoting collaborative activities	7	4.5
	Addressing barriers such as heavy workload, lack of time and financial issues	5	3.2
	Considering students' needs and interests	5	3.2
	Consulting teachers in decision making process	4	2.5
	Encouraging active participation and engagement	4	2.5
	Promoting communication among colleagues	4	2.5
	Evaluating effectiveness of PD activities	3	1.9
	Incorporating technology tools and online platforms	3	1.9
	Considering teachers' preferences	2	1.3
	Assessing trainers' performance	1	0.6
	Bringing solutions to lack of motivation	1	0.6
	Conducting a comprehensive needs analysis	3	1.9
	Establishing international standards for teacher educators	1	0.6
Including qualified trainers	1	0.6	
For future research	Conducting more research to explore impacts	5	3.2

Suggestions	Details of the suggestions	<i>f</i>	%
	Implementing the study in a different context with different participants	4	2.5
	Conducting more research on the topic	1	0.6
For PD content	Balancing between theory and practice	3	1.9
	Planning practical and useful activities	3	1.9
	Adding variety in content	2	1.3
	Creating meaningful content	1	0.6
	Planning up-to-date activities	1	0.6
For teachers' further development	Encouraging teachers to engage in PD activities	7	4.5
	Fostering continuous learning	7	4.5
	Providing continuous support	6	3.8
	Creating a supportive and professional learning environment	5	3.2
	Providing opportunities to implement new knowledge	5	3.2
	Encouraging collaboration	4	2.5
	Offering teachers PD opportunities to enhance their knowledge	4	2.5
	Fostering reflective practices	4	2.5
	Planning follow-up activities	3	1.9
	Planning targeted interventions	3	1.9
	Encouraging reflection	6	3.8
	Providing participants with support materials	2	1.3
	Continuing life-long learning	1	0.6
	Directing one's own development	1	0.6
	Encouraging self-driven PD	1	0.6
	Fostering a collaborative atmosphere	1	0.6
	Increasing personalisation opportunities	1	0.6
	Informing teachers about PD activities	1	0.6
Providing opportunities to improve teachers' language skills	1	0.6	
Providing training on ICT	1	0.6	
Other		11	7.0
Total		157	100

The ideas were classified into four primary categories: suggestions for effective PD planning, suggestions for future research, suggestions for PD content, and suggestions for teachers' further development. There were a total of 11 suggestions that were categorized as "other". The overall number of suggestions put out by 36 PhD dissertations is 157.

11 suggestions (7.0%) emphasized the importance of planning tailored activities and 7 (4.5%) focused on considering teachers' needs. There are also 7 suggestions (4.5%) claiming it is necessary to promote collaborative activities. All these can be regarded as suggestions for effective PD planning. According to the data, more suggestions serving for effective PD planning can be listed as addressing barriers such as heavy workload, lack of time and financial issues (3.2%), considering students' needs and interests (3.2%), consulting teachers in decision-making process (2.5%), encouraging active participation and engagement in planned activities

(2.5%), and finally, promoting communication among colleagues (2.5%) to maximize benefits of PD activities.

The most popular suggestions for teachers' further development include encouraging teachers to engage in PD activities (4.5%), fostering continuous learning (4.5%), providing continuous support (3.8%), encouraging reflection (3.6%), creating a supportive and professional learning environment for teachers (3.2), and providing opportunities to implement new knowledge (3.2%).

For future research, it was found essential to conduct more research to explore the impacts of the related PD activities (3.2%) as well as to implement the study in a different context with different participants (2.5%).

Regarding PD content, most common suggestions made by the researchers were balancing between theory and practice (1.9%), Planning practical and useful activities (1.9%), adding variety in content (1.3%), which are similar to suggestions made in master's theses.

CHAPTER 5

5. DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

This chapter presents a discussion of the findings that have been revealed in relation to the research questions along with a brief summary of the study. Furthermore, based on the results of the study, suggestions for further studies and implications of the research will be expressed in the following sections.

5.1. Discussion

This research was carried out with the purpose of investigating postgraduate theses on the topic of PD of English teachers in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022. It was aimed to reveal tendencies and gaps in the field portraying the current state of the research in the country to contribute to the improvement of the English language education in Türkiye, the teaching profession, teachers, students as well as educational institutions. To achieve this aim, 18 research questions were determined, and 92 theses in the scope of the research were analyzed qualitatively making use of descriptive and content analysis to answer the questions as follows:

1. What is the distribution of degrees in these studies?
2. What is the distribution in terms of universities?
3. What is the distribution in terms of institutes?
4. What is the distribution in terms of years?
5. What is the distribution in terms of language?
6. What is the distribution in terms of the title of the supervisor?
7. What is the distribution of methodology?
8. What is the distribution of sampling methods?
9. What is the distribution of sample groups?
10. What is the distribution of sample size?
11. What is the distribution of the number of the data sources?

12. What is the distribution of data collection tools?
13. What is the distribution of data analysis?
14. What is the distribution of research settings?
15. What is the distribution of research setting status?
16. What is the distribution of subjects?
17. What is the distribution of results?
18. What is the distribution of suggestions?

A total of 92 theses in the field were analyzed in this study. According to the results, 56 studies were conducted as master's theses while the number is 36 for PhD dissertations. This means although more studies were carried out at master's level, the significance of PD of English teachers was not ignored by the doctoral researchers by focusing on a variety of topics about PD of English teachers in Türkiye. This can be explained with the findings of Gürsoy and Özcan's study (2021). In their research, they suggested in their research that teacher PD is the leading research topic in the doctoral dissertations in the field of ELT. The gap between the number of doctoral and master's level theses cannot be described as a significant disparity as almost half of the total number consists of PhD dissertations. However, in similar research carried out in other fields of education, the number of doctoral theses were stated to be significantly lower than the number of master's theses. In his study Öcel and Bergil (2022) found that there were 806 master's theses and 128 doctoral theses written in ELT in 2019, 2020 and 2021. Similarly, Behbudova (2023) investigated postgraduate theses on the use of smart technologies in foreign language education between 2012 and 2022. Based on the findings, it was discovered that out of a total of 142 studies, only 25 of them concentrated on the subject at the PhD level.

The findings regarding the universities where the theses were conducted indicate that the highest number of theses, 19 out of 92 theses, were conducted at Middle East Technical University. This result aligns with the findings of research by Kırmızı (2012). He examined the theses written in the field of English Language Teaching between 2006 and 2011, and concluded that the majority of researchers were from METU. While research at the master's level was distributed among 22 universities, research at the doctoral level was conducted at 11

universities. The number of doctoral theses conducted at METU is greater than the number of master's theses conducted at the same university. Following METU, Bahçeşehir University, Yeditepe University, and Bilkent University are the main universities where master's theses were produced. However, no doctoral studies have been conducted at these universities. Considering both doctoral and master's theses, it can be inferred that Gazi University is the second most productive university after METU. Çukurova University, where 6 studies were conducted, can be said to rank third in terms of productivity in the field. Other major universities where theses on the subject were carried out include Gaziantep University, Çanakkale University, and Hacettepe University.

After analyzing the theses related to the topic, it is evident that the Institute of Educational Sciences and the Institute of Social Sciences hold accountability for the majority of theses preparation and publication. While the numbers of theses produced by both institutions are similar, the Institute of Social Sciences has a slightly more number of theses. These findings provide further evidence that supports the conclusions reached by Durukan et al. (2015). There are several possible causes for this result. There are certain universities without an Institute of Educational Sciences, such as METU, Çanakkale University, Çukurova University and Bahçeşehir University. The Institute of Social Sciences is responsible for supervising academic research in the subject of education in some of these universities. Furthermore, the foundation of the Institute of Social Sciences precedes the opening of the Institute of Educational Sciences. This may be seen as a further consideration. Additionally, the subject might be described as multidisciplinary, with researchers from several areas displaying a growing interest and conducting studies at different institutes.

When examining the distribution of theses by year, it is observed that the highest number of theses at both the master's and doctoral levels were produced in 2019. In a broader perspective, within the span of twenty years, 15 out of 92 theses were written in 2019. This finding aligns with the research conducted by Karadeniz (2022). Her study, which examined the theses written in the field of English Language Teaching between 2010 and 2020, also indicated that the highest number of theses in the field were written in 2019. The results of the study revealed that 23, out of 115 theses, were carried out in 2019, which is the year before Covid-19 pandemic started. In the following year, in 2020, a significant decrease was observed in the number of theses. This may be explained with profound changes caused by the pandemic, which all the world went through, and inevitably led to an unexpected shift to distance

education. The issues Covid-19 brought to education resulted in problems with sustainability of academic research as well. During that period, we have witnessed a number of situations in educational contexts as a result of the Covid-19 pandemic, including lack of facilities and platforms for online learning and this may be one cause for the significant decrease in 2020. Erkal Aksoy and Yılmaz (2021) discovered that 89.5% of academics had difficulties in their study during the Covid-19 pandemic. The biggest challenges for academics were producing research papers (43.1%) and carrying out thesis research (26.2%). Their study revealed that academics encountered challenges in research planning, implementation, and other related areas. Furthermore, it was noted that certain research activities could not even be completed. According to the data, the year 2011 also witnessed an increase in master's theses, although the interest shown by researchers in the field declined in subsequent years. Furthermore, in 2003, no theses were written at the doctoral level on the subject. Additionally, although the number of theses written after 2019 in both levels did not sustain the rise observed in that year, it can be stated that the annual average is higher compared to previous years. Finally, changes in the number of theses have been viewed over the years, however, it cannot be clearly stated that the number of theses constantly increased in time. A more steady rise would be anticipated given the significance of the major changes and improvements that have occurred globally and in the field of education over time.

After analyzing the language used in the theses, it is apparent that most of them were written in English, whereas only eight theses were published in Turkish. In contrast to this finding, Demiral (2021) examined the theses conducted in ELT between 2015 and 2020, and found that only 66 out of 202 studies were carried out in English. This means the researchers in ELT more commonly preferred Turkish. The findings of the current study reveals that the number of doctoral level theses produced in Turkish regarding the PD of English teachers is slightly more than the number of master's theses written in Turkish. This can be elucidated by the fact that certain doctoral-level scholars hail from different fields, namely, Educational Administration and Curriculum and Instruction. However, the data in the current study display that 84 out of 92 theses were produced in English. This suggests that majority of the researchers in the field did not have difficulties pertaining to language proficiency while engaging in academic endeavors. Additionally, it can be inferred that most researchers could easily benefit from international sources and evaluate the topic from a more global perspective. Also, the predominance of English-language sources enables researchers from abroad to access a wider range of studies conducted in Türkiye.

As the data of the research reveals, the academic titles of the thesis supervisors for master's theses and Ph.D. dissertations on PD of English teachers show diversity. More than half of the master's theses have been supervised by Assistant Professors, while Professors guided the majority of PhD dissertations. Associate Professors rank second in both levels. Assistant Professors rank third in supervisor title distribution for PhD theses, despite being at the top of supervising master's theses. There is a pattern that shows that supervisors' academic titles increase the postgraduate education level of the theses. Also, it was stated by Yavuz (2016) that this is a likely consequence because there are more master's students than PhD students and most academic staff members are assistant professors, which results in assistant professors' supervising more master's theses. It was also suggested by Polat (2013) that PhD students usually tend to study with professors. A further reason for this could be that supervising a PhD dissertation could necessitate greater expertise and subject-specific knowledge. In addition, current Graduate Education Regulations require that before an Assistant Professor can supervise a Ph.D. dissertation, they must first demonstrate proficiency guiding a master's thesis.

When it comes to distribution of research types among theses, the data indicates that mixed method research was predominantly preferred by master's level researchers. The qualitative research type was employed almost as frequently as the mixed method research type in master's theses, taking second place in the distribution. On the other hand, qualitative research type was utilized in most of the PhD dissertations, corresponding to more than half. Carter (2012) also displayed a similar result in her research indicating the dominance of qualitative and mixed methods in the studies. One notable point is that quantitative research was followed by 11 researchers in master's theses despite the qualitative nature of the field. On the other hand, Atmaca and Ekşi (2023) found that the quantitative research type was the most common among the studies they investigated. Regarding doctoral level, there is only one quantitative study, which yields researchers tend to explore more on the topic focusing on in-depth analysis rather than numbers adopting a qualitative perspective. In qualitative research, cases and events are presented in their environment with a realistic and holistic approach, which enables researchers to monitor events and phenomena more closely (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2011). Similar to the findings of the current study, Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) and Demir (2020) stated in their research that qualitative research is the most frequently used research type in the studies related to the PD of teachers. However, their research also revealed that mixed method was the least preferred among researchers contrary to what this current study found. However, It was found by some other researchers (Özmen et al., 2016; Atmaca & Ekşi, 2023)

that the mixed method was the most common research type in doctoral dissertations in the field of ELT. The findings related to the common use of the mixed method in the studies could be also supported by the results of a research by Karadeniz (2022). Her study found that 69 out of 115 postgraduate theses in ELT utilized the mixed method as it enhances a deeper understanding of the event through making use of both qualitative and quantitative techniques.

In the postgraduate theses investigated, it was observed that the sampling methods were in accordance with the research types. The most commonly employed sampling method was purposive sampling followed by convenience sampling in second place. Similarly, in his PhD dissertation, Öcel (2022) concluded that convenience and purposive sampling methods' implementation increased in ELT depending on the data reached by analyzing postgraduate theses in the field. Another study that aligns with the results of the current study was conducted by Özmen et al. (2016). Their research found that convenience and purposive sampling were the two mostly used sampling methods in doctoral dissertations in ELT. Doruk (2021) also stated that researchers commonly preferred purposive sampling. This may be explained by the design of the studies, the researchers' aims, and the size of sample groups. The related studies were mainly mixed and qualitative rather than quantitative. They primarily aimed to understand the phenomena with a positivist view. In other words, they were mostly non-experimental studies some of which employed case studies. In purposive sampling, researchers intentionally select participants with specific characteristics or experiences depending on their research questions, which is a proper sampling method for such studies. Another reason for the dominance of purposive sampling can be interviews used to strengthen the data collected in the first phase of the research especially in mixed method studies in the scope of this study. Participants of interviews are selected because they hold the characteristics the researchers need in their sample. Also, as surveys were frequently used in most of the related studies, convenience sampling was observed to be employed as a big part of the research. One reason could be cost-effectiveness and time-efficiency to choose convenience sampling while collecting data from participants. Some may be reluctant to participate in the study or cannot be reached easily. In addition to this, the data related to the sample size in the studies is in accordance with the sampling methods mentioned in the theses. The number of participants was below 300 in most of the studies investigated. To be more specific, 39 of the studies employed a participant number of 30 or below while actually 56 out of 92 studies were carried out with a sample group including 100 or fewer participants, which helps us explain the predominance of convenience and purposive sampling methods.

In some studies, no explanation about sampling methods was provided or they mentioned the details of their sample groups without directly addressing specific and commonly used methods, which indicates some researchers may need to improve their methodological knowledge. Also, it's possible that master's and doctoral students failed to include the sampling methods because their supervisors neglected to remind them to include it in their theses and dissertations. However, to help readers understand their methodological approach, researchers are advised to include information about the selection of their samples in their studies (Creswell and Creswell, 2018).

As another inquiry in this research, theses were investigated to reveal researchers' tendencies on sample groups. 70 theses out of 92 were conducted with solely EFL teachers. This predominance in distribution can be explained with the fact that researchers in the field frequently focused on exploring experiences, needs, preferences and perceptions of in-service EFL teachers regarding PD activities. Very few master's studies included PDU members, teacher trainers/educators and directors. In a study, EFL teachers doing their master's were selected as participants. In another study, documents were also utilized to collect data and gathered from EFL teachers, students and directors. The general tendency in PhD dissertations is similar in terms of choice of sample groups. The only difference is that directors and teacher trainers were included in more studies. This may reveal that these studies intended to enrich their research adding different participants and perspectives into their studies. Unlike studies carried out at the master's level, one research focused only on Comenius assistants, while another study focused solely on teacher trainers at the doctorate level. Similarly, Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) revealed that the most frequently used sample type was teachers in the research of teachers' PD. Their study did not specifically focus on EFL teachers, nevertheless, they reached the same result. Depending on the data of the current research, it can be inferred that researchers usually addressed EFL teachers as participants in their studies since they were regarded as the primary data sources related to their research questions. In addition to this, it is easier to reach EFL teachers rather than contact directors or teacher trainers, so it might be more time-efficient to work with them. In addition to this, EFL teachers are more in number compared to directors and trainers. Therefore, researchers do not have to deal with specific limitations when conducting their research only with EFL teachers. Also, selecting a specific group as the data source such as Comenius assistants and master's students might stem from researchers' specific concern related to the impact of the relevant experience that the sample group has on their PD. Besides, students were not frequently included in the research. One

reason might be parental consent issues related to students under age 18. Also, most private schools do not prefer participating in academic studies as they want to protect their reputation and privacy. For these reasons, students included in some of the research were usually university students from state universities.

When the distribution of theses in terms of their sample size, it can be observed in the master's theses' data that 17 theses were conducted with between 101 and 300 participants, which constitutes the biggest group. In this respect, the findings of the current study are in line with the findings of the study by Yağız et al. (2016). Also, 13 studies had a sample size between 31 and 100, the second biggest group. There are 12 theses with between one and 10 participants while there is the same number of theses with between 11 and 30 participants. Depending on the results, it can be concluded that researchers usually aimed to answer their questions by addressing smaller groups to reach more specific results. The least used sample sizes were the last two categories which are 301-100 and over 1000. There is one study with each. The percentage is low in these categories because it might be hard to reach more participants regarding PD of EFL teachers. According to the studies conducted by Cesur et al., (2018) and Solak (2014), often the sampling size varied from 31 to 100, which takes second place in this study. However, the findings of this study indicate a tendency for an extensive sampling size in the first place, which is between 101 and 300. Reaching this number of participants can be easier today due to data collection processes in which interviews and surveys are used through online platforms. When it comes to PhD dissertations, the same sample size (between 101-300) takes second place. At this level, more studies were found to be conducted with a smaller number of participants, and the biggest percentage belongs to a sample size between one and 10. This can be supported by most dissertations' research design as there are several research designed as case studies. Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) also found a similar result. They concluded that a sample size ranging between 0-30 was employed in 35 out of 60 studies.

Theses were also categorized according to the number of data sources they utilized. The data revealed that more than a half of the studies employed three or more sources of data in PhD dissertations. This shows that researchers aimed to strengthen their data and enrich their research paying attention to increasing validity of the studies. When master's theses and PhD dissertations are compared, it can be clearly seen that use of three or more data sources is more common in PhD dissertations, which can be interpreted that doctoral level researchers in the field were more knowledgeable in terms of methodology or their research were usually more

comprehensive and robust in terms of supporting their results. However, in master's theses, use of two data sources has the biggest percentage in the distribution. Also, there are 16 studies in the third place which employed only one source of data. However, 1 source of data was utilized only in 3 of the PhD dissertations investigated. In master's theses, it can be seen that the distributions of the number of data sources were near each other. On the other hand, when PhD dissertations were examined, there is a big difference between the most frequent category and the others. It was also found by Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) that although the considerable number of studies analyzed employed three or more sources of data, the numbers of studies using one or two data sources did not show a significant discrepancy.

Results related to data collection tools utilized shows that interviews and questionnaires were the most frequently preferred data collection tools. The findings are in line with some similar studies (Yılmaz, 2017; Cesur et al., 2018; Demir, 2020; Karadeniz, 2022). In this study, interviews and questionnaires are followed by observations, documents, field notes, reflective journals and scales at master's level. On the other hand, in PhD dissertations, documents were also employed as a common data collection tool. On the other hand, it was revealed by Atmaca and Ekşi (2023) that documents were the most employed data collection tools. As mentioned previously, most PhD dissertations were found to have used three or more sources of data, and this can be a reason for the frequent use of documents in PhD dissertations. Furthermore, regarding the most preferred data collection tools in the studies it can be said that utilizing both an interview and a questionnaire together in a research to collect data results adopting a mixed method. Because of this, the current study demonstrates a positive correlation between the utilization of interviews and questionnaires and the high frequency of mixed methods among the distribution of research types of the theses investigated.

When data analysis types were examined in the theses, it was found that both master's and PhD dissertations, predominantly utilized qualitative analysis. There was not remarkable difference between the results for qualitative and descriptive analysis in master's theses. However, in PhD dissertations, there was a considerable gap between the two types of analysis. With a percentage of 59.4, qualitative analysis was discovered to be the most widely used analysis. It can be inferred from the data that most of the research included a significant amount of subjective interpretation or analysis of non-numeric data. The least utilized analysis was predictive. Qualitative analysis was often preferred in the studies as researchers frequently aimed to explore a phenomenon, delve into participants' perspectives, and generate rich, in-

depth insights. These results may also indicate that the theses mainly focused on understanding behaviors, attitudes, opinions, or experiences through methods through interviews, focus groups, or content analysis of textual data. Moreover, the use of descriptive analysis in the second place may show that in some studies numerical data was used to describe characteristics, tendencies or patterns observed in the data. This result is in alignment with the results regarding distribution of research types and data collection tools used in the studies. As mentioned before, qualitative and mixed method studies were frequent among the studies investigated. Besides, questionnaires and interviews were the most widely used data collection tools. Finally, the least used data analysis type is predictive. Incorporating predictive analysis implies a desire to generate future predictions or assumptions by analyzing past data trends, and this was not what the majority of researchers intended while doing their research on the topic. Furthermore, the research topic's nature was not always appropriate to being examined with this particular intention as researchers usually aimed to investigate the current situation or past experiences to gain a deeper understanding of the topic, and make future improvements, but not future predictions. Similarly, Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) also found that the most frequently used data analysis types were qualitative and then descriptive analysis in teachers' PD research. Also, different from the findings of this research, Yavuz et al. (2021) investigated the characteristics and trends of 220 studies conducted on distance education activities, and found that descriptive analysis summarizing and presenting numerical data was the most widely utilized data analysis type.

According to the distribution of research settings in the theses, studies were carried out in universities both at master's and doctoral level. In both categories, universities are places where almost half of the research was conducted. Similarly, Özmen et al. (2016) analyzed doctoral dissertations in ELT in their research, and found that 64% of the studies were carried out in universities. The findings are parallel to the research conducted by Yağız et al. (2016). In the current study it was also concluded that other research settings such as primary schools, secondary schools and high schools were not as frequently preferred as universities. One reason could be most researchers' working at universities, so they could reach more participants at university context easily. Also, teachers working at preparatory schools at universities constitute most of the community of EFL teachers. Therefore, it might be more convenient to select them as participants in research studies related to the PD of English teachers. Additionally, EFL teachers in universities have more access to PD opportunities, and they are encouraged more than other level EFL teachers. Some universities even have PD units, and

teachers' improvement is followed at regular intervals. Moreover, although teachers from all levels of education claim they cannot participate in PD activities due to their workload, university instructors may sometimes have a more flexible schedule than teachers working at primary, secondary and high schools. Another reason for the dominance of this research setting preference is the opportunity to work with students combined with teachers while collecting data because these students are over 18, which means it does not necessitate to take parental consent from families for withing data collection procedures. This eases researchers' job during their research as it is more practical and time-efficient. In accordance with the results of this study, Yavuz et al. (2021) and Karadeniz (2022) also concluded that a sample group from the university context was the most utilized category in the studies they investigated. Lastly, some of research setting were referred as "different levels of schools", which makes it vague for the reader to understand the characteristics of the sample group. In addition, there is only one thesis regarding EFL teachers' PD in non-formal education, conducted at the doctoral level revealing that. This indicates a research gap concerning the PD of EFL teachers in non-formal education context. Besides, as it can be observed from the data, nursery school teachers were included in the research only once in a master's thesis with EFL teachers from various settings. It can be also inferred that nursery school EFL teachers were not given enough importance in the research on the topic.

The research also analyzed research settings. It was found that in master's level private institutions were preferred more than public institutions, and some of the studies were conducted both in private and public institutions, which holds the second highest percentage in distribution. Dissimilar to the results obtained from master's theses, public schools rank highest in the distribution among PhD dissertations as research setting. Half of the theses were conducted in public schools at this level while a combination of both types of institutions takes second place. When private schools serve as the sole research environment, they were discovered to be the least preferred option. Unfortunately, no detailed analysis could be reached regarding the research setting status in the literature in ELT. However, a content analysis study was carried out by İlhan (2017) on early childhood education, and it was found that more than half of the theses were conducted in public schools, and in second place both private and public schools. This result reveals similarity to the results of the current study in terms of the dominance of public schools in PhD level and combining both types as research settings in second place.

Postgraduate theses were also examined concerning the distribution of subjects. According to the results, PD activities was the category with the highest number of theses at master's level. It was observed that a wide range of PD activities were investigated in a total number of 21 theses out of 56. Some PD activities were studied more than once in relation to English teachers' PD. These are doing master's, conducting action research and preparing teacher portfolio. Other PD activities studied in this category are CELTA, critical friends group, keeping diaries, mentoring, online PD activities, peer coaching, peer observation, reflective practice groups, teacher research, team teaching, and webinars. As the data suggested, most theses were conducted at university context and private institutions. EFL teachers who especially work in these contexts are encouraged to be a part of these activities, implying the reason for this category. This can be a reason why this category is the most commonly researched in master's theses. Also, the importance of continuous learning, being reflective and collaboration are underscored in the field, therefore, these PD activities were in the center of interest for many researchers as they foster reflection, collaboration, and life-long learning to raise both personal and professional awareness of EFL teachers. On the other hand, in PhD dissertations, lesson study and action research are the two mostly preferred topics in the same category. The remaining PD activities researched in the dissertations are comenius assistantship, critical friends group, online professional learning and team teaching, all of which foster 21st century skills with the purpose of being collaborative, enhancing reflectivity and creativity, including technology or providing more communicative opportunities to the practitioners. These findings are in line with Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu's (2016) research which revealed that professional learning communities and being reflective was the most frequently studied areas in PD research.

Another noteworthy category in subject distribution is training/development programs. This is the category which includes the most number of theses at PhD level embodying 14 theses. Training/development programs theses focused on assessment, developing intercultural competence, teachers' actional competence, learner autonomy, implementation of NLP in programs, improving students' language learning strategies of students, improving teachers' techno-pedagogical skills, non-formal education, professional skills, students' affective barriers, teachers' behaviors and student engagement, teaching young learners, testing speaking skills, and university instructors. It can be inferred that EFL teachers' needs are multifarious, and training/development programs can contribute to teachers' PD in many aspects provided that they take specific teachers' needs into consideration while planning and implementation.

Besides, research focusing on these programs can be interpreted as an intention to find solutions to the betterment of the programs.

Other categories that EFL teachers' PD research centers on are teachers' perspectives, needs and preferences of teachers, participation in PD, teachers' learning through PD, technology, teacher trainers. Similarly, teachers' participation in PD, technology and teachers' PD needs were also identified as areas of study in their research by Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016). Teachers' perspectives on in-service trainings and PD seems to be a more preferred topic among researchers with 15 theses. In line with their PD, researchers also explored the link between teachers' views on PD and how they build their identities, their self-efficacy beliefs, how they approach research, what they think about self-initiated PD, and how they think Covid-19 affected their needs. One significant difference is that technology and investigation of teacher's perspectives were identified as topics that were studied in master's level more frequently. To summarize, it could be stated that the research conducted both at master's level and doctoral level aimed to investigate ways to foster in-service EFL teachers' PD in Türkiye.

The results obtained from the master's theses and PhD dissertations have been examined in terms of four categories: content, teachers, teaching, and execution of PD. The majority of results belong to the category "results in terms of teachers". A total of 253 results were obtained in master's theses through the analysis. According to the data, 22 theses revealed that PD activities had a positive impact on teachers' PD. The second most common result suggested that a positive impact on teachers' classroom practices was observed (Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu, 2016). Depending on these two results, it can be inferred that there is a positive relationship between effective PD activities and teachers' classroom practices. That is to say, when teachers are engaged in meaningful PD activities that address their needs and expectations as well as enhancing their teaching and problem-solving skills, it paves the way to a successful attempt for betterment in classroom contexts. Another prevalent finding indicated that the mentioned PD activities resulted in increased awareness. This pertains primarily to teachers, but administrators and trainers have also developed awareness in a variety of aspects. This result can be also supported by the next most widely observed result, which suggests PD activity was found effective. In contrast, according to the results of some relevant research (Yılmaz & Sever, 2021; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023), findings revealed that teachers could not benefit from the development activities and trainings as they did not address their specific needs. Therefore, it was concluded in these research that PD activities were not satisfactory, and they did not have

a positive impact on teachers' classroom practices. Additionally, a great number of research in fifth and sixth place indicate that studies resulted in an increase in communication among colleagues, and fostered collaborative activities. The results are in line with similar studies (Taşdemir & Karaman, 2022; Buendía & Macías, 2019). Furthermore, the analysis displays that an increase in motivation, a positive attitude towards PD, and positive effects of reflective practices were commonly reported in the results chapters of some studies. These results are consistent with some of the previous research (Yurtseven & Bademcioğlu, 2016; Buendía & Macías, 2019). These results compiled from the analysis also support the aforementioned characteristics of effective PD in the literature. All these are the most frequently noted positive results upon analyzing 56 master's theses. On the other hand, a few results related to PD content indicate that PD activities were not motivating. Besides, there was no alignment with teachers' needs according to some results. Lack of practicality was another issue that teachers complained about. It was also mentioned by previous researchers (Yılmaz & Sever, 2021; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). Some other concerns regarding the execution of PD were determined as a lack of feedback and evaluation, a need for need analysis, and the length of the program. These results are consistent with similar studies (Yılmaz & Sever, 2021; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). In two theses, however, results underscore the significance of evaluation and feedback after training indicating its advantages. Depending on these results, it can be summarized that there are some points to consider while planning PD activities although the majority of results focus on positive outcomes in the relevant studies.

Other findings that require careful consideration in the analysis are specifically associated with teachers. It was reported in some theses that lack of motivation was a hindrance to teachers' further improvement. Besides the teachers stated they needed more collaboration in their professional environment. Buendía and Macías (2019) and Taşdemir and Karaman (2022) discussed the same result in their research. One possible explanation is that teachers are often compelled to attend one-time seminars, led by trainers, in which they are unable to actively engage. Moreover, it was highlighted in some research that EFL teachers' PD activities were affected by challenges faced by teachers such as heavy workload, lack of institutional support, and financial difficulties. Also, some further training needs were determined such as teachers' language skills, ICT use, teaching speaking skills, assessment, and cultural competency. These results are in line with previous studies (Buendía & Macías, 2019; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). A further point to pay attention was teachers' limited knowledge about PD opportunities. It was concluded that some teachers did not even know some PD activities

exist. An explanation for this can be a lack of guidance and support in the professional environment. Also, some teachers were reported to have low self-efficacy beliefs, which can be a reason for their lack of motivation for further improvement. Finally, a few results indicated that teachers were not encouraged for further PD. Therefore, they cannot find the strength and support to continue to develop professionally. On the other hand, a great number of research indicated that participating meaningful PD activities helped teachers to adapt a more positive attitude towards PD, and when they were encouraged and provided with guidance, they showed more willingness to pursue their PD efforts.

Upon examining PhD dissertations in terms of their results, it can be stated that most frequently reported results were the same as master's theses'. PD activities were found to have positive impact on teachers' PD, which was reflected in classroom practices. Furthermore, it was highlighted that PD activities contributed to an increase in awareness, collaboration, motivation and led to a positive change in teachers' view. Different from the results analysed in master's theses, it was reported in four dissertations that PD activities had no alignment with teachers' needs. Yılmaz and Sever (2021) also reached the same conclusion in their research. This shows more studies revealed a need for focusing on specific needs of teachers at doctoral level. This can be taken as constructive feedback while planning PD activities. Also, some additional deficiencies that were not mentioned in master's theses related to content were revealed by the PhD research. According to findings, some programs did not provide practical and applicable content while some of them were not sufficient or up-to-date. To add more, they did not have variety in terms of activities and topics they covered. These results are in line with some of the previous studies (Taşdemir & Karaman, 2022; Yılmaz & Sever, 2021; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). Lastly, the content was found overloaded, which prevented teachers from benefiting from the program as they had difficulty in focusing and prioritizing important aspects. Moreover, the significant effect of collaboration, reflection, critical thinking, targeted training, systematic nature of PD, interaction, and knowledge sharing among colleagues, were some of the main points that were highlighted by the results of PhD dissertations. Finally, while results related to the self-efficacy beliefs of teachers were observed in both levels, it was specifically focused on how PD activity promoted autonomy both for teachers and students at the doctoral level only.

When the theses and dissertations were examined, the suggestions were categorized under four groups as suggestions for effective PD planning, for future research, for PD content,

and for teachers' further development. Similar suggestions were observed in both master's and PhD research related to the topic. Most of these aimed to serve for teachers' further development while a great number of suggestions address effective PD planning for the future. The most frequently observed suggestions were encouraging teachers to engage in PD activities, planning tailored activities, promoting collaborative opportunities while planning PD activities, encouraging reflective activities, collaboration, and systematic participation in PD practices. Regarding these results, the present study is in line with the previous research (Yurtseven & Bademcioğlu, 2016; Taşdemir & Karaman, 2022; Buendía & Macías, 2019; Yılmaz & Sever, 2021; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). These suggestions were made considering deficiencies in the PD of EFL teachers who the studies were conducted with. Given the fact that these teachers actively work in the field and attend PD activities either compulsorily or voluntarily, their experiences that were shared in the studies reflect their reality. Therefore, suggestions made aimed at the betterment of PD programs and activities. These suggestions are in line with the features of effective PD. Moreover, they were made in accordance with the results that were found by the researchers. According to the data obtained from the analysis, results were centered around the themes collaboration, reflection, communication and interaction. One reason for these needs revealed and suggestions made to meet them may stem from one-shot seminars and workshops that are generally compulsory, and do not address either teachers' or students' specific needs. When this is the case, teachers' lack of motivation was reported in the results part of some theses. In line with this result, it was suggested in a number of studies that institutions are required to find ways to increase teachers' motivation for participation. Also, these trainings are not mostly conducted systematically according to the results. Therefore, it was suggested in the studies that teachers' systematic participation in PD should be encouraged since effective PD needs to have a continuous nature. An explanation for these points can also be the fact that most educational institutions do not have a PD unit which is responsible for designing PD programs at regular intervals or provide support and guidance. When it comes to MoNE trainings, they usually do not address teachers' specific needs. According to the research by Yılmaz and Sever (2021), EFL teachers reported that they were eager to participate in PD activities, but they did not find MoNE trainings satisfactory upon their past experiences as their specific needs were not met. Also, these trainings often do not consider teachers as active participants (Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). As a result, the current situation of EFL teachers' PD requires more attention and better planning considering the frequently made suggestions in the research.

In addition to the suggestions for effective PD planning and teachers' further development, there are also a number of suggestions for PD content and future research in the studies. It was suggested that future researchers conduct more research on the topic to explore the impacts of the related PD activities. In addition to this, implementing the study in a different context with different participants was frequently suggested. Similarly, Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016) also found that researchers in the field widely suggested that research on the topic should continue with different variables and wider population. One reason for this can be the limitations of the studies because studies were conducted in different research settings with different levels of participants each. Therefore, findings and implications may change provided that the context and participants change. Other significant suggestions for future research are conducting longitudinal studies as also stated by Yurtseven and Bademcioğlu (2016), enriching data collection types, and including students in the research. Also, it was stated that PD content should have a balance between theory and practice because teachers sometimes complain that they cannot benefit from any practical activities that can be implemented in their contexts. The same suggestion was also made by Yılmaz and Sever (2021) and Taşdemir and Karaman, (2022). In accordance with this suggestion, another suggestion is to provide useful activities that are applicable in teachers' classrooms.

There are several additional recommendations that, although not at the forefront of the chart, also need to be addressed. Studies also suggest that continuous support and guidance should be provided. Additionally, not only teachers but also trainers and directors are required to continue life-long learning. Also, students's needs and interests should be taken into consideration while planning PD as they are directly related to teachers's needs in classroom context. Moreover, effectiveness of PD activities should be evaluated for betterment in programs and practices. In this respect, the current study is in line with the previous research (Hoş & Topal, 2013; Yılmaz & Sever, 2021). It was also recommended that targeted interventions should be planned to meet specific needs. Additionally, it is essential to provide teachers with flexible PD options to foster continuity and effectiveness of PD activities. Another important point is that teachers should be provided opportunities to implement new knowledge. This result aligns with the previous research (Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). Seeing an improvement in their teaching and observing its positive effects will probably result in an increase in their motivation to continue their PD practices. Lastly, some other recommendations that were provided in the studies are encouraging self-driven PD, providing resources, improving teachers' work conditions, raising administrators' awareness, incorporating

technology tools and online platforms into PD planning, reviewing and updating training programs, considering the length of the training, increasing sense of belonging and personalization opportunities and finally providing opportunities for emotional support, which is usually neglected. These findings are consistent with the findings of some previous research (Yurtseven & Yılmaz, 2016; Buendía & Macías, 2019; Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023). In short, analyzing the previous research on the topic, one can conclude that suggestions often address an increase in teacher autonomy and self-driven PD in addition to highlighting the significance of continuously evaluating and improving PD programs and providing support.

Similar to suggestions in master's theses, PhD dissertations also frequently center on the necessity of planning tailored activities which necessitates considering teachers' specific needs. This result is in line with what Tafazoli (2021) also suggests in their research. According to Tafazoli, no matter how much PD is targeted, if decisions about language teachers' PD are made without adequate collaboration and without taking teachers' preferences and concerns into account, then the training course is probably not going to meet the teachers' needs. Fostering continuous learning, encouraging teachers to engage in PD activities, and promoting collaborative activities were determined as given importance equally in recommendations. Some suggestions that were stated not in master's theses but in PhD dissertations are addressing barriers such as heavy workload, lack of time and financial issues, consulting teachers in the decision-making process, assessing trainers performance, adding variety in content, planning up-to-date activities, creating a supportive and professional learning environment, planning targeted interventions, planning follow-up activities, providing opportunities to improve teachers' language skills and providing training on ICT. These results show similarity with the relevant studies (Cansel İskender & Atar, 2023; Yurtseven & Bademcioğlu, 2016; Taşdemir & Karaman, 2022; Buendía & Macías, 2019; Yılmaz & Sever, 2021). Finally, it's important to note that all of the suggestions made in the studies are interconnected, which means they all have a certain impact on each other and are all aimed to help EFL teachers enhance their skills and be more effective teachers in their contexts.

To sum up, the analysis of postgraduate theses and dissertations on the topic of PD of EFL teachers in Türkiye shows some similarities and differences with similar studies conducted previously. The current study investigated 92 postgraduate theses from different aspects and categorized the information obtained from the analysis to display a clear picture of the present situation and tendencies on the topic. The results were discussed in line with the relevant

research and commented on with an attempt to explain possible reasons for these results. The findings of the study aims to identify gaps in the field and give insight to the future researchers and stakeholders involved in the PD of EFL teachers. The findings of the current study are limited to the theses investigated. It might be possible to reach different results if specific themes or key words are determined to identify studies that will be examined in another research.

5.2. Conclusion

PD has become a necessity for all teachers in this constantly evolving world as teachers are seen as change agents in the society, and the quality of education is closely related to improvement of teachers. To provide a better English education in the country, EFL teachers' PD needs to be encouraged, and investigated. The present study focused on the postgraduate theses conducted on PD of in-service EFL teachers in Türkiye between 2003 and 2022. The purpose of the study was to reveal tendencies in the field and identify possible gaps displaying a clear picture of the situation through years. Therefore, a number of keywords were defined, and related postgraduate theses were searched on the CoHE National Thesis Center. The studies regarding pre-service EFL teachers were excluded from the research. Finally, 92 theses were selected to include in the study for a detailed investigation. The theses were analysed upon the identified research questions separately as master's theses and PhD dissertations. Descriptive analysis and content analysis were employed for data analysis. The findings of the study were presented in tables using categories, frequency and percentage.

The findings of the research displayed that while PD of EFL teachers was studied predominantly at the master's level more, it also received significant importance by the researchers at the doctoral level. Most studies were carried out in Middle East Technical University at both levels. While many theses were produced at certain private universities at master's level, they did not focus on the topic at doctoral level. Almost all PhD dissertations on the topic were conducted in public universities except one dissertation from İstanbul Aydın University. Furthermore, there is an increase in the number of theses and dissertations compared to earlier years. However, this is not a steady increase across the years. This may stem from the shift in the researchers' interest on the topic or circumstances; namely, the Covid-19 pandemic might have been influential. According to the results, the research topic has recently become a center of interest again for many researchers in the field after 2020. Moreover, the majority of studies were written in English except for eight. This might be because of the requirements of

the institutes or researchers' personal choice. In addition, the number of master's theses supervised by assistant professors outweighs doctoral level dissertations, which are very few in number. This may be due to researchers' choice in doctoral level or it may not be possible to work with professors in master's level because of some requirements or lack of opportunities.

When the methodology of the studies were examined, it was observed that mixed and qualitative research types were employed most as well as the small number of quantitative method studies. Purposive and convenience sampling methods were methods utilized most. Sample groups were mainly EFL teachers. The findings suggested a lack of adequate consultation with trainers, directors, and students for data collection purposes. Notably, a sample size ranging from 101 to 300 emerged as the predominant choice at the master's level. Conversely, the majority of theses were conducted with smaller groups of 1 to 10 participants, highlighting a preference for reduced sample sizes in doctoral dissertations. In terms of data sources, master's theses mainly utilized two sources, whereas three or more sources were prevalent in PhD dissertations, indicating a trend towards more comprehensive analyses, particularly emphasizing qualitative research methods and smaller sample cohorts in the latter. Interviews and questionnaires emerged as the primary data collection tools across both academic levels, while document analysis, observations, and reflective instruments were comparatively underutilized. The analysis predominantly took a qualitative and descriptive approach. However, descriptive data analysis, characterized by numerical representations and percentages, predominated in master's theses, which can be explained with more mixed methods use in master's theses. Predictive data analysis was the least favored due to the qualitative nature of the subject matter. Moreover, universities have been identified as the predominant research environments, with master's theses predominantly conducted at private institutions and doctoral dissertations mainly at public institutions.. This discrepancy underscores a lower involvement of private institutions, particularly at the nursery, primary, secondary, and high school levels, in research endeavors compared to their public counterparts. Furthermore, the findings indicate a significant gap in the investigation of PD of English language teachers within K-12 settings and non-formal education contexts, with university instructors being the primary focus of scholarly inquiry. Another investigated area was the subjects of the studies. They mostly centered on specific PD activities, training programs, EFL teachers' perspectives, and their needs and preferences. Another area of focus in the research was the subjects of the studies, which mainly centered on specific PD activities, training programs, the perspectives of EFL teachers, and their individual needs and preferences. The

results showed that there were only a few research projects focused on improving the skills of trainers in postgraduate research. These projects specifically addressed the technological and pedagogical needs of EFL teachers. The research also highlighted the specific areas where the teachers needed improvement, including language proficiency, assessment skills, materials development, and integrating technology into their teaching. In addition, although there were some theses that discussed self-initiated PD, it was considered inadequate in terms of its prominence in the research discourse.

The final areas under investigation encompassed the findings and recommendations derived from postgraduate studies, which exhibited significant interconnection, often resulting in overlapping themes. While various findings emerged from the research, the prevalent ones suggested a positive impact on teachers' PD, subsequently influencing their classroom practices positively. Additional common positive outcomes included raised awareness, enhanced communication among colleagues, a positive attitude towards PD, alignment of PD initiatives with teachers' needs, increased collaborative activities, and the beneficial effects of reflective practices. On the other hand, certain studies reported negative findings, such as a lack of alignment with teachers' needs, lack of motivation, a need for collaboration and interaction, inadequate assessment and evaluation of PD programs, and challenges faced by EFL teachers.

Upon revealing these results, the recommendations predominantly emphasized the enhancement of PD for teachers, emphasizing the necessity for encouragement and continuous support, the planning of tailored activities, conducting a comprehensive needs analysis prior to planning, striking a balance between theory and practice in PD content, ensuring the quality of trainers, fostering collaborative and reflective activities, motivating teachers, planning follow-up activities, evaluating the effectiveness of PD programs, and conducting further research on the topic. These findings contribute to the literature by revealing tendencies in the research of EFL teachers' PD. However, certain areas necessitate further attention in future research endeavors. It is essential to note that this study is limited to 92 postgraduate theses accessed through the CoHE National Thesis Center based on predetermined criteria. The subsequent section outlines suggestions for improving EFL teachers' PD.

5.3. Suggestions and Further Implications

This study attempted to further develop the current state of EFL teachers' professional development in Türkiye by investigating the postgraduate theses conducted on the topic in Turkish universities. The results revealed some tendencies in the field alongside with some

differences and similarities between the studies. For this reason, the research findings entail certain recommendations that should be taken into account by both researchers in the field and stakeholders who are responsible for the PD of English language teachers, as well as the EFL teachers themselves.

Initially, this content analysis study investigated 92 theses conducted between 2003 and 2022, selected based on predetermined criteria. Future investigations may choose to employ diverse criteria or timeframes to yield more specific results. Additionally, extending the study to cover different periods could provide insights into trends over the years. Moreover, by identifying distinct keywords or themes related to EFL teachers' PD, a more focused analysis of relevant theses can be carried out, potentially clarifying various aspects. Expanding the range of data sources by incorporating theses and articles from different databases may enhance the richness of findings. Alternatively, a similar study can be restricted to a specific postgraduate level to yield more specific results. Another suggestion for further research could be comparing results with similar studies conducted abroad. This may contribute to raising consciousness regarding certain areas.

Furthermore, the utilization of students' achievement scores in specific contexts, focusing on distinct aspects such as speaking, writing, or reading skills, and conducting pre- and post-assessments following teachers' PD activities can yield invaluable insights into comprehending the impact of such PD initiatives on student outcomes. Moreover, investigating the effects of teachers' PD activities on students' attitudes towards language learning represents another area for exploration. Additionally, it is noteworthy that qualitative studies examined in this research predominantly took the form of case studies. Therefore, a relevant suggestion for future research endeavors would entail a greater emphasis on conducting more action research studies. Such an approach holds the potential to foster a deeper understanding of the challenges encountered by teachers in their professional roles since this type of research allows for the systematic investigation of specific issues or problems within a particular context and lead to targeted solutions.

Additionally, regarding the academic titles of the thesis supervisors, it was observed that assistant professors primarily supervised master's theses, while professors held supervision of Ph.D. dissertations. This trend may arise from the prevalence of assistant professors within university settings along with the tendency of Ph.D. students to seek advice from professors for their dissertation. Depending on this finding, it is essential for the The Council of Higher

Education to consider allowing assistant professors to supervise more doctoral theses to foster their academic advancement. Additionally, establishing limits for both levels of academic research for professors and assistant professors could ensure a more balanced distribution of workload. Consequently, this may afford greater opportunities for professors to engage in master's level research and alleviate the workload burden on assistant professors.

Further recommendations could pertain to the sample group and research settings. Notably, EFL teachers from universities comprised the most frequently studied sample group, while other educational levels received comparatively less attention or were often included with other levels without specific focus. Therefore, there is a need for greater exploration of EFL teachers from K-12 levels and non-formal education contexts. Freelance teachers, particularly those offering online English lessons for specific purposes, have become more prevalent especially after the pandemic, and their inclusion in the research of English teachers' PD is essential. Moreover, involving students, trainers, and directors in research endeavors can enrich the depth of investigations by incorporating diverse perspectives. Additionally, considerations regarding the status of research settings requires attention. While a predominant focus was observed on master's studies within private educational institutions, there exists an opportunity for expanding research efforts within public schools, particularly at the K-12 level. Similarly, given that the majority of dissertations were conducted in public educational institutions, conducting more research in private educational settings could offer insights into potential variations in results based on the research settings status. This comparative approach may elucidate the influence of research settings on observed outcomes.

Regarding the distribution of subjects in theses and dissertations, it was noted that certain themes were frequently explored, while others were relatively underrepresented. It is recommended that future research endeavors prioritize topics such as teacher autonomy, teachers' self-efficacy beliefs, enhancing the quality of teacher trainers, and examining the effects of reflective practices. Moreover, investigating the impact of PD on teachers' wellbeing or exploring themes such as teacher agency and student agency could offer valuable contributions to the field. In addition, it was observed that research on PD tools is more prevalent in master's theses compared to PhD dissertations. This suggests that some tools have not been thoroughly investigated at the doctoral level, and the number of studies examining such tools at the master's level is limited. Therefore, investigating the same PD tools across

different contexts and with diverse participant groups at both postgraduate levels could provide valuable insights into their efficacy and impact.

Final suggestions can be proposed to educators, administrators, trainers, and educational institutions. Firstly, it is crucial to customize training sessions and PD programs to address the specific needs of both teachers and students. Consequently, involving teachers in the decision-making process and considering their feedback are pivotal. Furthermore, teachers should take responsibility for their own ongoing PD by being autonomous and engaging in reflective practices to evaluate and enhance their competencies continuously, which will ensure the sustainability of PD efforts. Additionally, assessment of training sessions and PD programs is essential, along with the implementation of follow-up activities to enhance the efficacy of acquired knowledge. Moreover, teachers should be encouraged to integrate new insights gained from PD initiatives into their teaching practices to promote student progress. In addition, fostering a collaborative work environment and culture is critical for teachers' continuous development. Hence, promoting collaboration and knowledge-sharing among colleagues is crucial. Furthermore, administrators are suggested to take the responsibility of introducing a variety of PD tools within their institutions and ensuring the implementation and continuity of such practices. Lastly, alternative solutions should be produced to encourage teachers' systematic participation in PD activities and to foster their active engagement in the process.

GENİŞLETİLMİŞ TÜRKÇE ÖZET

Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü
Yabancı Diller Eğitimi Anabilim Dalı
İngiliz Dili Eğitimi Bilim Dalı
Yüksek Lisans Tezi

2003-2022 YILLARI ARASINDA TÜRKİYE'DE İNGİLİZ DİLİ ÖĞRETMENLERİNİN MESLEKİ GELİŞİMİ ÜZERİNE YAZILMIŞ LİSANSÜSTÜ TEZLERİN İNCELENMESİ: NİTEL BİR ÇALIŞMA

Büşra TAN YİĞİT

Eğitim, bireylerin yaşamlarını sürdürebilmeleri için gerekli bilgiyi edinme ve davranışlarını geliştirme sürecidir. Bu süreç, öğretmenlerin sunduğu rehberlik ve bilgi aktarımı aracılığıyla gerçekleştirilir (Özdemir vd., 2019). Eğitimin kalitesi, ülkeler ve kurumlar düzeyinde çeşitli faktörlere bağlıdır. Öğrenci başarısı, eğitim programlarının önemli sonuçlarından biridir ve öğretmenler, öğrenci gelişim seviyesini belirlemede kritik bir rol oynarlar (Day, 1999; Özdemir, 2013). Öğretmenlerin akademik performans üzerindeki etkileri dikkate alındığında, profesyonel gelişmeye yönelik çaba gösteren öğretmenlerin öğrencilere avantaj sağladığı görülmektedir. Öğretmenlerin alanlarında yetkin olmaları ve bilgiyi öğrencilere aktarma becerisine sahip olmaları önemlidir. Öğretmenlerin yetkinliklerini korumak ve geliştirmek, öğrenci başarısı ve okul ilerlemesi için giderek daha önem kazanmaktadır (Yurtseven vd., 2021).

Smylie (2001), okulların ve öğrenci öğreniminin geliştirilmesine yönelik çabaların, öğretmenlerin profesyonel gelişim ihtiyaçlarını ciddiye almadıkları takdirde ileriye gitmeyeceğini belirtmektedir. Öğretmenlerin daha fazla profesyonel bilgiye sahip olmaları, öğrenci başarı düzeylerinin artmasıyla ilişkilendirilmiştir. Öğretmenlerin değişime ayak uydurması ve öğretim yöntemlerini güncellemesi gerekmektedir (Day, 1999; Richards & Farrell, 2005). Dil öğretmenlerinin profesyonel gelişimi, alanda güncel kalabilmeleri ve tükenmişlikten kaçınabilmeleri açısından kritik öneme sahiptir (Sadeghi ve Richards, 2021). Bu nedenle, mesleki deneyime sahip tüm öğretmenler, etkili bir şekilde öğretme becerilerini geliştirmek için profesyonel gelişim faaliyetlerine katılmalıdır.

Eğitimci gelişimi, bilgiye kolay erişimin ve uluslararası etkileşimin arttığı günümüz dünyasında İngilizce dil öğretmenleri için de hayati öneme sahiptir. İnternet ve sosyal medyanın yaygınlaşması, bilgiye hızlı erişimi sağlayarak insanların bilgi ihtiyaçlarını karşılama ve yeni

bilgi kaynakları üretme olanaklarını artırmıştır. 'İngilizce lingua franca' (ELF) kavramı, farklı ana dilleri konuşanların İngilizce aracılığıyla iletişim kurmasını ifade eder (Seidlhofer, 2005).

Son zamanlarda, İngilizcenin küresel bir dil olarak dilbilimsel ve kültürel üstünlüğü dikkat çekmiş ve küreselleşme süreci farklı kültürlerden insanlar arasındaki etkileşimi artırmıştır (Kumaravadivelu, 2012). Crystal (2018), yaklaşık olarak dünya nüfusunun dörtte birine denk gelen 1.4 milyar insanın İngilizce'yi birinci, ikinci veya yabancı dil olarak kullandığını belirtmektedir. Bu geniş kullanım, İngilizcenin küresel bağlamda lingua franca olarak öğrenilmesinin artan önemini vurgulamaktadır (Doğançay-Aktuna & Kızıltepe, 2005). Bu nedenle, İngilizce dil öğretmenlerinin sürekli profesyonel gelişim içinde olmaları, sadece öğrencilerine değil, aynı zamanda disiplinlerine, kurumlarına ve kişisel memnuniyetlerine önemli katkılarda bulunabilir.

Dil öğretmenleri için öğretme yetkinliği, İngilizce öğrenenlerin ihtiyaçlarını karşılama konusundaki kilit rolü nedeniyle kritik bir niteliktedir (Babanoğlu & Yardımcı, 2017). Bu sebeple, öğretmenlerin sürekli profesyonel gelişimlerini önceliklendirmeleri ve gelişimleri için istekli ve sorumlu olmaları önemlidir.

Dünya çapında, özellikle Türkiye gibi ülkelerde, İngilizce Dil Öğretimi (ELT) alanında birçok profesyonel gelişim çalışması yapılmıştır. Bu çalışmalar genellikle özel ve devlet okulları ile farklı eğitim seviyelerini kapsamaktadır. ELT, teknoloji, kuşakların değişen ihtiyaçları, 21. yüzyıl becerilerinin dil eğitimine entegrasyonu ve Covid-19 gibi faktörler nedeniyle sürekli bir evrimsel süreç yaşamıştır. Bu çalışmadaki problem ifadesi, söz konusu koşulları dikkate alarak ortaya çıkmıştır.

Bu çalışma, Türkiye'deki İngilizce dil öğretmenlerinin profesyonel gelişimi üzerine yapılan lisansüstü tezlerin 2003 ile 2022 yılları arasındaki araştırma eğilimlerini incelemeyi hedeflemektedir. Bu çalışma, araştırmacıların lisansüstü düzeylerini, araştırmaların yıllarını, çıktıkları üniversiteleri, enstitüleri, danışman ünvanlarını, araştırmalardaki yöntemleri, örnekleme teknikleri, veri toplama araçları, veri analiz yöntemleri, araştırmalarının evreni, örneklem grupları ve büyüklükleri, odaklanılan konuları, bulguları ve önerileri inceleyerek bu alandaki boşluğu doldurmayı amaçlamaktadır. Elde edilecek sonuçlar, eğitim kurumları, yetkililer, karar mercileri, araştırmacılar, öğretmen eğitimcileri, eğiticiler ve öğretmenler için değerli bir bakış açısı sağlayabilir. Dolayısıyla, mevcut çalışma, şu araştırma sorularını inceleyerek literatürdeki boşluğu doldurmayı hedeflemektedir:

1. Bu alıřmalardaki lisansüstü derece dađılımları nedir?
2. Bu alıřmaların üniversitelere göre dađılımları nasıldır?
3. Enstitülere göre dađılımları nasıldır?
4. Yıllara göre dađılımları nasıldır?
5. Dil açısından dađılımları nasıldır?
6. Danıřmanların unvanı açısından dađılımları nasıldır?
7. Arařtırma yöntemleri açısından dađılımları nedir?
8. Örnekleme yöntemleri açısından dađılımları nedir?
9. Örnekleme grupları açısından dađılımları nasıldır?
10. Örnekleme büyüklüğü açısından dađılımları nedir?
11. Veri kaynađı sayısı açısından dađılımları nedir?
12. Veri toplama araçları açısından dađılımları nedir?
13. Veri analizi açısından dađılımları nedir?
14. Arařtırma evreni açısından dađılımları nedir?
15. Arařtırma evreninin durumu açısından dađılımları nedir?
16. Konular açısından dađılımları nedir?
17. Sonuçlar açısından dađılımları nedir?
18. Öneriler açısından dađılımları nedir?

Türkiye'deki dil eğitimi üzerine yapılan önceki arařtırmaların incelendiđi bazı lisansüstü tezler bulunmaktadır. Öcel (2022), 2019 ile 2021 yılları arasında İngilizce Dil Eğitimi (ELT) alanındaki lisansüstü tezleri metodolojik bir bakıř açıřıyla karşılařtıran bir alıřma gerçekleřtirmiřtir. Bu alıřmada 934 tez incelenmiř ve elde edilen sonuçlar ileri alıřmalar için önemli ipuçları sađlamıřtır. Demir (2020) tarafından yapılan başka bir alıřma ise, 1987 ile

2017 yılları arasında Türkiye'de yabancı dil öğretimi üzerine yapılan lisansüstü tezleri detaylı bir şekilde analiz etmiştir. Bu çalışma ELT'nin yanı sıra diğer diller üzerine yapılan araştırmaları da kapsamıştır. Ancak, özellikle profesyonel gelişim alanında ELT üzerine yapılan kapsamlı benzer bir araştırma bulunmamaktadır.

Bu çalışma, çeşitli kurumlarda çalışan İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişim tecrübelerini, algılarını ve ihtiyaçlarını kapsamlı bir şekilde ele alacak ve Türkiye'de 2003 ile 2022 yılları arasında gerçekleştirilen lisansüstü araştırmaları detaylı bir şekilde analiz edecektir. Araştırmacı, bu dönem boyunca İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi ile ilgili temel detayları ortaya çıkarmayı hedeflemektedir. Bu analiz, son teknolojik gelişmelerin, eğitimde 21. yüzyıl becerilerinin entegrasyonunun, değişen kuşakların beklentilerinin ve Covid-19 pandemisi gibi faktörlerin İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki yetkinliklerini nasıl etkilediğini de vurgulamayı amaçlamaktadır.

Bu çalışmada, Türkiye Yükseköğretim Kurulu (YÖK) Ulusal Tez Merkezi'nde bulunan ilgili tüm tezlere erişildiği ve analiz için kullanılan verilerin eksiksiz ve doğru olduğu varsayılmaktadır. Çalışma, 2003 ile 2022 yılları arasında YÖK Ulusal Tez Merkezi'nde kataloglanmış tezlerle sınırlıdır ve erişilebilir olan tezler çalışmaya dahil edilmiştir.

Bu çalışma nitel bir araştırma tasarımı benimsemektedir. Nitel araştırma, Yıldırım ve Şimşek'e (2011) göre, nitel sürecin izlendiği, gözlem, mülakat, belge incelemesi gibi nitel veri toplama tekniklerinin kullanıldığı ve olayların ve durumların çevreleriyle birlikte gerçekçi ve bütüncül bir yaklaşımla sunulduğu bir araştırma şeklidir. Bu tür araştırma gerçekliği oluşturur ve araştırmacının olayları yakından izlemesine ve etkileyici bir tutum geliştirmesine olanak tanır. Nitel araştırma, bir dünya görüşü veya muhtemel bir teorik bakış açısından yola çıkarak bireylerin veya grupların bir sosyal veya insanî soruna verdikleri anlamı sorgular (Creswell, 2007). Bu çalışmada, araştırmacı 2003-2022 yılları arasında Türkiye'de İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi alanındaki araştırma eğilimlerini ortaya çıkarmayı hedeflemiştir. Bu amaçla, nitel bir araştırma yaklaşımı izlenerek yüksek lisans tezleri analiz edilmiştir.

Bu çalışmada, Türkiye'deki üniversitelerde İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi üzerine yazılmış yüksek lisans tezlerini incelemek için belge analizi yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Belge analizi, belgelerin nesnelliklerinin son derece önemli olduğu bir yöntemdir (İslamoğlu, 2011). Bu yöntemde, incelenecek fenomen ve olaylar hakkında veri içeren yazılı materyaller

analiz edilir. Eğitim arařtırmalarında sıkça kullanılan belge analizi, arařtırmacının elde edilen belgeleri belirli bir çerçeve içinde yorumlayarak ve ilişkilendirerek kapsamlı bir resim elde etmeye çalıştığı bir yöntemdir (Şimşek, 2009). Dolayısıyla, bu çalışmada incelenen yüksek lisans tezleri belge analizi yöntemine tabi tutularak arařtırma yürütülmüştür.

Bu çalışmanın amacı, Türkiye Yükseköğretim Kurulu (YÖK) Ulusal Tez Merkezi'nde yayımlanan İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi üzerine yapılan yüksek lisans tezlerini incelemektir. Çalışmada özellikle kriter örnekleme yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Kriter örneklemede, belirlenen kriterlere uyan bireyler, gruplar veya ortamlar seçilir (Miles et al., 2014).

Arařtırmanın kapsamı önceden belirlenen kriterlerle sınırlıdır:

- 2003-2022 yılları arasında Türkiye'deki hizmet içi İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi üzerine yapılan çalışmalar

- Yükseköğretim Kurulu (YÖK) Ulusal Tez Merkezi'nde erişime açık olan tezler

- “Mesleki Gelişim”, “İngilizce”, “Öğretmen Eğitimi”, “Öğretmen Gelişimi”, “Hizmet İçi Eğitim”, “Eğitim Faaliyetleri”, “Mentorluk”, “Gözlem”, “Yansıtma”, “Kendini Geliştirme”, “Gelişim Faaliyetleri”, “Eğitim Faaliyetleri”, “Hizmet içi Öğretmen Eğitimi”, “Yabancı Dil Eğitimi” ve “İngiliz Dili Eğitimi” anahtar kelimeleriyle ulaşılan tezler.

Arařtırmada, öğretmen adaylarının eğitimi ile ilgili tezler çalışma dışı bırakılmıştır çünkü arařtırmacının amacı, aktif olarak çalışan deneyimli İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi alanındaki arařtırmalardaki genel eğilimleri ortaya çıkarmaktır. Bu nedenle, bu çalışmanın amacına en uygun yöntemin kriter örnekleme olduğu düşünülmüştür.

Sonuç olarak, arařtırmanın çalışma grubu, 2003-2022 yılları arasında Türkiye'deki İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi üzerine yayımlanan 92 yüksek lisans tezinden oluşmaktadır ve bu tezler Yükseköğretim Kurulu (YÖK) Ulusal Tez Merkezi'nden erişilebilmektedir. Veri toplama sürecinde ulaşılamayan 11 tezin olduğu gözlemlenmiştir, bu nedenle erişilemeyen tezler çalışmaya dahil edilmemiştir.

Tüm erişilen tezler PDF dosyaları olarak indirilmiş ve kaydedilmiştir. Bu tezler detaylı bir şekilde incelenerek belirli kriterlere uymayanlar çalışmanın kapsamı dışında değerlendirilmemiştir. Her derece seviyesi için ayrı klasörler oluşturulmuş ve arařtırmanın sorularına baėlı olarak verilerin sınıflandırılması için Excel tablosu hazırlanmıştır. Oluşturulan

kategoriler, araştırma sorularına uygun olarak tasarlandığı için araştırmacının verileri sınıflandırmasına yardımcı olmuştur.

Tezler, yürütüldükleri yıllar, üniversiteler, enstitüler, dil, derece seviyeleri, araştırma türleri, danışmanların unvanları, örnek gruplar, örneklem büyüklükleri, örnekleme teknikleri, veri kaynaklarının sayısı, veri toplama araçları, veri analiz yöntemleri, araştırma evreni, araştırma evdeninin durumu, konular, bulgular ve öneriler açısından incelenmiştir. Tezlerle ilgili tüm veriler Excel programında kodlanmış ve listelenmiştir.

Daha sonra, kodlanmış verilerden tematik ve kategorik analiz yapılmış, temaları ve kategorileri erişmek için filtreleme özelliği kullanılmıştır. Araştırmanın kapsamı içinde incelenen yüksek lisans ve doktora tezleri ayrı ayrı analiz edilmiş ve toplanan veriler tablolar halinde sunulmuştur. Sonuçların net bir şekilde görüntülenmesi için verilerin frekans ve yüzde değerleri tablolarla gösterilmiştir.

Araştırmanın bulguları, EFL öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi konusunun özellikle yüksek lisans düzeyinde incelendiğini ve doktora düzeyinde de gereken önem verildiğini gösterdi. Her iki düzeyde de en çok çalışmaların Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi'nde yapıldığı görüldü. Bazı özel üniversiteler yüksek lisans düzeyinde tez üretirken, doktora düzeyinde bu konuya odaklanmadılar. Doktora tezlerinin neredeyse tamamı kamu üniversitelerinde gerçekleştirilmiş olup, sadece bir tez özel İstanbul Aydın Üniversitesi'nde tamamlanmıştır. Ayrıca, geçmiş yıllara kıyasla tez sayısında bir artış olduğu gözlemlenmiştir. Ancak, bu artış her yıl için sabit değildir. Bazı yıllarda araştırmacılar için konunun ilginç bulunmaması olabileceği veya araştırmaların Covid-19 pandemisi gibi farklı koşullardan etkilenmiş olabileceği düşünülmektedir.

Sonuçlara göre, araştırma konusu son zamanlarda birçok araştırmacı için yeniden ilgi odağı haline gelmiştir. Çalışmaların çoğunluğunun İngilizce olarak yazıldığı ancak 8 tezin İngilizce olmadığı belirlenmiştir. Bu durum, kendi kurumlarının gereksinimleri veya kişisel tercihler nedeniyle olabilir. Yüksek lisans tezlerinin çoğunun yardımcı doçentler tarafından danışıldığı, ancak doktora düzeyinde çok az tezin profesörler tarafından danışıldığı görülmüştür. Benzer şekilde, profesörler tarafından danışılan yüksek lisans tezlerinin sayısı da çok azdır. Bu durum, araştırmacıların doktora düzeyinde tercihlerine veya yüksek lisans düzeyinde bazı gereksinimler veya fırsat eksikliği nedeniyle profesörlerle çalışmanın mümkün olmamasına bağlı olabilir.

Arařtırmaların metodolojileri incelendiđinde, çođunlukla karma ve nitel arařtırma türlerinin kullanıldıđı, örnekleme yöntemlerinin amaçlı ve kolay örnekleme olarak tercih edildiđi gözlemlendi. Örnek grupları genellikle EFL öđretmenlerinden oluřmuřtur ve bu, veri toplamak için diđer paydařların yeterince danıřılmadıđını göstermektedir. Yüksek lisans düzeyinde örneklem büyüklüđünün genellikle 101-300 arasında olduđu, doktora tezlerinde ise daha küçük örneklem büyüklüklerinin tercih edildiđi belirlendi. Veri kaynakları açasından, yüksek lisans tezlerinde genellikle iki, doktora tezlerinde ise üç veya daha fazla veri kaynađının kullanıldıđı gözlemlendi. Görüřmeler ve anketler, her iki düzeyde de en yaygın veri toplama araçları olarak belirlendi. Elde edilen veriler genellikle nitel ve betimsel olarak analiz edildi. Üniversiteler, arařtırma ortamları olarak öne çıktı ve özel kurumların yüksek lisans tezlerinde, kamu kurumlarının ise doktora tezlerinde daha sık tercih edildiđi görüldü. Sonuçlar, EFL öđretmenlerinin mesleki gelişiminin K-12 düzeyinde ve yaygın eđitim bađlamında yeterince incelenmediđini ve genellikle üniversite öđretim elemanlarının arařtırma konusu olarak tercih edildiđini göstermektedir.

İncelenen alanlardan biri, çalıřmaların odaklandıđı konuları kapsamaktadır. En sık çalıřılan konular mesleki gelişim faaliyetleri, eđitim programları, EFL öđretmenlerinin bakıř açıları ve tercihleridir. Ancak, az sayıda yüksek lisans arařtırması özellikle eđitmen gelişimi, EFL öđretmenlerinin teknopedagojik ihtiyaçları, dil becerileri, deđerlendirme becerileri, materyal geliştirme ve teknoloji kullanımı gibi özel ihtiyaçlara odaklanmıřtır.

Diđer bir alan ise yüksek lisans çalıřmalarının sonuçları ve önerileridir. Bu alanlar genellikle örtüřmekte olup, öđretmenlerin mesleki gelişiminin sınıf uygulamalarına olumlu etkileri olduđu sonucuna varılmıřtır. Pozitif sonuçlar arasında farkındalık artıřı, meslektařlar arası iletiřim artıřı, iřbirlikçi faaliyetlerde artıř ve yansıtıcı uygulamaların olumlu etkileri yer almaktadır. Ancak, bazı çalıřmalar öđretmenlerin ihtiyaçlarıyla uyum sađlamama, motivasyon eksikliđi, iřbirliđi ve etkileřim eksikliđi gibi negatif bulgular da rapor etmiřtir.

Öneriler, öđretmenlerin mesleki gelişiminin iyileřtirilmesine odaklanmıř ve teřvik ve sürekli destek ihtiyacını vurgulamıřtır. Öneriler arasında, kapsamlı bir ihtiyaç analizi yapılması, mesleki gelişim içeriđinde teori ve pratik dengesinin sađlanması, iřbirlikçi ve yansıtıcı faaliyetlerin artırılması, öđretmenlerin motive edilmesi ve mesleki gelişim programlarının etkinliđinin deđerlendirilmesi gibi konular yer almaktadır.

Bu çalışma, Türkiye'deki Türk üniversitelerinde yapılan ilgili yüksek lisans tezlerini inceleyerek Türkiye'deki İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimini daha da ilerletmeyi amaçlamıştır. Araştırmanın sonuçları, alandaki bazı eğilimlerin yanısıra çalışmalar arasındaki farklılıkları ve benzerlikleri ortaya koymuştur. Bu doğrultuda, araştırma bulguları, İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişiminden sorumlu olan paydaşlar ve EFL öğretmenleri tarafından dikkate alınabilecek belirli öneriler içermektedir.

Bu içerik analizi çalışması, belirlenen bir kriterlere dayanarak 2003-2022 yılları arasında yazılmış 92 tez üzerinde gerçekleştirilmiştir. İleriki araştırmalar, daha spesifik sonuçlara ulaşmak için farklı kriterlere veya dönemlere odaklanabilir. Ayrıca, aynı çalışma yıllar boyunca yapılan çalışmaları da inceleyerek genişletilebilir. Bu şekilde, yıllar içindeki değişim daha iyi gözlemlenebilir. Ayrıca, İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişimi ile ilgili belirli bir tema seçilerek ilgili tezlerin içeriği analiz edilebilir. Böylece, farklı boyutlara ışık tutma potansiyeli bulunmaktadır. Veri kaynaklarını zenginleştirmek için farklı veritabanlarından tezler ve makaleler araştırmaya dahil edilebilir. Alternatif olarak, benzer bir çalışma daha spesifik sonuçlara ulaşmak için belirli bir lisansüstü düzeyle sınırlı tutulabilir. Başka bir ileri araştırma önerisi, yurt dışında yapılan benzer çalışmaların sonuçlarının karşılaştırılması olabilir. Bu, belirli alanlarla ilgili farkındalığın artırılmasına katkı sağlayabilir.

Ek olarak, analizden elde edilen mevcut verilere bağlı olarak bazı öneriler olabilir. Sadece yüksek lisans düzeyinde araştırma yapan üniversiteler, aynı konuda doktora tezlerini danışmanlık yapmayı da düşünebilirler. Böylelikle, daha fazla akademisyen ve akademik bölüm alan aktif olarak alana katılabilir. Buna ek olarak, yüksek lisans düzeyindeki nitel çalışmaların sayısı artırılabilir; çünkü çoğunluk karma yöntem araştırmalarını kullanmıştır. Bu şekilde, mevcut durumun daha derinlemesine analiz edilmesi, hem yüksek lisans tezlerinde hem de doktora tezlerinde mümkün olabilir. Ayrıca, yüksek lisans düzeyinde veri toplama araçları zenginleştirilebilir. Çoğu yüksek lisans tezi, görüşmeler ve anketler olarak belirlenen iki veri toplama aracı kullanmıştır. Bu araçlara ek olarak gözlemler ve belge analizi gibi diğer araçları kullanan daha fazla çalışma tasarlanabilir. Bu şekilde, çalışmaların bulguları daha detaylı ve güvenilir olabilir. Ayrıca, öğrenci başarı puanlarının veri toplama aracı olarak kullanılması, öğretmen mesleki gelişimi ile öğrencilerin akademik performansı arasındaki ilişkiye dair değerli içgörüler sağlayabilir. Son olarak, bu çalışmada incelenen nitel çalışmaların genellikle vaka çalışmaları olduğu gözlemlenmiştir. Daha fazla öneri olarak, daha fazla eylem araştırması çalışması yapılabilir. Bu, öğretmenlerin mesleklerinde karşılaştıkları zorlukları daha

derinlemesine anlamayı kolaylaştırabilir. Ayrıca, tez danışmanlarının akademik unvanlarıyla ilgili bulgular, çoğu zaman yüksek lisans tezlerinin yardımcı doçentler tarafından danışmanlığını, doktora tezlerinin ise profesörler tarafından yapıldığını göstermiştir. Bu sonuç, üniversitelerde çok sayıda yardımcı doçentin bulunması ve ayrıca doktora öğrencilerinin tezlerini genellikle profesörlerle yapmayı tercih etmeleri nedeniyle olabilir. Yükseköğretim Kurulu, üniversitelerdeki akademik pozisyonlara dikkat etmeli ve yardımcı doçentlerin akademik olarak ilerlemesine yardımcı olmalıdır. Bu aynı zamanda profesörlerin aşırı iş yükü altında ezilmesini de önleyebilir.

Öneriler kapsamında, örnek grupları ve araştırma ortamlarıyla ilgili olarak şunlar da ele alınabilir: Üniversitelerden EFL öğretmenleri en sık kullanılan örnek grup olmuştur. Diğer eğitim düzeylerinin yeterince önemsenmediği veya örnek gruplara diğer düzeylerle birlikte dahil edildiği, ancak özel olarak araştırılmadığı gözlemlendi. Diğer K-12 düzeylerinden ve resmi olmayan eğitimden EFL öğretmenlerinin daha fazla incelenmesi gerekmektedir. Ayrıca, serbest çalışan öğretmenler de bulunmaktadır. Özellikle pandemiden sonra çevrimiçi özel ders veren İngilizce öğretmenlerinin sayısı artmıştır. Bu öğretmenler bazen belirli amaçlar için İngilizce dersleri vermektedirler. Gelecekteki araştırmalarda, bu öğretmenler de yaygın eğitimin bir parçası olarak değerlendirilebilirler. Ayrıca, öğrenciler, öğretmenler ve yöneticiler de araştırmaya dahil edilebilir. Bu katılımcılardan elde edilen veriler çalışmalara daha derin bir boyut kazandırabilir. Araştırma ortamlarıyla ilgili olarak ek bir öneri de yapılabilir. Özel eğitim kurumlarında daha fazla yüksek lisans çalışması yapılmaktadır. Daha fazla çalışma, özellikle K-12 düzeyindeki devlet okullarında gerçekleştirilebilir. Ayrıca, doktora tezlerinin çoğu kamu eğitim kurumlarında yapıldığından, özel eğitim kurumlarında daha fazla araştırma yapılması da düşünülebilir. Bu, sonuçların araştırma ortamına bağlı olarak değişip değişmeyeceğini gözlemlene fırsatı sağlayabilir.

Tezlerde ve konularda yapılan analizler, belirli temaların sıkça incelendiğini ancak bazı temaların yeterince değer verilmediğini göstermektedir. İleriki araştırmalarda öğretmen otonomisi, öğretmenlerin öz-yeterlik inançları, öğretmen eğitimlerinin kalitesini artırma ve yansıtıcı uygulamaların etkileri üzerine odaklanılması tavsiye edilmektedir. Ayrıca, mesleki gelişim araçlarıyla ilgili araştırmalar yüksek lisans tezlerinde daha fazla yer almakta, doktora tezlerinde ise daha sınırlı kalmaktadır. Bu durum, bazı araçların doktora düzeyinde yeterince araştırılmadığını ve her iki düzeyde de bu çalışmaların sayısının kısıtlı olduğunu

göstermektedir. Aynı mesleki gelişim araçları, farklı katılımcılarla ve farklı bağlamlarda araştırılarak her iki lisansüstü düzeyinde de etkileri incelenebilir.

Son öneriler öğretmenlere, yöneticilere, eğitimciler ve kurumlara yönelik olabilir. Öncelikle, eğitim ve mesleki gelişim programlarının, öğretmen ve öğrencilerin belirli ihtiyaçlarını karşılamak üzere özelleştirilmesi önemlidir. Bu nedenle, öğretmenlerin karar verme sürecine danışılması ve geri bildirimlerinin dikkate alınması gerekmektedir. Ayrıca, öğretmenlerin kendi mesleki gelişimlerini daha aktif bir şekilde yönetmeleri ve deneyimlerini değerlendirerek kendilerini geliştirmeleri gerekmektedir. Bu, mesleki gelişimin sürekli olması için kritiktir. Eğitim ve mesleki gelişim programlarının etkilerinin değerlendirilmesi ve bu programlardan sonra takip faaliyetlerinin planlanması da önemlidir. Bu, yeni öğrenilen bilgilerin etkinliğini artıracaktır. Öğretmenlerin yeni bilgileri sınıflarında uygulamaları teşvik edilmeli ve bu da öğrenci başarısını artırabilir. Ayrıca, öğretmenlerin hem mesleki hem de kişisel olarak gelişmesi için daha işbirlikçi bir çalışma ve öğrenme ortamı sağlanmalıdır. Bu nedenle, meslektaşlar arasında işbirliği ve bilgi paylaşımı teşvik edilmelidir. Son olarak, öğretmenlerin mesleki gelişim faaliyetlerine sistemli bir şekilde katılımlarını teşvik etmek için alternatif yöntemler bulunmalıdır.

REFERENCES

- Adamy, P., & Heinecke, W. (2005). The influence of organizational culture on technology integration in teacher education. *Journal of Technology and Teacher Education*, 13(2), 233-255.
- Albion, P., Tondeur, J., Forkosh-Baruch, A., & Peeraer, J. (2015). Teachers' professional development for ICT integration: Towards a reciprocal relationship between research and practice. *Education and Information Technologies*, 20(4), 655–673.
- Al-Kathiri, S. N. (2002). *The characteristics of master's theses conducted in the department of curriculum and teaching methods from 1983 through 2002 at King Saud University, Saudi Arabia*. University of Arkansas.
- Altundiş, E. (2006). İngilizce öğretmenlerinin eğitimsel kökenleri ve dil öğretiminde karşılaştıkları sorunlar (Kayseri ili örneği). *Unpublished master's dissertation, Erciyes University, Kayseri*.
- Atmaca, Ç., & Ekşi, G. (2023). Research trends in English language teaching: A twenty-year review of master theses and doctoral dissertations. *Educational Academic Research*, 48, 14-26.
- Avalos, B. (2011). Teacher professional development in teaching and teacher education over ten years. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(1), 10-20.
- Aydın, R. (2007). Türkiye’de eğitimle ilgili yapılan bilimsel toplantılarda ve millî eğitim şûralarında ele alınan öğretmen sorunları ile Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı’nın politika ve uygulamalarının değerlendirilmesi (1980–2004). *Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi. Ankara*.
- Ayvaz-Tuncel, Z., & Çobanoğlu, F. (2018). In-service teacher training: Problems of the teachers as learners. *International Journal of Instruction*.
- Babanoğlu, M. P., & Yardımcı, A. (2017). Turkish state and private school EFL teachers' perceptions on professional development. *Çukurova Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 46(2), 789-803.
- Balbay, S., & Doğan, C. (2021). English Language teaching and language teacher education in Turkey- an evolutionary overview. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 17(5), 364–376.
- Balbay, S., Pamuk, I., Temir, T., & Doğan, C. (2018). Issues in pre-service and in-service teacher-training programs for university English instructors in Turkey. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 14(2), 48-60.
- Banegas, D., Pavese, A., Velázquez, A., & Vélez, S.M. (2013). Teacher professional development through collaborative action research, Impacts on foreign English-language teaching and learning. *Educational Action Research*, 21(2), 185– 201.

- Barba-Sanchez, V., Gouveia-Rodrigues, R., & Martinez, A. M. (2022). Information and communication technology (ICT) skills and job satisfaction of primary education teachers in the context of Covid-19: Theoretical model. *Profesional de la informaci3n*, 31(6), 1-17.
- Başkale, H. (2016). Nitel arařtırmalarda geerlik, gvenirlik ve 3rneklem byklğnn belirlenmesi. *Dokuz Eyll niversitesi Hemřirelik Fakltesi Elektronik Dergisi*, 9(1), 23-28.
- Bayar, A. (2014). The components of effective professional development activities in terms of teachers' perspective. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 6(2), 319-327.
- Bayraklı, A. F. (2010). Hizmetii eđitim panel ve alıřtay aılıř konusması. Retrieved from http://hedb.meb.gov.tr/net/_duyuru_dosyalar/calistay.pdf
- Bayram, İ., & Bıkmař, F. (2021). Implications of lesson study for tertiary-level EFL teachers' professional development: A case study from Turkey. *SAGE Open*, 11(2), 1-15.
- Behbudova, A. (2023). *Methodology and scope of graduate thesis completed between 2012-2022 on the use of intelligent technologies in foreign language education in Turkey* (Publication No. 773876) [Master's thesis, Ondokuz Mayıs University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Beltran, M.M., & Percy, M.M. (2014). Collaboration to teach English language learners, Opportunities for shared teacher learning. *Teachers and Teaching, Theory and Practice*, 20 (6), 721– 737.
- Berelson, B. (1952). *Content analysis in communication research*. Sage.
- Best, J.W. & Kahn, J. (2006) *Research in education*: New Delhi: Prentice Hall of India Pvt. Ltd.
- Borg, S. (2015). Overview-Beyond the workshop: CPD for English language teachers. *Professional development for English language teachers: Perspectives from higher education in Turkey*, 5-12.
- Borg, S. (2017). Twelve tips for doing teacher research. *University of Sydney Papers in TESOL*, 12, 163-185.
- Borg, S. (2018). Evaluating the impact of professional development. *RELC Journal*, 49(2), 195-216.
- Bowman, M. A., Vongkulluksn, V. W., Jiang, Z., & Xie, K. (2022). Teachers' exposure to professional development and the quality of their instructional technology use: The mediating role of teachers' value and ability beliefs. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 54(2), 188-204.
- British Council (2015). *Teaching for success: Continuing professional development (CPD) framework for teachers*. British Council.

- Buendía, X. P., & Macías, D. F. (2019). The professional development of English language teachers in Colombia: A review of the literature. *Colombian Applied Linguistics Journal*, 21(1), 98-111.
- Büyükkantarcioğlu, N. (2004). A sociolinguistic analysis of the present dimensions of English as a foreign language in Turkey.
- Büyüköztürk, Ş., Kılıç-Çakmak, E., Akgün, Ö. E., Karadeniz, Ş., & Demirel, F. (2018). *Eğitimde bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri* (25th ed.). Pegem Akademi.
- Cakır, A. (2017). Türkiye’de YÖK öncesi ve sonrası yabancı dil eğitimi. *Journal of Language Research (JLR)*, 1(1), 1-18.
- Caner, H. N. (2019). Contributions of transnational education experiences of pre-service EFL teachers to their professional development. *International Journal of Current Approaches in Language, Education and Social Sciences*, 1(1), 1-19.
- Carter, N. B. (2012). *Master's level research in second language teaching and learning (Canada, 2008-1010): paradigms, methods and analyses* [Doctoral dissertation, Carleton University]. Carleton University Institutional Repository.
- Cesur, K., Muhammed, K. Ö. K., & Aydın, Ç. (2018). Content analysis of abstracts on ELT research available in Turkish journalpark academic platform. *ELT Research Journal*, 7(2), 58-77.
- Coskun, A., & Daloglu, A. (2010). Evaluating an English language teacher education program through Peacock's model. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education (Online)*, 35(6), 24-42.
- Crandall, J. J. (2000). Language teacher education. *Annual review of applied linguistics*, 20, 34-55.
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design*. Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Sage.
- Crystal, D. (2018). *The language revolution*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Danijela, M. (2018). The teacher’s role and professional development. *International Journal of Cognitive Research in Science, Engineering and Education (IJCRSEE)*, 6(2), 33-45.
- Darling-Hammond, L. & McLaughlin, M. W. (1995). Policies that support professional development in an era of reform. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 76(8), 597-604.

- Darling-Hammond, L., Hyler, M. E., and Gardner, M. (2017). *Effective teacher professional development*. Learning Policy Institute.
- Day, C (1999). *Developing teachers: The challenges of lifelong learning*. Falmer Press
- Day, C. (1999). Professional development and reflective practice: Purposes, processes and partnerships. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 7(2), 221-233.
- Demir, Ç. (2020). *Holistic analysis of postgraduate theses on foreign language teaching in Turkey with actor-technic perspective 1987-2017*. Efe Akademi Yayınları.
- Demiral, İ. (2021). Türkiye’de 2015-2020 Yılları Arasında İngilizce Eğitimi Alanında Yapılan Lisansüstü Tezlerin İncelenmesi (Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi). *Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi*.
- Demirel, E. E., & Cephe, P. T. (2015). Looking into burnout levels among English language instructors. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 11(1), 1-14.
- Demirel, Ö. (1991). Türkiye’de yabancı dil öğretmeni yetiştirmede karşılaşılan güçlükler. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 6(6).
- Demirtaş İlhan, S. (2017). *A content analysis of early childhood education graduate theses written in Turkey* (Publication No. 481670) [Master's thesis, Middle East Technical University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Desimone, L. M. (2011). A primer on effective professional development. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 92(6), 68-71.
- DiPaola, M., & Wagner, C. A. (2018). *Improving instruction through supervision, evaluation, and professional development: Second Edition*. IAP.
- Doğan, C. (2016). *Promoting continuous professional development for English language instructors within a higher education context* (Publication No. 441406) [Doctoral Dissertation, Çukurova University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Dogan, C., & Kirkgoz, Y. (2022). Promoting continuous professional development of English teachers through action research. *International Journal of Educational Reform*, 31(3), 246-277.
- Doğançay-Aktuna, S. & Kiziltepe, Z. (2005). English in Turkey. *World Englishes*, 24(2), 253-265.
- Doruk, E. (2021). *Eğitimin sosyal ve tarihi temelleri alanında yapılan lisansüstü tezler (2002-2019) üzerinde bir içerik analizi çalışması* (Publication No. 686067) [Master’s thesis, Gazi University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Durukan, H., Atalay, Y., & Nurullah Şen, S. (2015). Türkiye’de 2000-2014 yılları arasında okul öncesi eğitimi alanında yapılan yüksek lisans tezlerinin incelenmesi. *Dicle Üniversitesi Ziya Gökalp Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 26, 62-77. <https://doi.org/10.14582/DUZGEF.626>

- Earley, P., & Bubb, S. (2007). *Leading and managing continuing professional development: Developing people, developing schools*. SAGE Publications.
- Edinne M. S. (2013). *The impact of some affective factors on EFL students at tertiary level. A Case Study of Third Year Students at the Department of English at Biskra University* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. University of BSKA.
- Ekiz, D. (2009). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri: Yaklaşım, yöntem ve teknikler*. Anı Yayıncılık.
- Ekşi, G. (2010). *An assessment of the professional development needs of English language instructors working at a state university* (Publication No. 277650) [Master's thesis, Middle East Technical University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Erkal Aksoy, Y., & Yılmaz, S. (2021). Covid-19 pandemi döneminde ebelik bölümü akademisyenlerinin araştırma sürecinde yaşadıkları sorunlar. *OTJHS*, 6(2), 173-180.
- Farrell, T. S.C. (2015). *Language teacher professional development*. TESOL Press.
- Fernandez-Batanero, J. M., Montenegro-Rued, M., Fernandez-Cerero, J., & Garcia-Martinez, I. (2020). Impact of the information and communication technologies on the education of students with Down syndrome: A bibliometric study (2008-2018). *European Journal of Educational Research*, 9(1), 79-89.
- Fleming, N. D. (1995). I'm different; not dumb. Modes of presentation (VARK) in the tertiary classroom. In *Research and development in higher education, Proceedings of the 1995 Annual Conference of the Higher Education and Research Development Society of Australasia (HERDSA)* (Vol. 18, pp. 308-313).
- Freeman, D. (1989). Teacher training, development, and decision making: A model of teaching and related strategies for Language teacher education. *TESOL Quarterly*, 23(1), 27-32.
- Fullan, M. G. & Stiegelbauer, S. (1991). *The new meaning of educational change* (2nd ed.). Teachers College.
- Glatthorn, A. (1995). Teacher development. In L. Anderson (Ed.), *International encyclopedia of teaching and teachers education* (2nd ed.). Pergamon Press.
- Guskey, T. R. (2000). *Evaluating professional development*. Corwin Press.
- Guskey, T. R. (2003). What makes professional development effective? *Phi Delta Kappan*, 84(10), 748-750.
- Guskey, T. R. (2009). Closing the knowledge gap on effective professional development. *Educational Horizons*, 87(4), 224-233.
- Gürsoy, E., & Özcan, E. N. (2021). Finding and minding the gaps for language education in Turkey: A content analysis on doctoral dissertations in ELT programs from 2010-2020. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 17(Special Issue 2), 830-847.

- Guven, I. (2008). Teacher education reform and International Globalization hegemony: issues and challenges in Turkish teacher education. *International Journal of Educational and Pedagogical Sciences*, 2(4), 324-333.
- Hill, J. W. (2022). *K-12 online literacy and reading instruction: A descriptive content analysis from 2000–2021* (Publication No. 29259978) [Doctoral dissertation, Texas A&M University]. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.
- Hismanoglu, M., & Hismanoglu, S. (2010). English language teachers' perceptions of educational supervision in relation to their professional environment: A case study of Northern Cyprus. *Novitas-ROYAL (Research on Youth and Language)*, 4(1).
- Hos, R., & Topal, H. (2013). The current status of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers' professional development in Turkey: A systematic review of literature. *The Anthropologist*, 16(1-2), 293-305.
- Houser, J. (2015). *Nursing research: Reading, using, and creating evidence* (3rd ed.). Jones & Bartlett Learning.
- Hunzicker, J. (2010). *Characteristics of effective professional development: a checklist*. Bradley University.
- Ilgan, A. (2017). *Öğretmenlerin mesleki gelişimi ve denetimi*. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Iskender, Y. C., & Atar, C. (2023). A meta-synthesis of research on in-service EFL teachers' needs for INSET programs in Türkiye. *I-manager's Journal on English Language Teaching*, 13(4), 23-29.
- İslamoğlu, A. H. (2011). *Sosyal bilimlerde araştırma yöntemleri* (2nd ed.). Beta Yayıncılık.
- Johnson, C. C. (2006). Effective professional development and change in practice: Barriers science teachers encounter and implications for reform. *School Science and Mathematics*, 106(3), 150-161.
- Johnson, C. C., & Marx, S. (2009). Transformative professional development: A model for urban science education reform. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, 20(2), 113-134.
- Kachru, B. B. (1992). World Englishes: Approaches, issues and resources. *Language Teaching*, 25(1), 1-14.
- Kaiser, S. (2020). Are Bottom-Up Approaches in Development More Effective than Top-Down Approaches? *Journal of Asian Social Science Research*, 2(1), 91–109.
- Karadeniz, E. (2022). *A meta-analysis of master theses on English language teaching between 2010-2020* (Publication No. 750016) [Master's thesis, İstanbul Aydın University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Karasar, N. (2018). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemi: Kavramlar ilkeler teknikler* (33rd ed.). Nobel Akademi Yayıncılık.

- Kartal, G. & Basol, H. Ç. (2019). Generic teacher competencies and the English language teacher education program in Turkey. *Research on Youth and Language*, 13(2), 133-154.
- Kennedy, A. (2015). 'Useful' professional learning... useful for whom?. *Professional development in education*, 41(1), 1-4.
- Kennedy, M. M. (2016). How does professional development improve teaching? *Review of Educational Research*, 86(4), 945-980.
- Khalmurzayevna, Y. S., Vakhidovich, G. S., & Zairjanovich, Y. S. (2023). 21st Century Modern English Teacher's Professional Competences. *Best Journal of Innovation in Science, Research and Development*, 2(6), 8-13.
- Kirkgoz, Y. (2007). English language teaching in Turkey: Policy changes and their implementations. *RELC journal*, 38(2), 216-228.
- Kırkgöz, Y. (2009). Globalization and English language policy in Turkey. *Educational Policy*, 23(5), 663-684.
- Kirmizi, O. (2012). Research trends in MA ELT programs in Turkey. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46, 4687-4691.
- Köksal, D., & Ulum, Ö. G. (2018). The state of EFL teacher education in Turkey: From past to present. *ELT Research Journal*, 7(4), 161-174.
- Kumaravadivelu, B. (2012). *Language teacher education for a global society: A modular model for knowing, analyzing, recognizing, doing, and seeing*. Routledge.
- Küçüksüleymanoğlu, R. (2006). In service training of ELT teachers in Turkey between 1998-2005. *Uludağ Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 19(2), 359-369.
- Lieberman, A. (1996). Practices that support teacher development: Transforming conceptions of professional learning. In McLaughlin, M. & Oberman, I. (Eds). *Teacher learning: new policies, new practices* (pp. 185-201). Teachers College Press.
- Liu, S. H., Tsai, H. C., & Huang, Y. T. (2015). Collaborative professional development of mentor teachers and pre-service teachers in relation to technology integration. *Journal of Educational Technology & Society*, 18(3), 161-172.
- Mackenzie, L. (2018). Teacher development or teacher training? an exploration of issues reflected on by CELTA candidates. *English Teaching & Learning*, 42(3-4), 247-271.
- Macias, A. (2017). Teacher-Led Professional Development: A Proposal for a Bottom-Up Structure Approach. *International Journal of Teacher Leadership*, 8(1), 76-91.
- Makerevičs, V. & Iliško, D. (2019). *Governance of informal learning as a pathway for the development of young adults' agency for sustainability. In Schools and Informal Learning in a Knowledge-Based World* (pp. 155-167). London: Routledge.
- Merriam, S. B. (2018). *Nitel araştırma: Desen ve uygulama için bir rehber* (3rd ed.). Nobel Akademik Yayıncılık.

- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis : A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Ministry of National Education. (2001). *National education at the beginning of the year 2001*. Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı.
- Musset, P. (2010). Initial teacher education and continuing training policies in a comparative perspective: Current practices in OECD countries and a literature review on potential effects. *OECD Education Working Papers*, No. 48. OECD Publishing.
- Nergis, A. (2011). Foreign language teacher education in Turkey: A historical overview. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 15, 181-185.
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2017). *The Content Analysis Guidebook*. SAGE.
- Öcel, M., & Bergil, A. S. (2023). The postgraduate theses in ELT between 2019 and 2021: A methodological comparison. *Participatory Educational Research*, 10(2), 43-63.
- Özbilgin, A., Erkmen, B. & Karaman, C. (2016). English language teacher professional development: When institutional frameworks fall short. *İnönü Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 17 (1), 55-65.
- Özdemir, T. Y., Demirkol, M., & Polat, H. (2019). Teaching as a professionalism through teachers' perspective. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry*, 10(3), 296-320.
- Özdemir, S. M. (2013). Exploring the Turkish teachers' professional development experiences and their needs for professional development. *Mevlana International Journal of Education (MIJE)*, 3(4), 250-264. <https://doi.org/10.13054/mije.13.56.3.4>
- Ozer, B. (2005). Ortaöğretim Öğretmenlerinin Mesleki Gelişime İlgisi. *Journal of Educational Sciences & Practices*, 4(8).
- Özmen, K. S., Cephe, P. T., & Kınık, B. (2016). Trends in doctoral research on English language teaching in Turkey. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, 16(5), 1737-1759. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1115055.pdf>
- Ozturk, C. (2005). Türkiye'de dünden bugüne öğretmen yetistiren kurumlar. *Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Publications, Istanbul*.
- Parker, G. (2015). Teachers' Autonomy. *Research in Education*, 93, 19 - 33.
- Palardy, G. J., & Rumberger, R. W. (2008). Teacher effectiveness in first grade: The importance of background qualifications, attitudes, and instructional practices for student learning. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 30(2), 111-140.
- Polat, M. (2013). A research into completed post-graduate theses in the field of physical science: Celal Bayar university sample. *Journal of Buca Education Faculty*, 35, 46-58.
- Porter, A. C., & Brophy, J. (1988). Synthesis of research on good teaching: Insights from the work of the institute for research on teaching. *Educational leadership*, 45(8), 74-85.
- Prensky, M. (2001). Digital natives, digital immigrants part 1. *On the Horizon*, 9(5), 1-6.

- Professional development for English language teachers: Perspectives from higher education in Turkey, 5-12.
- Ramos, R. (2016). Considerations on the role of teacher autonomy. *Colombian Applied Linguistics Journal*, 8, 183-202.
- Reeve, J., & Cheon, S. H. (2021). Autonomy-supportive teaching: Its malleability, benefits, and potential to improve educational practice. *Educational Psychologist :/Educational Psychologist*, 56(1), 54–77.
- Regional English Language Office. (n.d.). U.S. Embassy & Consulates in Türkiye. <https://tr.usembassy.gov/education-culture/relo/>
- Richards, J. C. (2008). Second language teacher education today. *RELC Journal*, 39(2), 158-177.
- Richards, J. C., & Farrell, T. S. C. (2005). *Professional development for language teachers: Strategies for teacher learning*. Cambridge University Press.
- Richards, J. C., & Rodgers, T. (2001). *Approaches and methods in language teaching* (2nd ed.). Cambridge University Press.
- Richit, A., & Tomkelski, M. L. (2020). Aprendizagens profissionais de professores de matemática do ensino médio no contexto dos estudos de aula. *Acta Scientiae, Revista de Ensino de Ciências e Matemática*, 22(3), 2-27.
- Sabuncuoğlu, O., & Kurtoğlu, D. (2021). THE EFFECTS OF FOREIGN LANGUAGE ANXIETY ON PUPILS AT SECONDARY SCHOOL. *İstanbul Aydın Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 7(2), 313–368.
- Sadeghi, K., & Richards, J. C. (2021). Professional development among English language teachers: Challenges and recommendations for practice. *Heliyon*, 7(9),1-7. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e08053>
- Sağlam, M., & Kürüm, D. (2005). Türkiye ve Avrupa Birliği ülkelerinde öğretmen eğitiminde yapısal düzenlemeler ve öğretmen adaylarının seçimi. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 33(167), 53-70.
- Sancar, R., Atal, D., & Deryakulu, D. (2021). A new framework for teachers' professional development. *Teaching and teacher education*, 101, 103305.
- Saricoban, G. (2012). Foreign language education policies in Turkey. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46, 2643-2648.
- Schleicher, A. (2012). *Preparing teachers and developing school leaders for the 21st century: Lessons from around the world*. Paris: OECD Publishing
- Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner: Toward a new design for teaching and learning in the professions*. Jossey-Bass.
- Seferoglu, S. S. (1996). Exploring Elementary School Teachers' Perceptions of Professional Development: The Turkish Case.

- Seferoglu, G. (2004). A study of alternative English teacher certification practices in Turkey. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 30(2), 151-159.
- Seferoğlu, G. (2006). Teacher candidates' reflections on some components of a pre-service English teacher education programme in Turkey. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 32(4), 369-378.
- Seidlhofer, B. (2005). English as a lingua franca. *ELT Journal*, 59 (4), 339-341.
- Şimşek, H. (2009). Methodical problem in the researches of educational history. *Ankara University Journal of Faculty of Educational Sciences (JFES)*, 42(1), 33-52. https://doi.org/10.1501/Egifak_0000001136
- Smith, K. (2017). *Teachers as self-directed learners: Active positioning through professional learning*. Springer.
- Smylie, M. A., Allensworth, E., Greenberg, R. C., Harris, R., & Luppescu, S. (2001). *Teacher professional development in Chicago: Supporting effective practice* (Report of the Chicago Annenberg Research Project). Chicago.
- Solak, E. (2014). The content analysis of the research papers on foreign language education in Turkey. *International Journal of English and Education*, 3(3), 167-178.
- Solak, E., & Bayar, A. (2015). Current challenges in English language learning in Turkish EFL context. *Participatory Educational Research*, 2(1), 106-115.
- Solmaz, O. (2021). Educational technology research trends in Turkey: Investigating graduate theses in English language teaching. *Journal of Computer and Education Research*, 9(17), 102-124.
- Spiteri, M., & Rundgren, S. N. C. (2018). Teachers' digital competence from a global perspective. *Teacher Education Policy and Practice International Perspectives and Inspirations*, 216.
- Stone, A. M. (2014). NASPA's new professionals institute: Exploring the personal and professional impact of a two-day, intensive professional development experience (Master's thesis). University of Nebraska-Lincoln, Lincoln, NE.
- Tafazoli, D. (2021). CALL teachers' professional development amid the COVID-19 outbreak: A qualitative study. *Call-Ej*, 22(2), 4-13.
- Tanış, A., Dikilitaş, K. (2018). Turkish EFL instructors' engagement in professional development. *Eurasian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 4(1), 27-47.
- Taşdemir, H., & Karaman, A. C. (2022). Professional development practices of English language teachers: A synthesis of studies published between 2006 and 2020. *Review of Education*, 10(1), Article e3350.
- Tercanlioglu, L. (2004). Perceptions on school-based English teacher education: A qualitative study. *The Qualitative Report*, 9(4), 673-705.

- Thurlings, M., & Brok, P. D. (2017). Learning outcomes of teacher professional development activities: a meta-study. *Educational Review*, 69(5), 554–576.
- Topkaya, E. Z., & Çelik, H. (2016). Non-native English language teachers Perceptions of Professional development: Implications for career stages. *Procedia: Social & Behavioral Sciences*, 232, 5–11.
- Turhan, İ. E., & Arikan, A. (2009). English Language Teacher Development with and without a Teacher Trainer: ELT Instructors' Perceptions. *Online Submission*, 4(2), 410-421.
- Ulum, Ö. G. (2020). Pre-service English teachers' practicum expectations and attainments. *Turkish Studies*, 15(2), 1287-1297.
- Ur, P. (1997). Teacher training and teacher development: A useful dichotomy. *The Language Teacher*, 21(10), 56-63.
- Ur, P. (2005). *A course in language teaching: Practice and theory*. Cambridge University Press.
- Uztosun, M. S. (2017). İngilizce öğretmenlerinin Türkiye'de İngilizce öğretimi üzerine düşünceleri. *Erzincan Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 20(1), 140-155.
- Ünal, E. (2010). An Evaluation of In-service Teacher Training Programs in English Language (Publication No. 294455) [Master's thesis, Çukurova University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Xie, K., Kim, M. K., Cheng, S. L., & Luthy, N. C. (2017). Teacher professional development through digital content evaluation. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 65, 1067-1103.
- Vangrieken, K., Meredith, C., Packer, T., & Kyndt, E. (2017). Teacher communities as a context for professional development: A systematic review. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 61, 47–59.
- Villegas-Reimers, E. (2003). *Teacher professional development: An international review of the literature*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Wallace, M.J. (1991). *Training foreign language teachers: A reflective approach*. Cambridge University Press.
- Weber, R. P. (1990). *Basic content analysis*. SAGE Publications.
- Widdowson, H. G. (1990). *Aspects of language teaching*. Oxford: OUP
- Widdowson, H. G. (1997). Approaches to second language teacher education. In *Encyclopedia of language and education: Second language education* (pp. 121-129). Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.
- Wyatt, M., & Ager, E. (2016). Teachers' cognitions regarding continuing professional development. *Elt Journal*, 71, 171-185.

- Yağız, O., Aydın, B., & Akdemir, A. S. (2016). ELT research in Turkey: A content analysis of selected features of published articles. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, 12(2), 117-134.
- Yaşar, P. (2019). *English language instructors' attitudes towards professional development and their engagement in self-initiated professional development*. Karadeniz Teknik University.
- Yavuz, M., Kayalı, B., & Tural, Ö. (2021). Trend of distance education research in the COVID-19 period: A bibliometric and content analysis. *Journal of Educational Technology and Online Learning*, 4(2), 256-279. <https://doi.org/10.31681/jetol.922682>
- Yavuz, A. (2011). The problematic context of mentoring: evidence from an English language teaching department at a Turkish university. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 34(1), 43-59.
- Yavuz, S. (2016). A content analysis related to theses in environmental education: The case of Turkey (2011-2015). *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 4(10), 118-125.
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2011). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri* (8th ed.). Seçkin Yayınları.
- Yılmaz, F. G. (2017). Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi eğitim yönetimi anabilim dalında yapılmış yüksek lisans tezlerinin incelenmesi (Publication No. 623572) [Doctoral Dissertation, Yıldız Technical University]. Turkish Council of Higher Education, Thesis Center.
- Yurtseven, N., & Bademcioglu, M. (2016). Teachers' professional development: A content analysis about the tendencies in studies. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 4(6), 214-233.
- Yurtseven Yılmaz, H., & Sever, S. (2021). A professional development analysis for Turkish language teachers: What did they expect? What have they found? *Journal of Pedagogical Research*, 5(1), 88-113.

APPENDIX

List of theses and dissertations investigated in the scope of the research.

Thesis No	Title
T1	EFL teachers' perceptions on the effectiveness of components of an EFL in-service training program
T2	A blended in-service training program design for developing technopedagogical skills in teaching English
T3	Turkish efl teachers' needs and preferences in professional development
T4	An NLP-based teacher development program for enhancing efl teachers' communication skills
T5	An analysis into teacher self-development models in one-year preparatory schools of private universities in Ankara
T6	A phenomenological study on online teacher professional development experiences of EFL instructors, PDU members, and directors during the emergency remote teaching period
T7	Examining in-service English Language Teachers' professional needs - Towards an online teacher training program
T8	The reflections of Turkish EFL teachers using action research as a professional development activity
T9	Turkish EFL teachers' perceptions towards continuing professional development activities
T10	Professional development of prep school EFL instructors through reflective practice groups
T11	The application of online reflective teaching on EFL teachers' professional development
T12	A reciprocal peer observation experience at the professional development unit of a private university
T13	Promoting continuous professional development for English language instructors within a higher education context
T14	An analysis of a Facebook mentoring group as a professional development tool for EFL teachers
T15	An investigation into the professional development of primary school English language teachers the effects of keeping diaries on teacher reflection and attitudes towards teaching
T16	Exploring burnout and participation in professional learning activities among university prep Turkish EFL instructors
T17	Designing an in-service teacher training program for english language instructors and identifying the effectiveness of the program- An implication at Afyon Kocatepe University
T18	Higher education students' affective barriers in process of English language learning and an inservice training curriculum for elt instructors
T19	The perceptions of English teachers regarding in service training processes and its impact on their in class performance
T20	EFL teachers' perceptions regarding the contribution of CELTA to their professional development
T21	Teachers' perceptions of self-initiated professional development
T22	An evaluation of in-service teacher training programs in English language teaching
T23	An action research regarding the training programme teaching speaking skills for instructors
T24	The use of authentic materials through 'Critical friends group' as part of professional development for EFL instructors
T25	A suggested professional development training program for EFL teacher educator candidates-An action research
T26	Implementation of neuro linguistic programming NLP into personal and professional development programs of English language teachers
T27	Fostering learner autonomy-an in-service teacher development program for english language teachers
T28	Every voice matters- A case study on the factors affecting the professional development and identity (RE)construction of novice English language teachers
T29	An investigation into professional identities of English language teacher trainers and their post-teacher training experiences

Thesis No	Title
T30	Practicing lesson study with efl teachers- A social constructivist perspective for efl teacher professional development
T31	Personal factors affecting experienced English teachers decisions whether or not to engage in professional development activities
T32	In-service english teachers' use of information and communication technology for self-directed professional development
T33	EFL instructors' self-efficacy about sustaining professional development engagement
T34	Design and implementation of an online professional development program concerning teacher behaviours influencing student engagement in EFL courses
T35	An assessment of the PD needs of English language instructors working at a state university
T36	The perceptions of EFL instructors at preparatory schools after Covid-19 pandemic and their emerging inset needs
T37	The relationship between EFL instructors' professional development perceptions and research attitudes
T38	Exploring perspectives of EFL teachers about professional development
T39	Teacher Portfolio Effects and implications for English language teachers' competencies and professional development
T40	Developing EFL teachers' actional competence through language functions-A suggested reflective model for CPD
T41	Teacher development program for young learners of English-An action research
T42	An evaluation of the professional development unit for efl instructors with relation to the clinical supervision principles
T43	A suggested in-service teacher training program for ELT teachers on the use of language learning strategies for the 6th graders
T44	The relationship between EFL-ESL teachers' learning styles and their professional development preferences
T45	Tracking changes and progress in EFL teachers' classroom practices through professional development-
T46	Connecting staff development to teacher improvement-A case study of an in-service teacher education program for English teachers
T47	Lesson study-A professional development model led by prep school English teachers
T48	The analysis of the perceptions of English language instructors at TOBB University of Economics and Technology regarding inset content
T49	Professional development of English teachers in Turkey
T50	EFL teachers' engagement in reflective practice via team teaching for professional development
T51	Impact of the Comenius Assistantship Programme (Erasmus internship practice) on the professional development of English language teachers
T52	Developing an in-service training program on 'assessment for learning' for English language teachers
T53	An analysis of lesson observation through peer-coaching in a continuing professional development program
T54	The needs of K1 - 4 English language teachers for the design of an in - service teacher training program
T55	The impact of in-service teacher education (INSET) programme on professional development of efl teachers through the critical friends group (CFG)
T56	English language teachers' professional development through master of arts
T57	Intercultural competence in the eyes of state school efl teachers in Turkey and a suggested in-service training module
T58	The potential impact of professional development activities on EFL teachers of young learners in Turkey-A case study of three novice teachers' beliefs and classroom practices
T59	A qualitative case study of English language teachers' views towards teacher research as a professional developmental tool
T60	In-service efl teacher's research experiences in an online professional learning community-A qualitative multiple case study

Thesis No	Title
T61	A study of the effects of models of teacher education and professional development in elt on practising and prospective teachers of English at universities
T62	The use of information and communication technologies (ICT) by high school EFL teachers for personal and professional development
T63	Understanding Turkish efl instructors' professional development needs in ict –
T64	A critical ethnographic understanding of lesson study as an EFL teacher Professional development strategy
T65	A new perspective into team teaching as a continuous professional development model for English teachers
T66	Perceptions of professional development at Bilkent University faculty academic English program
T67	English language instructors' attitudes towards professional development and their engagement in self-initiated professional development
T68	Developing a training program towards the professional skills of English preparatory school lecturers in higher education
T69	The use of action research as a model in the professional development of an English Teacher - A case study
T70	The viewpoint of English teachers in private schools on in-service trainings
T71	An evaluation of the professional development needs of English as a foreign language teachers working at different institutions
T72	An action research study on teacher development-A constructivist approach
T73	The impact of teacher portfolios on promoting professional development A case study at Namik Kemal University
T74	The views of Turkish teachers of english as a foreign language on pronunciation teaching and an in-service training suggestion
T75	Webinars for teaching English as a foreign language and for professional development-Teacher perceptions
T76	Factors Influencing Teachers' Professional learning A Study of Turkish EFL Teachers
T77	Possible effects of in-service education on efl teachers' professional development in terms of teacher efficacy and reflective thinking
T78	Investigating the in-service teacher training and professional development needs of instructors in higher education English language schools
T79	An overview of master's study in English language teaching as a viable professional development route-Motivations and perceived impact on professional practice
T80	English language teachers' perceptions about a web-based support system for an in-service teacher training program
T81	A modular in-service teacher development program-A continuous mixed model for the Turkish Air Force (TURAF) EFL teachers
T82	A need analysis for English language teachers and an in-service training proposal for testing speaking skills
T83	An examination of the factors affecting in-service Turkish EFL teachers' learning transfer from online teacher professional development programs into classroom
T84	Designing an in-service teacher training program for English teachers in non-formal education
T85	Listening to English language teachers in Turkey-A survey of their evaluations, preferences and needs regarding in-service training
T86	An investigation into Turkish English language teachers' perceived professional development needs, practices and challenges
T87	A study for the in-service training needs of primary EFL teachers and a suggested model
T88	Investigating EFL teachers' motivation towards web-based professional development in a Turkish context
T89	In - service ELT teachers' first year with reference to mentor teachers and professional development
T90	Professional development pursuits of teacher educators in ELT departments in Türkiye
T91	Professional development and competence profiles of English language teacher educators in Turkey

Thesis No	Title
T92	Evaluation of the in-service training program "The Certificate for Teachers of English" at the Middle East Technical University School of Foreign Languages

